

MODIFICATION REQUEST: Sydney Adventist Hospital Alterations and Additions 185 Fox Valley Road, Wahroonga Project Approval (MP10_0070 MOD 5)

- Extension of temporary car park use.

Director-General's Environmental Assessment Report Section 75W of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979

September 2013

() (\cdot)

© Crown copyright 2013 Published September 2013 NSW Department of Planning & Infrastructure www.planning.nsw.gov.au

Disclaimer:

While every reasonable effort has been made to ensure that this document is correct at the time of publication, the State of New South Wales, its agents and employees, disclaim any and all liability to any person in respect of anything or the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done in reliance upon the whole or any part of this document.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report is an assessment of a modification request (MP10_0070 MOD 5) lodged by MarcoPlan Dimasi, on behalf of Sydney Adventist Hospital (SAH) (the proponent), seeking approval for the retention of the temporary car park approved under MP10_0070, pursuant to section 75W of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.*

The temporary car park, located in the north eastern corner of the SAH campus, was originally approved under project application MP10_0070 with a capacity for 258 vehicles. The capacity was subsequently increased to 413 spaces under the first modification and was to be utilised for construction, patient and staff vehicles during construction activities.

MP10_0070 MOD 1 also conditionally restricted the use of the temporary car park until the occupation certificate for the approved multi-deck car parking structure was completed, noting that sufficient car parking capacity would be provided on site.

The modification application seeks approval for the retention of the temporary car park for use by construction workers until the completion of the last development under the approved project application, unless a subsequent approval is issued for its continued use for construction traffic management on the Wahroonga Estate.

The modification application was referred to Ku-ring-gai Council (council) and the Roads and Maritime Services (RMS) for comment. The department received submissions from both council and the RMS. No objections were raised, though council provided comments on the proposed amendments to the instrument of approval.

The department has assessed the merits of the modification application and considers the key issues to be those relating to the continued use of the temporary car park and impacts on local traffic.

These matters have been addressed in detail and the department is satisfied they can be appropriately mitigated and/or managed. The department is satisfied that the retention of the temporary car park will assist in alleviating traffic impacts associated with construction activities and provides a suitable construction traffic management option. The department considers the modification application to be in the public's interest and recommends it be approved, subject to recommended conditions.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	BACKGROUND	1	
2.	PROPOSED MODIFICATION	4	
	2.1 Modification Description		4
3.	STATUTORY CONTEXT	5	
	3.1 Modification of the Minister's Approval		5
	3.2 Environmental Assessment Requirements		5
	3.3 Delegated Authority		5
4.	CONSULTATION AND SUBMISSIONS	5	
	4.1 Exhibition and Submissions		5
5.	ASSESSMENT	6	
	5.1 Temporary Car Park		6
	5.2 Traffic		7
6.	CONCLUSION	8	
7.	RECOMMENDATIONS	9	
APPE	ENDIX A MODIFICATION REQUEST	<mark>10</mark>	
APPE	ENDIX B SUBMISSIONS	12	
APPENDIX C RECOMMENDED MODIFYING INSTRUMENT		13	

• $\left(\begin{array}{c} \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \end{array} \right)$ $(\overline{\cdot})$

1. BACKGROUND

1.1 Concept Plan

On 31 March 2010, the former Minister for Planning approved a concept plan for the Wahroonga Estate Redevelopment (MP07_0166) subject to modifications. The concept plan established five development precincts, with each containing separate GFA controls and restrictions on the type, and maximum number of dwellings. The concept plan granted approval for the following key elements:

- general layout of land uses;
- maximum gross floor areas for land uses;
- maximum number of dwellings and other accommodation types;
- building heights;
- asset protection zones;
- road design and traffic management works; and
- landscape, open space and public domain treatments.

The concept plan also provides for the protection and management of conservation areas and protection of heritage items. The approved concept plan layout is shown in **Figure 1**.

Figure 1: Approved Concept Plan Layout



The concept plan has been modified on three other occasions, details of which are provided at Appendix A. These concept plan modifications are unrelated to the current modification to the project application.



1.2 Project Application

On 3 March 2011, the Planning Assessment Commission (PAC), as delegate for the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure, approved a project application (MP10_0070) for staged alterations and additions to the Sydney Adventist Hospital, Wahroonga.

