

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

To Whom It May Concern,

I wish to lodge my objections to the beaches link tunnel based on the following points listed out below:

Questions about the Projects Business Case

- It is my understanding that the original document signed by Mike Baird, when he was NSW Premier, clearly stated that in finding a solution to traffic congestion along Military Rd and this corridor that public transport options NOT be considered.

The project needs to stop until a full investigation into public transport options, especially rail, be evaluated and compared to the proposed stretch of road /tunnel and any impropriety between Mike Baird and Transurban be investigated for party political donations and improper influence.

- The project uses public money to make a private Toll road and as such is not for the benefit of the wider community. The tolls will be too expensive for most and this will encourage rat-racing and more traffic on local roads. As shown already in the WestConnex 'rat runs.
- This project actually encourages car travel and further road tolls. Major cities around the world have all shown the negative effects of car congestion in their CBDs yet this project aims to increase car travel into Sydney's CBD. This is irresponsible planning and not in Sydney's long-term interests.
- Because of 'traffic demand' created by the absence of viable public transport options, such a project will only increase car travel. Thus, any short-term reduction in traffic congestion along Military Road and similarly congested roads will soon be reversed.
- The plans for the tunnel are less than 50% complete at this time, therefore the EIS cannot provide a comprehensive impact study, therefore the EIS must be re-done and submitted for further consultation.
- The prime objective of population growth via immigration must now be re-assessed given that we are now living with the ongoing threat of Covid and other pandemics. The governments population objectives are no longer the same and so the underlying assumptions of the EIS are incorrect.
- There has been no assessment of health impacts in terms of climate change that will be accelerated by continuing to rely on a road networks/cars rather than public transport.

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

Pollution

- Particulate Matter is already higher than what is recommended or considered “safe”- PM2.5 and PM10 levels are already above the guidelines for both the 24-hour average and the annual average (including the 2025 goal set by NEPC (2016).

However, there is no local data for this and data from the temporary monitor put in place to establish background levels at Naremburn was not used. Only long term monitoring has occurred in Chullora, Earlwood and Liverpool away from the project footprint. Existing particulate matter from the freeway affects Cammeray and other suburbs.

- Lost opportunity in not filtering/ treating stack pollution – although the EIS suggests PM2.5 levels will not be significantly changed with the construction and operation of unfiltered stacks, we are already living in an environment where levels of PM2.5 and PM10 is above the level of what is considered safe and the EIS demonstrates that this will continue well past the tunnel opening. Would filtering stacks reduce PM 2.5 levels to acceptable levels? Or could a public transport alternative address the growing PM levels. The government has a duty of care to do what it can to reduce these levels now that it has monitored and confirmed the issue.

- The Chief Health Officer is only required to comment on the contribution of the stacks and not the contribution of the project overall to our air quality. Transport for NSW’s conclusion that the air quality across the area on average will not be substantially worse is predicated on the assertion that surface level traffic will reduce. This assertion is contradicted many times in the EIS however via data which demonstrates increased intersection delays, the potential of additional toll avoidance, slower bus times, intersection failures, the admission that rat running will be required to access changed access arrangements to the freeway, an increased proportion of trucks through the area and several other factors.

Both Willoughby Council and North Sydney Council have modelled poorer local traffic conditions resulting from the project and the operational model used did not include many key local corridors in order to verify findings ie) Eastern Valley Way and Military Rd. More work needs to be done to accurately model surface level changes as part of the project and an assessment of the projects contribution to air quality overall should be made on this basis.

If in fact local traffic is made worse by the project this will have the net effect of far poorer air quality, with the additional pollution load delivered to our most vulnerable receivers at schools, parks, homes and hospitals in the area via dispersion from stacks.

- The traffic implication is significantly compounded at the "Golf Club" Site out to at least 2027.
- The EIS demonstrates that the Cammeray Oval, Green park and most of Cammeray will receive higher levels of pollution and extensive noise impacts during construction as a result of this project - again this project exacerbates the

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

noise and pollution problems with overlapping works 2023-2026 and extending the works out to 2027

- Regardless of surface level changes modelling shows that pollution is redistributed as a result of the project. Some key corridors receive less pollution ie) Military Rd but sensitive receivers such as schools and sports fields receive more. Children are particularly susceptible to the health impacts of pollution and so this redistribution is unacceptable.

