

## **St Aloysius College Redevelopment**

Submission: Wayne Rees

Dated: 8 August 2019

I have been a resident of Kirribilli for the past 20 years during the course of which I have observed an ever-increasing impact arising from the two large schools domiciled in this small community. I recognise that St Aloysius and Loreto have existed in the area for over 100 years. However, in my opinion, the scale and social impact have considerably changed for the worse during my residency in the area.

During this period, the Schools have been constantly renovated and expanded. For example, St Aloysius substantially redeveloped the Senior School in 1995 which involved major ground and building works. In 2010, Loreto acquired and redeveloped the adjacent Tremayne Private Hotel. Loreto is also currently seeking approval from the IPC for a 50-year Master Plan for works amounting to circa \$100M. It seems redevelopment and expansion of these schools are never ending and we are now confronted with a 10-year Master Plan for St Aloysius encompassing works costing around \$140M.

In my view it seems the schools have in the main been looked at in isolation. However, it is worthwhile putting the schools in context relative to the scale of the local Community.

In this regard I would like to submit the following important facts: -

- Kirribilli Population 3824 as per *2016 Census*
- Kirribilli encompasses an area of 0.44 square kilometres
- Kirribilli derived population density per square Kilometres = 8691
- Kirribilli population density ranking across Greater Sydney = 8 as per *Microburbs Website*
- St Aloysius and Loreto combined Student / Staff population was 2770 in 2018. *Source: ACARA My School Website*. This is akin to adding an incremental population of 6295 per square Kilometre
- The combined school population is the equivalent to a 72% increase in resident population. I suspect there are very few suburban areas in Australia that see such a population swelling related to schools.
- The combined Residents / School Population density would equate to circa 15,000 ranking Kirribilli second behind Elizabeth Bay.

- Of further interest is the fact that there are 168 School Aged Children resident in Kirribilli (111 Primary Schoolers and 57 Secondary Schoolers) as per *2016 Census*
- Assuming all children resident in Kirribilli attend either Loreto or St Aloysius, they represent a mere 7% of the 2350 combined student population. This means that 93% of the combined school population or 2182 students commute from outside the area. Again, it would be surprising if there are many similar instances of this occurring.
- To further evidence density levels, Kirribilli dwellings are dominated by Flats and Apartments. This is evidenced by the fact that: -

Kirribilli Dwelling Composition Source: ABS Home>Census> Quickstats				
(Rounded to nearest decimal)	Kirribilli	Greater Sydney	NSW	Australia
Houses	4.7%	56.9%	66.4%	72.9%
Semi Detached / Terrace	7.9%	14.0%	12.2%	12.7%
Flat / Apartment	86.6%	28.1%	19.9%	13.1%
Other	0.2%	0.6%	0.9%	0.8%

St Aloysius has been keen to point out that the current development will not increase school numbers. This may or may not be the case, however, only time will tell. An analysis of St Aloysius and Loretto Student / Teacher numbers over the past 10 years indicate a steady increase in population. This slow ramp up in numbers is akin to 'boiling a frog' - you do not feel the heat until it is too late! This is demonstrated by the following School Population analysis over the past 10 years: -

Kirribilli School Population Stats - Source: ACARA				
---	--	--	--	--

My School Website				
	2009	2018	Difference	%Change
<b>St Aloysius College</b>				
Students	1191	1251	60	4.80%
Teaching Staff	103	127	24	18.90%
Non-Teaching Staff	50	109	59	54.13%
<b>Total Population St Aloysius</b>	1344	1487	143	9.62%
<b>Loretto</b>				
Students	1046	1099	53	4.82%
Teaching Staff	98	113	15	13.27%
Non-Teaching Staff	53	71	18	25.35%
<b>Total Population Loretto</b>	1197	1283	86	6.70%
<b>Grand Total School Population</b>	2541	2770	229	8.27%

I suspect part of the rationale for the current development is to relieve crowding caused by historic increases in Student / Staff numbers.

### Other Matters

There are a number of other aspects of the St Aloysius Redevelopment that I either object to or find disconcerting, namely: -

- The School/s add little or no value to the local community. I believe they do not pay tax nor rates but it quite happily consumes the local facilities ie Roading, Transport, Parking, Footpaths and Parks etc. In this latter respect, the St

Aloysuis unofficially utilises Bradfield Park as a quasi-school ground. Moreover, I understand the School does not provide any S94 payments. Loreto is on record as saying 'We do have an excellent reputation with the local community and we have – we know that our school supports the local community, as well, in a number of ways. Not just by accessing their local community shops, etcetera, but by being a school in the local area and being part of the community. It's a really important aspect to our school and we've been doing that for over 110 years now. I" Source: IPC Planning Meeting 11/9/2018. I am sorry but I am at a loss to see, apart from support to local shops, any described specific benefits to the community particularly given 93% of the students reside outside the local community.