The approval consisted of:

- staged expansion and refurbishment of the Clinical Services Building (CSB);
- refurbishment of existing hospital buildings;
- construction of 3 4 storey Education Centre;
- demolition and construction of a new Shannon Wing;
- Relocation of Bethal House and Memorial Fountain to create the Merritt Kellogg Museum;
- staged construction of a multi-deck car park and new at-grade parking for 970 spaces;
- expanded at-grade staff car parks for an additional 86 spaces;
- temporary car park for 258 cars during construction;
- construction of a concourse;
- new entry to hospital;
- new perimeter road around multi-deck car park to connect existing access road; and
- new and upgraded landscaping.

The SAH project location is shown in **Figure 2.** The location of the subject modification request to the approved temporary car park is also shown in **Figure 2**.

Figure 2: Project Location



 $\left(\begin{array}{c} \\ \\ \end{array} \right)$

On 23 December 2011, the PAC approved modification application MP10_0070 MOD 1, modifying the original proposal as follows:

- increase in the temporary car park capacity to 413 spaces (an additional 155 spaces), and requiring its closure three months following the opening of the new multi-deck car park;
- alteration and reconfiguration to the layout of the permanent western at-grade car parks to provide 84 spaces (reduction of 2 spaces);
- amendments to the built form and layout of the multi-deck car park and arrival podium to provide 896 spaces;
- revised entry building and deletion of concourse building; and
- revised design of the entry to the Clifford Building linking to the proposed entry building.

The project application has been further modified by the PAC on two other occasions, details of which are provided at Appendix A. These project application modifications are unrelated to the current modification. Refer to **Figure 2** for the approved project layout, as amended by MOD 2.

Figure 2: Project Layout (as amended by MOD 2)



Stage 1 works, excluding the CSB, have been completed, including access arrangements, at-grade car parking and the multi-deck car park. Construction activities associated with the CSB expansion and the Education Centre's first stage of works remain active.



2. PROPOSED MODIFICATION

2.1 Modification Description

The proposed modification seeks to amend the existing project approval to allow the continued use of the temporary car park exclusively for construction workers for the duration of the SAH redevelopment. In this regard, it is proposed that access to the temporary car park will be controlled via a boom gate.

The proponent is also seeking retention and continued use of the temporary car park for construction workers associated with future development yet to be approved, but endorsed, under the Wahroonga Estate Redevelopment concept plan (MP07_0166).

Figure 3 details the layout of the temporary car park and project layout.





 \bigcirc

3. STATUTORY CONTEXT

3.1 Modification of the Minister's Approval

In accordance with clause 3 of Schedule 6A of the EP&A Act, section 75W of the Act as in force immediately before its repeal on 1 October 2011 and as modified by Schedule 6A, continues to apply to transitional Part 3A projects.

Section 75W(2) of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979* (the EP&A Act) provides that a proponent may request the Minister to modify the Minister's approval of a project. The Minister's approval of a modification is not required if the approval of the project as modified would be consistent with the original approval. As the proposal seeks amendments to the instrument of approval and for the continued use of the temporary car park, the modification will require the Minister's approval.

3.2 Environmental Assessment Requirements

Section 75W(3) of the EP&A Act provides the Director-General with scope to issue Environmental Assessment Requirements (DGRs) that must be substantially complied with before the matter will be considered by the Minister. Environmental Assessment Requirements were not issued for this modification as the proponent has addressed the key issues in the modification request.

3.3 Delegated Authority

The Minister has delegated his functions to determine Part 3A modification applications to the Planning Assessment Commission (PAC) where an application has been made by persons other than by or on behalf of a public authority.

The modification application is being referred to the PAC for determination as the proponent, Sydney Adventist Hospital, lodged a political disclosure statement with the subject modification application, disclosing a number of reportable political donations made during 2011 and 2012.

4. CONSULTATION AND SUBMISSIONS

4.1 Exhibition and Submissions

Under Section 75X(2)(f) of the EP&A Act and clause 8G of the EP&A Regulation 2000, the modification request was made available on the department's website. Due to the minor nature of the proposed modification, the modification request was not exhibited. The department referred the modification request to Ku-ring-gai Council and the Roads and Maritime Services (RMS).

The department received submissions from both council and the RMS, which raised no objections to the proposed retention of the temporary car park. Council provided recommended conditions for the department's consideration. No submissions were received from the public.