The Western Harbour and Beaches Link program of works cuts through the largest school corridor in Sydney with 500-1000 pupils at approx. 26 schools. The precautionary principle must be applied to ensure the health of children across the project footprint. Some examples of schools, pre-schools and parks that receive higher pollution levels are as follows (please note these points are indicative of the pollution expected in the nearby area):

Community Receptor Points Modelled that get worse (some examples only)

CR10 Neutral Bay Public School – 24 hr PM_{2.5} increases by 2037 if all projects proceed.

CR16 Anzac Park School – largest increase in 1 hr mean NO₂ if Beaches Link and WF only proceed, Increase in PM₁₀ if all projects go ahead, PM₁₀ 24hr mean goes up by 2037, Annual Mean 2.5 will be increased by 2037 if all projects proceed.

CR17 KU Pre-School Green Park – 24hr mean PM₁₀ goes up by 2037 if all projects proceed, 24hr PM_{2.5} goes up by 2037 if all projects proceed,

CR18 Cammeray Public School – increase in 1 hr NO₂ by 2037 in all projects proceed, Annual Mean 2.5 will be increased by 2037 if all projects proceed.

CR20 Berry Cottage Naremburn – increase in annual average PM₁₀ if all projects proceed.

CR25 Artarmon Sues Childcare: (Closest point to Willoughby Leisure Centre/ Bicentennial Reserve) – Max 24hr PM_{2.5} increases if all projects go ahead. This represents the largest increase of 24hr PM_{2.5} across the project.

CR 26 Northside Baptist Preschool (only point assessed in Northbridge)– slight increase NO₂ 1 hr mean by 2037 if both go ahead, slight increase 24hr mean PM₁₀ by 2037 if all projects go ahead.

Given PM_{2.5} pollution levels are over limits already and WHO states that there is no safe level of PM_{2.5} any increase no matter how small is unacceptable.

- Modelling has been done for buildings at height 300 metres from the stack. This is initial modelling only but unacceptable levels have been detected for buildings

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

at height and the EIS flags that further modelling is required and notes that restrictions to development may be needed.

In the case of Northconnex a report was issued to council on completion outlining restrictions on buildings at certain heights more than 2km away from the stack. This has major implications for development across an area which is currently planning to densify. Full modelling should be completed of each pollutant and various heights at a distance from the stacks and a cost/ benefit analysis completed. This should not be limited to a 300mtr circumference given that the Chief Scientists states that ground level pollution can be at its highest 1km+ from stacks.

- Air quality monitoring around St Peter's following the WestConnex opening are showing regular exceedances of air quality standards and there has been very limited epidemiologic research across the full burden of disease to substantiate placing more motorways - stacks or no stacks in and around children.

In fact, the air quality body of research worldwide points toward the need to reduce vehicle pollution around children and vulnerable adults. It is clear that this project will grow vehicle reliance and traffic volumes overall in already congested and polluted areas.

- The air quality appendix states that the difference between doing nothing in 2037 and building both the Western Harbour and Beaches Tunnels project is an increase in air pollution. The appendix then claims however that in the time since 2016 to 2037 fuel emission standards will have improved to such an extent that pollution levels will decrease. There is no legislation in place and the review of such legislation has been "indefinitely postponed".
<https://www.afr.com/politics/federal/australia-is-turning-into-a-car-park-for-dirty-vehicles-20190709-p525fv>

Contamination

- The main temporary dive site in the area is earmarked for Flat Rock Reserve which is confirmed as being part of the old tip site at the top of Flat Rock Gully.
- Tunks Park is North Sydney Councils responsibility and Willoughby Council has formally notified the EPA and North Sydney Council that there is contaminated ground water that will likely move down from the dig site at the top of the gully.
- Currently there is inadequate information in relation to health impacts (secondary to landfill gas and odours) of proposed tunnelling works at Flat Rock Drive. A Phase 2 assessment is needed to check for contaminants and quantify risk. Approval should not proceed until the risks are known and mitigation possibilities scoped. Testing around the freeway and at Cammeray site has also confirmed contamination. Serious consideration of the cost/benefits of the project in light of the risk to residents and children as well as the cost to mitigate and remediate sites should be given.