Moreover, whilst these Schools are Non-Profit entities, make no mistake, these are highly profitable and wealthy business operations. School Fees for St Aloysuis range between \$16k to \$20k per annum. Loreto's Fees range from \$15k to \$22k. Adopting say an average School Fee of \$18,000, the respective revenue School Fee Revenue would amount to: -

- St Aloysuis \$22.5M
- Loreto \$19.8M

The current Master plans for both Schools indicate a capital spend per student of:

- St Aloysuis \$111910
- Loreto \$90,992
- At a recent Milson Point Resident Precinct meeting there was strong views expressed that the school has treated the residents almost with contempt and community engagement has been poor and almost nonexistent.
- The Master Plan makes reference to the school hosting after hours entertainment / activities which is going to further exacerbate traffic and parking congestion particularly given that almost all Students / Parents are non-residents
- The proposed Heavy Vehicle Route indicates Trucks will enter Kirribilli via Fitzroy, and circle through Carabella, Parkes, Upper Pitt and exit via Fitzroy. These streets are very narrow and the disruption to residents as well as the associated risks, make this a very undesirable aspect of the Plan. The stated volume of Truck movements ranges from 15 - 50 a day which is quite significant given the already congested and narrow Streets.
- EIS 014 informs that there will be no parking available for Tradesmen and Contractors but rationalises this by stating "*The availability of public transport and lack of on-site parking will encourage the use of public transport and minimise traffic and parking impacts as a consequence*". I find this rather naive and self-serving. I venture to suggest that Tradesmen and Contractors will need to bring tools and supplies which would generally not be conducive to a public train / bus / ferry network
- The SSD Application states the project will give rise to 329 Operational jobs. Again, a significant impost on the local community by way of traffic, parking and associated debris and impact on the ascetics of the area.

- The St Aloysius Redevelopment which I understand will cost circa \$140M in essence coincides with the Loreto Redevelopment costing circa \$100M. Each one is significant for a community our size but combined, it will have a severe and demoralising impact on the local residents.
- I understand the Master Plan spans 10 years. This is a long time period for a community to have to suffer the effects of ongoing development works.

Given, the foregoing, I strongly believe that steps must be taken to: -

1. Cap School numbers so that we do not experience the continual Student / Teacher population creep as we have done in the past. Currently, there is nothing to stop the school increasing numbers post the development and in 10 years the community having to suffer further rounds of major Redevelopment.
2. The School has made no provision for additional car parking. The School alleges it is in compliance with The North Sydney Development Control Plan 2013 which requires 1 parking space per 6 staff for educational establishments. That may or may not be the case, but if a commercial enterprise were to establish operation's they would undoubtedly be required to provide a significantly greater number of parking spaces. This is particularly relevant given the density issues mentioned above. Accordingly, I believe that the School, as a minimum, should be required to amend the plans to provide for a significantly increased level of car parking. Of particular note is the fact that Loreto has a Staff to Car Park ratio of 1.84:1 whereas St Aloysuis ratio is 6.74, Why should St Aloysuis be allowed to provide this totally inadequate level of Staff Car Parking. These ratios ignore the increasing level of Student Car Parking which seems to be becoming more prevalent.
3. Finally, there are a number of other aspects of the St Aloysuis Redevelopment Proposal that I find disconcerting, the majority of which are embodied in North Sydney Council letter to the Department of Planning and Environment dated 13 June 2018.

Finally, thank you for the opportunity to attend this Meeting and present my concerns.

Attachments:

Appendix 1 - Kirribilli School Population Statistics Analysis

Appendix 2 - Kirribilli Dwelling Composition Analysis

Appendix 3 - Kirribilli Statistics Analysis

Appendix 4 - St Aloysuis and Loreto Staff / Car Park Ratio Analysis

Appendix 5 - St Aloysuis and Loreto Development Cost Analysis

## Appendix 1

### St Aloysius College Redevelopment

*Kirribilli School Population Stats - Source: ACARA My School Website*

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
<b>St Aloysius College</b>										
Students	1191	1193	1217	1236	1245	1244	1244	1246	1242	1251
Teaching Staff	103	105	109	112	114	113	112	113	119	127
Non-Teaching Staff	50	53	53	52	62	61	54	59	95	109
<b>Total Population St Aloysius</b>	<b>1344</b>	<b>1351</b>	<b>1379</b>	<b>1400</b>	<b>1421</b>	<b>1418</b>	<b>1410</b>	<b>1418</b>	<b>1456</b>	<b>1487</b>
<b>Cumulative Change</b>		<b>7</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>77</b>	<b>74</b>	<b>66</b>	<b>74</b>	<b>112</b>	<b>143</b>
<b>Cumulative %Change</b>		<b>0.52%</b>	<b>2.59%</b>	<b>4.06%</b>	<b>5.50%</b>	<b>5.21%</b>	<b>4.65%</b>	<b>5.25%</b>	<b>7.90%</b>	<b>9.82%</b>
<b>Loretto</b>										
Students	1046	1044	1046	1045	1040	1054	1077	1079	1096	1099
Teaching Staff	98	97	99	99	102	104	104	109	113	113
Non Teaching Staff	53	53	55	55	56	59	65	70	67	71
<b>Total Population Loretto</b>	<b>1197</b>	<b>1194</b>	<b>1200</b>	<b>1199</b>	<b>1198</b>	<b>1217</b>	<b>1246</b>	<b>1258</b>	<b>1276</b>	<b>1283</b>
<b>Cumulative Change</b>		<b>-3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>79</b>	<b>86</b>
<b>Cumulative %Change</b>		<b>-0.25%</b>	<b>0.25%</b>	<b>0.17%</b>	<b>0.08%</b>	<b>1.68%</b>	<b>4.10%</b>	<b>5.11%</b>	<b>6.62%</b>	<b>7.20%</b>
<b>Grand Total School Population</b>	<b>2541</b>	<b>2545</b>	<b>2579</b>	<b>2599</b>	<b>2619</b>	<b>2635</b>	<b>2656</b>	<b>2676</b>	<b>2732</b>	<b>2770</b>
<b>Cumulative Change</b>		<b>4</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>58</b>	<b>78</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>115</b>	<b>135</b>	<b>191</b>	<b>229</b>
<b>Cumulative %Change</b>		<b>0.16%</b>	<b>1.49%</b>	<b>2.25%</b>	<b>3.00%</b>	<b>3.59%</b>	<b>4.36%</b>	<b>5.08%</b>	<b>7.14%</b>	<b>8.38%</b>

## Appendix 2

### St Aloysius College Redevelopment

*Kirribilli Dwelling Composition Source: ABS Home>Census>Quickstats*

(Rounded to nearest decimal)	<b>Kirribilli</b>	<b>Greater Sydney</b>	<b>NSW</b>	<b>Australia</b>
Houses	4.7%	56.9%	66.4%	72.9%
Semi Detached / Terrace	7.9%	14.0%	12.2%	12.7%
Flat / Apartment	86.6%	28.1%	19.9%	13.1%
Other	0.2%	0.6%	0.9%	0.8%



## Appendix 3

### St Aloysius College Redevelopment

#### ***Kirribilli Stats***

#### Source

Primary Schoolers	111	Profile.id.com.au using ABS Census of Population & Housing data
Secondary Schoolers	57	Profile.id.com.au using ABS Census of Population & Housing data
Total School Aged Population	168	Profile.id.com.au using ABS Census of Population & Housing data
Dwellings - Houses	106	Profile.id.com.au using ABS Census of Population & Housing data
Dwellings - Medium Density ie Semi Detached	377	Profile.id.com.au using ABS Census of Population & Housing data
Dwellings - High Density ie Apartments	1994	Profile.id.com.au using ABS Census of Population & Housing data
People who travelled to work by public transport	1,014	ABS 2016 Census
People who travelled to work by car	591	ABS 2016 Census
Number Registered Vehicles	1320	ABS 2016 Census

#### ***School Stats***

St Aloysius Student Population	1251	ACARA My School Website
Loretto Student Population	1099	ACARA My School Website
Grand Total Student Population	2350	
St Aloysius Total School Population	1487	ACARA My School Website
Loretto Total School Population	1283	ACARA My School Website
Grand Total School Population	2770	

#### ***Analysis***

Students Out of Area (B15-B6)	2239	Assumes all Children of School age in Kirribilli attend these schools.
%Students Out of Area (B23/B15)	95.28%	

## Appendix 4

### St Aloysius College Redevelopment

*^Source: Kirribilli School Population Stats - Source: ACARA My School Website*

*# Source: IPC SSD 8669 Submission*

*## Source: IPC SSD 7919 Meeting with North Sydney Council - Transcript 30/8/18*

*(Note: This analysis excludes the demand for Car Parks by Students)*

#### St Aloysius College

Teaching Staff^	127
Non Teaching Staff^	109
<b>Total Population</b>	<b>236</b>
<b>Car Parks #</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Ratio of Staff/ Car Parks</b>	<b>6.74</b>

#### Loretto

Teaching Staff^	113
Non-Teaching Staff^	71
<b>Total Population</b>	<b>184</b>
<b>Car Parks ##</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>Ratio of Staff/ Car Parks</b>	<b>1.84</b>

<b>Grand Total Staff Population</b>	<b>420</b>
<b>Grand Total Car Parks</b>	<b>135</b>
<b>Ratio of Staff/ Car Parks</b>	<b>3.11</b>

## Appendix 5

### St Aloysius and Loretto Redevelopment

#### Development Costs per Student

\*Source: *Kirribilli School Population Stats - Source: ACARA My School Website*

	\$Development Cost	# Students 2018*		Average School Fee	Annual School Fee Revenue	
<b>St Aloysuis</b>	\$140,000,000	1251	\$111,910	18000	\$	22,518,000.00
<b>Loreto</b>	\$100,000,000	1099	\$90,992	\$18,000	\$	19,782,000.00