

16 August 2018

Mr Peter Brogan
Bloompark Consulting Pty Ltd
Suite 2.02, No 41 McLaren Street
North Sydney NSW 2060

Dear Peter,

**RE: St Aloysius College – Wyalla
Response to Consent Authority Comments**

This letter has been prepared in response to comments, included below, received from the North Shore Historical Society.

Unsympathetic additions have already been made to the south side of the building. To this point in time, the eastern side of this historic building has remained intact. The removal of wall masonry, and particularly, the removal of the eight double hung timber windows on the ground floor, would destroy the historical integrity of the eastern side of the structure and would diminish the heritage value of the entire building. Any such substantial alterations would be irreversible. The relationship of these ground floor windows to the matching eight windows on the first floor is an integral part of the heritage building.

Advice

NBRSARCHITECTURE provide preliminary advice to pmhl on 16 October 2017 including the following comments in relation to 1-5 Jeffreys Street:

The proposed development to the building located at 1-5 Jeffreys Street will materially affect heritage-listed Wyalla. The minor addition would be located on the eastern elevation, and would not affect principal views to the building, and would not affect the Jeffreys Street Conservation Area or heritage items located nearby.

The major heritage concerns relate to:

- *The removal of sections of ground floor exterior walls (original fabric) to create contiguous 'open' learning spaces at ground floor (Level 1)*
- *Removal of large sections of internal masonry walls to provide permeability between learning spaces and corridors, resulting in irreversible changes to the internal layout of the building.*

NBRSARCHITECTURE will provide feedback to mitigate any possible adverse heritage impacts.

NBRSARCHITECTURE subsequently reviewed developing documentation, during which time changes to the eastern elevation were discussed and strategies were suggested to mitigate the heritage impacts of the removal of ground floor windows and changes to the eastern external wall.

Regarding comments from the North Shore Historical Society, we acknowledge the proposed works include the removal of windows from the eastern elevation would have an adverse impact on original building fabric. In my earliest site visit the issue of the extent of the demolition to the eastern side of the building was discussed. At that time, we advised there was risk involved in removing the wall (and

NBRS&PARTNERS PTY LTD

Level 3, 4 Glen Street,
Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia
nbsrarchitecture.com

ABN 16 002 247 565

Sydney: +61 2 9922 2344
Melbourne: +61 3 8676 0427
architects@nbsrarchitecture.com

DIRECTORS

Andrew Duffin NSW reg. 5602 (Nominated Architect), James Ward MDIA,
Garry Hoddinett NSW reg. 5286, Rodney Drayton NSW reg. 8632,
Andrew Leuchars LA reg. 035, Geoffrey Deane NSW reg. 3766

STUDIO PRINCIPALS

Anthea Doyle, Trevor Eveleigh, Sophie Orrock, Samantha Polkinghorne, Brett Sherson, Andrew Tripet, Jonathan West. **SENIOR ASSOCIATE** Barry Flack
ASSOCIATES Hung-Ying Foong Gill, David Heap, Derek Mah, Craig Stephen

associated openings) however the requirement for the additional space resulted in moving forward with the proposal and identifying any mitigating measures that could be made.

Mitigation measures and appropriate approach identified include:

1. The rear of the building is not generally visible from the public domain, and as such does not alter the understanding of the early building and particularly the primary elevation and its open corner setting;
2. The opening would be limited to the outer edges of the outermost windows and be limited to the same height as the existing lintel; and
3. The new structure would read as clearly contemporary allowing the overall form of the building and the upper windows to the eastern elevation to be retained.

NBR SARCHITECTURE provided further heritage advice in relation to minimising openings in internal walls, specifically to limit internal works, and where possible, to the removal of non-significant internal stud walls. This strategy was generally adopted to reduce physical impacts on internal fabric of Wyalla, and to retain the volume of significant spaces.

Statement of Heritage Impact - Recommendations

The following recommendations were included in the *Statement of Heritage Impact St Aloysius' College Masterplan and Stage 1 Works* dated 9 February 2018.

The following recommendations are made in relation to the proposed St Aloysius' College Masterplan and Stage 1 Works:

- a) *Wyalla and all surviving nineteenth century fabric is to be protected from damage during construction works.*
- b) *Ongoing advice from a heritage architect should be sought during design development and construction development phases of the works to assist in developing strategies to mitigate heritage impacts.*
- c) *Fabric and spaces affected by the proposed works should be photographically recorded prior to the works being carried out.*
- d) *Internal drywall infill panels are to be removed in preference to the removal of masonry.*
- e) *Openings in walls are to maintain masonry nibs and masonry above new openings.*
- f) *Window frames, glass, sashes, architraves, and door leafs, are to be salvaged where possible for re-use off site. Where appropriate, original hardware is to be retained, and used for repairs to Wyalla windows.*
- g) *The history and development of the site should be communicated to students, staff and visitors to enhance their understanding of the significance of Wyalla and St Aloysius' College.*

Ongoing Heritage Commission

NBRSARCHITECTURE has been commissioned by St Aloysius College to provide ongoing heritage advice during the design development process, at Masterplan stage through design development and consent phases of the process.

If you require any clarification or further information regarding this response, please don't hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Yours faithfully,
NBRSARCHITECTURE.

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading 'S. Polkinghorne'.

Samantha Polkinghorne
Studio Principal - Heritage