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

- The EIS allows for a considerable amount of spoil to be held outside of sheds during construction which poses both a silica dust risk and contamination risk to nearby parks, residents and bushland.
- The Northbridge Peninsular and Northbridge Baths have not been specifically risk assessed in terms of Human Health. Given that Northbridge is placed between the Flat Rock contaminated dive site (where up to 7 road headers will be in operation) and the Middle Harbour contaminated site during construction and between 3 unfiltered emissions stacks when operational it would be appropriate for a specific health assessment to be completed.
- The EIS demonstrates that many parks and schools get more pollution - if kids can't play at Cammeray Park, Bicentennial Reserve or Tunks Park where will they play?
- 4500m³ of spoil is allowed to be stored outside sheds at Cammeray according to the EIS
- A High level of risk has been identified around the Warringah Freeway of serious contaminants entering the area and also at the Cammeray Mega Construction site. The testing results have not been published and the risk is radically under-assessed given the sensitive users of the area (both the young and the not so young)
- The 'beaches tunnel' has been declared 'world's best practice', however, this is untrue, as 'world's best practice' would include filtration of the tunnel ventilation/emission stacks. In the EIS, these will NOT be filtered, therefore this plan for beaches tunnel is NOT world's best practice.
- The proposed coffer dam to go in water off northbridge is unacceptable, as is the dredging in that area to make way for the semi-submerged tunnel.

The dredging will alter silt tidal patterns and damage the seagrasses and delicate marine ecosystems located in these waters. The waters have only recently returned to a high state of cleanliness as evidenced by recent sightings of seals and even a whale a few years back.

Dredging these waters will disturb decades old layers of harbour sludge containing toxic sediments. The toxic fallout from digging in these waterways will result in closing down valuable public amenities such as northbridge baths, and northbridge sailing club. any risk of contamination to these waterways is unacceptable and thus the tunnel must not proceed through this route.

Noise

- Flat Rock – highest noise is day-time clearing, excavation, establishing buildings and widening of Alpha Rd and night-time Alpha Rd. estimated 9

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

months. Ground vibration at a human response level is recognised from Flat Rock Dive Site (P173) affecting 2 houses in Calbina South West. Site will be operational for 5 years.

- A key concern at Flat Rock Drive is the noise generated from truck air brakes as they slow down the long hill leading to the excavation site entry point at the bottom, and then the exhaust and engine noise from those fully loaded trucks accelerating up the hill from the site. This noise could be suitably attenuated by constructing a permanent acoustic wall along Flat Rock Drive fronting the bush - i.e., an acoustic wall similar to those normally constructed during road infrastructure projects. Noise will also impact wildlife in the area esp. nocturnal species such as bats.
- Cammeray- residents in the area closest to the Freeway and Flat Rock Drive do not have any noise barriers that will stop the noise from going across the area from Flat Rock Drive to West Street. After 5 years of discussions with RMS the proposed noise wall along Massey to Amherst street will not stop the construction noise or estimated 24/7 truck noise along the freeway or flat rock drive. The assertion that the difference in noise will be less than 2dB is unlikely. Residents have asked for updated noise readings to be done as the last ones were completed in 2010.
- Middle Harbour – highest noise during construction of the 2 cofferdams and then when tunnel tubes are immersed and when pilings are driven. The tunnel tubes will need to be placed in a continuous process taking 24-48 hours each. Estimated high impact time is 18 months. Middle Harbour works will continue for 4.5 years with 88 vessel movements per day at peak times generating an ongoing increased level of noise.
- Northbridge - noise from tunnelling Rock Hammering (following road headers) will be at a detectable level for several homes at either end of Northbridge (29 West, 92 East) however this will be less than 45dB so not expected to be intrusive. Vibration levels above screening levels will also be experienced by 295 homeowners around Middle Harbour (Seaforth, Castlecrag and Northbridge) in relation to the crossing works. Noise will be heard around the Flat Rock site esp. during site establishment works. One house in Calbina West (P93) is > 75 dB(A) so actual monitoring is required.
- Naremburn - 15 buildings will be impacted by road header operations and 227 by rock hammering as the tunnels pass below. 11 buildings will reach vibration levels above screening levels. Residents will also be affected by different stages of the project and coinciding works including the Warringah Freeway Works, Punch St and Flat Rock site establishment and briefer stints of night time noise.
- Cammeray - the EIS states that the area North of the golf course in Cammeray will experience noise above limits across the duration of the

