

13 November 2012

Jonathan Darwen
Project Manager
Sweett Australia) Pty Ltd
Level 9, 8-10 Loftus Street
SYDNEY NSW 2000

Dear Jonathan,

Griffith House, St George Hospital: Review of Urbis HIS.

I was requested to review the original Heritage Impact Statement for Griffith House at St George Hospital after a number of submissions were made to the proposal, including the Heritage Council of NSW and NBRS & Partners on behalf of the Kogarah Community Group, and a separate Peer Review by Weir and Phillips, Architects and Heritage Consultants, was commissioned by Health Infrastructure.

The Revised HIS was dated November 2012. This HIS considered the responses made by the subject authorities and professionals and included alterations and additions based on those comments as detailed below.

Heritage Council of NSW

- The HC acknowledges the assessment of the property as being of local significance and therefore that there are no matters for assessment under the Heritage Act 1977.
- The standard statement relating to demolition of a building are now answered in Section 5.3 of the revised HIS.
- Social significance has been elaborated upon in the revised HIS.
- There is no requirement to prepare a grading of significance in a HIS for a local heritage item. This is usually undertaken in a Conservation Management Plan which is normally prepared for State listed items.
- The building is not included in the Section 170 Register for Health Infrastructure and this is now described in the revised HIS.
- The consideration of demolition is now included in the revised HIS.
- The application has been referred to an independent heritage consultant for Peer Review and comments from this review have been incorporated in the revised HIS.

NBRS report for Kogarah Community Group

- The HIS always included a comprehensive history and statement of significance. The confirmation of Griffith House as meeting the criteria for a local heritage item has never been in dispute.
- The revised HIS has acknowledged the local social significance of the building.
- The structural issues referred to in the report were based on those prepared by Cardno in October 2011 and these are not considered to be in dispute.
- The adaptation of Griffith house was given consideration by Health Infrastructure and the issues relating to the footprint and ability to maintain Griffith House are dealt with in the Revised HIS under Section 5.3 "Heritage office Guidelines: Demolition of a Building or Structure". The footprint in the report by NBRS clearly shows the proposed Emergency Department encompassing the site of the House.

- The HIS always dealt with the site being adjacent to a listed heritage item and an assessment has been made of this association.

Peer Review: Weir Phillips Heritage

- The review considered that the HIS would be assisted by a more detailed history. It is considered that the history is very detailed and this was not an issue with the other consultant's report or the response by the Heritage Council of NSW. The history informed the Statement of Significance for the building, accepted by all parties.
- The status of the Section 170 Register is now included in the revised HIS. Griffith House is not on a Section 170 Register.
- The Revised HIS provides further detail on the options that have been explored under Section 5.3.
- The 'compelling case' of the location of the Emergency Department is a matter for Health Infrastructure. A heritage impact statement is not the location for a full analysis however this is summarised in the Revised HIS and the implications are clear.
- The revised HIS quite clearly acknowledges that the operational requirements of the hospital take precedence over heritage considerations where heritage considerations cannot be reasonably included as part of an operationally viable plan for the hospital.

Yours sincerely,



Stephen Davies
Director