5. ASSESSMENT

The department considers the key assessment issues associated with the modification request to be car parking and traffic.

5.1 Temporary Car Park

The temporary car park was originally approved under the project application (MP10_0070) for use by patients, visitors, staff and construction personnel, with a total capacity of 258 spaces. At the time of its approval, it was anticipated that it would be used for between four and seven years, depending on the final phasing of development stages.

Under modification application MP10_0070 MOD 1, the PAC approved an increase in its capacity to 413 spaces (+155) to assist in minimising the disruption to existing onsite car parking by the hospital construction activities.

Under MOD 1, the temporary car park was also conditioned to be closed and the land on which it is located to be restored to its original state within 3 months of issuing of an occupation certificate for the multi-deck hospital car park, on the basis that the capacity of the multi-deck car park would satisfactorily accommodate the parking demands generated by the hospital.

Conditions E7 and F5 were imposed as follows:

E7 Use of the Temporary Car Park

Prior to the issue of an Occupation Certificate for the Multi-deck Carpark, use of the temporary carpark is to cease operations and the temporary carpark is to be restored to its original state within three months of the issue of the subject multi-deck carpark occupation certificate. Details are to be provided to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority and forwarded to the Department of Planning and Infrastructure for their records.

F5 Use of the Temporary Car Park

Use of the temporary car park is to cease on the issue of an occupation certification relating to the use of multi-deck car park.

The proponent's modification application was accompanied by correspondence from the council, which stated their general support for the retention of the temporary car park as a reasonable measure to reduce traffic and parking congestion in the area. Council's correspondence also recommended minor amendments to conditions E7 and F5 and the introduction of a new condition that would require all construction workers to park on site within the temporary car park and not on the surrounding streets. Council's recommendations were re-stated in its submission made to the department during the exhibition period.

The department supports the retention and ongoing use of the temporary car park by construction workers, and concurs with council that its use during the remaining works associated with the redevelopment of the Sydney Adventist Hospital will assist in alleviating traffic and parking congestion on the surrounding local streets.

The department also acknowledges the proponent's requested amendments to condition E7, detailed below, to allow for the temporary car park's continued use for



construction traffic management on the Wahroonga Estate, beyond the life of construction activities approved under MP10_0070.

E7 Use of the Temporary Car Park

Upon the issue of an Occupation Certificate for the last hospital building completed under Project Approval MP10_0070 use of the temporary carpark is to cease operations. The temporary carpark is to be restored to its original state within three months of the issue of the subject Occupation Certificate unless a subsequent approval is issued for its continued use for the purposes of construction traffic management on the Wahroonga Estate. Details are to be provided to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority and forwarded to the Department of Planning and Infrastructure for its records.

Notwithstanding the potential benefits that a dedicated parking area may have for the management of construction traffic, the use of the temporary car park only relates the project approval granted under MP10_0070. In this respect, use of the temporary car park development proposed under the approved concept plan would require separate consideration and approval under those respective applications. However, it is appropriate to include flexibility in the proposed amended condition to facilitate this.

In view of the above, the department is satisfied that the continued use of the temporary car park will help in managing construction related parking associated with the remaining Sydney Adventist Hospital construction works. It is therefore recommended that condition E7 be amended accordingly to allow for the continued use of the temporary car park until the completion of development approved under the SAH project approval (MP10_0070). The department also acknowledges that in recommending the continued use of the temporary car park until the completion of the SAH redevelopment, condition F5 is no longer required and is therefore recommended to be deleted.

It is also recommended that a new condition be imposed restricting the use of the car park to construction workers and requiring that all workers be made aware of the temporary car park and their obligation to use the dedicated on-site parking available to minimise impacts on the surrounding local road network.

5.2 Traffic

Notwithstanding the discussed parking benefits resulting from the continued use of the temporary car park, the department must also be satisfied that its continued use (in combination with the now operational multi-deck hospital car park) will not result in a detrimental increase in traffic congestion within the local road network, particularly with regard to the intersection performance at the main hospital entrance on Fox Valley Road.

Future construction works associated with the hospital's redevelopment are projected to continue up to the year 2020, when the new Shannon Wing construction works are completed (on which works have not commenced to date). The proponent has advised that over the next 12 months approximately 225 construction workers per month are expected to be on site and using the car park.