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

project. Anzac Park School, Anzac Park, Cammeray Oval and KU Preschool (Green Park) will be noise affected above limits across various stages of the project. Noise from the Warringah Freeway works will impact 1917 receiver buildings between Cammeray and Naremburn during the project.

- Sporting Grounds - the EIS states that Bicentennial Reserve, the Baseball Diamond, Cammeray Oval and Shore Oval will experience noise impacts across the duration of the project (5 years)

Green Space & Active Transport Links

- Loss of greenspace at Cammeray Golf Club to make way for permanent utility sheds for the Beaches Link.
- Green spaces have been extremely important during Covid and the area has a very low percentage available and a growing population - any impacts on green spaces in the area are likely to be significant.
- Active transport links will be significantly impacted at Artarmon, Naremburn and Cammeray during construction and the EIS does not make clear what will be done to support the local communities trying to live their daily lives.
- The government has recently declared an 'open space' initiative/policy in which it seeks to protect precious open green spaces. This project is not in alignment with this policy as this project will result in bulldozing at flat rock gully to make way for dig site and truck turning circle, plus destruction of various golf courses e.g., Cammeray and Balgowlah.

Safety

- The sheer volume of additional vehicle movements which will be on the road around a dense area of schools and children's sport presents a significant safety risk. Close to 5,000 additional vehicle movements will be required across the route during construction. Heavy vehicles should not be permitted to marshal or transport loads on residential roads or within school zones.
- 900 additional vehicle movements will be required on Flat Rock Drive - this is a key transport corridor for children accessing North Shore schools and school sport. Given the site is contaminated the conflict between spoil trucks and children is even more concerning for the community. Flat Rock Drive/ Brook St is also a key active transport corridor for children accessing Cammeray Schools due to zoning.

Community fragmentation

- The local area has already been fragmented by the Warringah Freeway and Gore Hill Expressways. Communities have worked hard to regain a sense of place however these projects again create barriers both during construction and after. Local

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

communities should be considered in the planning process and the best outcomes for both commuters and local communities found. A mass transit alternative should be considered.

Stress

- The Health risk assessment acknowledges construction fatigue, increased traffic and uncertainty as significant stress factors for the population. There are a large number of plans yet to be finalised, testing to be completed and known geological challenges across this project. The uncertainty created is and will create stress within the community. Given this is a highly populated residential and school zone all effort should be made to reduce uncertainty and the EIS should be re-issued with more information.
- Substratum acquisition (uncompensated) is likely to cause financial stress particularly given economic uncertainty following Covid. Both the WestConnex Inquiry and recent reports demonstrate issues with the process as well as pressure on housing prices and the ability to sell homes during the period of construction and sometimes beyond. Given the economic situation post Covid the stress associated with uncertainty and acquisition is likely to be heightened.
- Schools (majority in the North Sydney Council Area) submitted an extension request because they are so overwhelmed with the complexity and extent of impact - North Sydney Council should be assisting these schools by using their in-house expertise.
- The EIS canvasses many intersection failures and changed levels of service.
- School children travelling to and from North Sydney Schools will be adversely impacted - 900 + additional vehicle movements on Flat Rock Drive will push traffic back to Willoughby Roads and Miller Street etc This is the key bus route for schools also. Active transport links will be broken from Artarmon to Naremburn to Cammeray during the project.