An intersection analysis prepared for the modification application assumes the main hospital entrance and Fox Valley Road intersection as the main point of entry for vehicles using the temporary car park. In this regard, data from the original traffic report prepared for MP10_0070 was used in the proponent's intersection analysis to



review the impact from the use of the temporary car park on the operation of the main hospital entrance and Fox Valley Road intersection.

It was found that on average, the hospital's main entrance intersection currently operates at a 'good' level of service, with lower levels of performance experienced for right and left hand turning manoeuvres from Fox Valley Road into the hospital site at both the AM and PM peak periods. Importantly, it was found that the proposed continued use of the temporary car park would retain the existing 'good' level of service and result in unrecognisable increases to the existing lower levels of performance.

In this respect, the department is satisfied that the continued use of the temporary car park will not detrimentally impact on the intersection performance of the main hospital entrance or create increased congestion on Fox Valley Road. The car park will also keep workers' vehicles off local streets throughout the day, thereby minimising the potential for conflict with residents.

6. CONCLUSION

The modification request seeks approval for the continued use of the temporary car park to provide an improved construction traffic management outcome and assist in alleviating off-site conflicts associated with construction worker vehicles parking within the surrounding local road network.

The department has reviewed the proponent's modification request and supporting documentation and considers the key issues associated with the request to be car parking and traffic.

In assessing the key issues, the department has taken into consideration submissions and comments received from the council and RMS, and concur with the position of support provided by the council for the temporary car park's continued use. The department has also considered the potential impacts associated with traffic generated by its continued use, particularly to the existing main hospital entrance intersection, and is satisfied that any additional traffic generated by its use can be satisfactorily accommodated.

The continued use of the temporary car park (following the completion of construction works associated with the SAH Hospital campus redevelopment) in association with further development endorsed by the Wahroonga Estate concept plan will require separate approval under future applications.



7. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Planning Assessment Commission:

- a) consider the findings and recommendations of this report;
- b) **approve** the modifications, subject to conditions, under section 75W of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979, and*;
- c) sign the attached instrument of modification approval (Appendix D).

519/3

Director Industry, Social Projects & Key Sites

6.9.13

Chris Wilson Executive Director Development Assessment Systems & Approvals



APPENDIX A MODIFICATION APPLICATIONS

MOD Application	Modification	Determination
MP07_0166 MOD 1	Modification to the concept plan to clarify the timing for the proponent to obtain an approval from the Commonwealth Department of Water, Environment, Heritage and the Arts for a Biodiversity Management Plan.	15 May 2010 (DoPI)
MP07_0166 MOD 2	Modification to the concept plan to amend the proponent's details and to amend the timing, funding and traffic infrastructure upgrade requirements.	4 December 2012 (DoPI)
MP07_0166 MOD 3	Modification to the concept plan to increase the maximum gross floor area of Precinct C: Central Hospital (containing Sydney Adventist Hospital and Education Centre) by 7,552 sqm, of which 3,550 sqm was proposed for the Education Centre.	18 June 2013 (PAC)
MP10_0070 MOD 2	 Modification to the approved clinical services building of the project application for the following: amended built form and floor layout, to support staffing and servicing arrangements; GFA increase of 957 sqm (SAH site total of 19,775 sqm GFA); building height increase of 3.5 m, resulting in a 3.3 m departure from the 39.5 m maximum building height control (cl.18(1) of Part 25 of Sch 3 of MD SEPP); and amended development staging schedule. 	11 April 2012 (PAC)
MP10_0070 MOD 3	 Modification to the Education Centre of the project application for the following: decrease in building height by approximately 4.1 m, from three storeys to two storeys; increase in building footprint due to redistribution of GFA over two levels; amended façade design to reflect the amended two storey design; and amendment to the existing education centre car park and construction of new at-grade car park to provide an additional 34 spaces. 	18 June 2013 (PAC)
MP10_0070 MOD 4	 Modification to the Education Centre of the project application for the following: construction of a five storey building expansion, comprising the allocation of an additional 3,475 sqm of gross floor area (approved under MP07_0166 MOD 3); reduction of car parking provision from 45 spaces to 33 spaces, comprising 14 basement spaces and 19 at grade spaces; and provision of ancillary landscaping. 	Under Assessment