There is Misleading Data and Information about the Project

- The EIS is not current and much of it was written before Covid. Therefore, the facts and data it contains are up to date with the current situation e.g., with respect to travel time data.

Post Covid - there is much less dependency on peak hour travel. many more people are working from home and will continue to do so as workplaces have become more flexible. Thus, a new, up to date post-Covid EIS needs to be written and re submitted for community consultation.

- The name 'beaches link' is a misnomer as the tunnel goes to Balgowlah. not to the beach. thus, this is false marketing and false representation of a state significant project and as such should be addressed with a name more representative of what it actually is.

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

Some concerns that I would like to see addressed as a part of the project are:

- A business case which justifies travel times claimed, re-assesses surface traffic impact and includes fully scoped costs
- A full Phase 2 Contamination Assessment completed.
- A comparative mass transit alternative assessment.
- Local background data about current Particulate Matter levels to truly assess impact- an alert style monitor near children's playing fields that sporting groups and parents can subscribe to determine if playing sport is a safe option given the potential for contaminated dust and heavy vehicle emissions to be high around Artarmon Park, Bicentennial Reserve and Cammeray Oval.
- Modelling of levels of particulate matter/other air pollutants in the environment if the stacks were filtered.
- Landfill gas investigations should be carried out within these areas to assess the potential presence or absence of gas which could potentially impact upon construction and/or operation of the project if not managed appropriately.
- For tunnelling works proposed at Flat Rock Reserve, there is a risk of encountering odorous waste material and landfill gases from historical landfill in the locality. Detailed investigations need to be carried out to confirm the presence and extent of potentially odorous materials and landfill gases within the project site at this location.
- If a short duration noise event during night construction, persons should be offered alternative accommodation for the period or other appropriate mitigation as required. For longer duration noise such as FRG and Cammeray Oval construct an acoustic wall around the site to protect residents and fauna from noise impacts - i.e., an acoustic wall similar to those normally constructed during road infrastructure projects.

This wall would have to be high enough to ensure bird species such as the Powerful Owl do not fly into the trucks attending the site at Flat Rock. An acoustic wall at Anzac Park and one at Cammeray Oval would help to ensure that children have reduced level of noise impact.
- A noise wall be built on the Freeway and on Flat Rock Drive to protect the residents from the continuous truck noise 24/7 to a height that will stop the majority of the noise.
- Reassess baseline noise level. For instance, on Flat Rock Drive was the initial monitoring done when a double truck had their airbrakes on going down the hill? Given the geography of the area and 900 movements a day on a steep hill in a residential area it seems unlikely that noise will be undetectable as stated in documents.

Submission to Gore Hill Freeway and Beaches Link Project

- Average noise readings pre-construction should be monitored over a 24 period and averaged to be a more indicative measure of current noise levels
- Greenspace - ensure all landfill exposed by tunnelling is capped at the end of tunnelling and reinstate crushed sandstone as a contoured base for re-establishment of locally indigenous vegetation and habitat. Remove all temporary structures (including noise mitigation sheds).

Decision making about the future of the dive site at FRG should not be left to the end of the consultation process and should involve the community. The EIS should confirm its rehabilitation and return to bushland

- The utility shed at Cammeray Golf Club to be placed underground so that there is no loss of greenspace. Real time noise and air quality monitoring should be put in place to assure the community regarding the safety of using sports fields esp. for children's sporting activities
- Active transport links between Artarmon, Naremburn, Cammeray and the City should be made seamless and improved as a result of this project to compensate in part for community construction fatigue.

The current active transport links are fragmented at best and construction will make this worse with no clear plan to improve it. School P&C's should be involved in this planning to ensure the best routes for children accessing local schools.

- The Brook St/Flat Rock Drive Corridor is a key corridor for children accessing local schools. An active transport overpass or underpass should be put in place to ensure safe passage.
- Trucks should be fitted with noise and pollution control devices given the highly residential nature of the route and the large proportion of children.