

Level 6, 10 Valentine Avenue Parramatta NSW 2150 Locked Bag 5020 Parramatta NSW 2124 DX 8225 PARRAMATTA Telephone: 61 2 9873 8500 Facsimile: 61 2 9873 8599

heritagemailbox@environment.nsw.gov.au

www.heritage.nsw.gov.au

File No: SF17/31972 Ref No: DOC17/351353 DOC17/345873

Ms Lisa Mitchell Team Leader, Rail Transport Assessments NSW Department of Planning & Environment GPO Box 39 SYDNEY NSW 2001

Attention: Mr Adam O'Connor

Sent by e-mail to: adam.oconnor@planning.nsw.gov.au

Dear Ms Mitchell

RE: SSI 15\_7400 - Sydney Metro - City & Southwest Project (Chatswood to Sydenham) - Modification No. 4 - Sydenham Station and Sydney Metro Trains Facility South

Reference is made to your letter dated 27 June 2017 which contained links to the documents for the above modification available on the Department's website.

The Sydney Metro Project Chatswood to Sydenham was approved by the Minister for Planning on 9 January 2017 (SSI 15\_7400). Modification No. 4 involves the following:

- Sydenham Station and precinct works, including demolition of some elements, a new aerial concourse and new station entries at Railway Parade and Burrows Avenue, plus upgrades to transport interchange facilities.
- Sydney Metro Trains Facility South, comprising train stabling and maintenance facilities
  for the overall metro network. The scope includes earthworks, retaining walls, track and
  rail systems, construction of new buildings, plus operation of trains and maintenance
  activities within the stabling yard.
- Track and rail system facilities to segregate the T3 Bankstown Line and the Goods Line, installation of metro tracks and rail systems including crossover and turnback facilities.
- Changes to the Sydenham Pit and Drainage Pumping Station, including a new aqueduct over the pit, new pumping station and new maintenance access ramp.
- Ancillary infrastructure and works such as fencing, utilities, drainage, noise barriers, road and transport network works, bridge works and temporary construction facilities.

It is noted that the Heritage Council of NSW made previous submissions on the project EIS by letter dated 27 June 2016 and on the PIR by letter dated 18 November 2016. It is also noted that ongoing project work has been presented to the Heritage Working Group for the Sydney Metro that was established by the Department of Planning and Environment.

The EIS for the approved project identified that there may be an opportunity to operate the Chatswood to Sydenham component before completion of the Sydenham to Bankstown project. Further project planning has now identified that the Chatswood to Sydenham component (Phase 1) is likely to be opened well in advance of the Sydenham to Bankstown component (Phase 2) and could be extended through to Sydenham Station. A phased opening through to Sydenham Station would provide the opportunity to enable Sydney Metro services at Sydenham during the final shutdown of the T3 Bankstown Line that is required to complete construction of the Sydenham to Bankstown component.

The following reports lodged with the application have been reviewed: CHATSWOOD TO SYDENHAM Sydenham Station And Sydney Metro Trains Facility South Modification Report, Sydney Metro and TfNSW - Main Report (n.d)

CHATSWOOD TO SYDENHAM Sydenham Station And Sydney Metro Trains Facility South Modification Report, Sydney Metro and TfNSW - Appendices (n.d)

Given the direct impacts of the project on two State Heritage Register Listed items, namely the Sydenham Railway Station Group (SHR item number 1254) and Sydenham Drainage Pit & Pumping Station (SHR item number 1644) representatives of Sydney Metro presented this proposal to the Approvals Committee of the Heritage Council of NSW. Comments from members of the Heritage Council during that presentation on 5 July 2017 are included within this letter.

## Sydenham Railway Station Group (SHR 1254)

It is considered that *Chapter 14 - Non Aboriginal Heritage* of the Main Report has under assessed the impact of the works on the Sydenham Railway Station Group. The demolition of some items within the SHR group is described as a major direct impact but the new concourse is described as an 'overall moderate' indirect impact.

Direct impacts to the Sydenham Railway Station Group include the demolition of 2 of 4 significant station buildings and the removal of platform 1 (two of four original platforms), and also the parcels office and waiting sheds.

There would also be a considerable change to the character and setting of Sydenham Station through the proposed new canopy structure and new concourse. The concourse will connect to platforms 1 and 2 and facilitate passenger connections between Sydney Metro and Sydney train services. The new canopy is proposed to bridge across the concourse to cover all platform buildings. The canopy will be a very large structure along with new north and south entries to the station. It is understood that following consideration by the Design Review Panel (established under CoA E100) the new canopy has been re-oriented/turned and that there will be a 'gap' between the new canopies and the heritage platform buildings.

At the meeting on 5 July 2017 the Approvals Committee provided the following comments:

- The buildings to be retained are not celebrated in the new design. Retention of heritage items is positive, but how they are reflected in the new work is just as important.
- There is community demand across Sydney for local character including heritage and sense of place to be reflected in new structures. Not all stations are the same and there should be local character reflected in the differences between stations. This could be addressed by a design focus on place making and identity.
- New design should not replicate or mimic the heritage item but provide profile and perspective that respects and celebrates the heritage and sense of place.
- Reducing the scale of the new structures, for example the platform canopies, is recommended.

It is recommended that the above comments and considerations should be incorporated into the Station Design and Precinct Plans (SDPP) that are required to be prepared for each station by the Proponent under CoA E101 before the commencement of permanent built surface works and/or landscaping at those stations.

The Approvals Committee further commented that:

• Capitalising on opportunities to interpret the heritage of the area through site hoardings and temporary structures during works and in the final design is encouraged.

It is noted that a Heritage Interpretation Plan is required for the project under CoA E21 and that CoA E21 (b) (i) refers to 'use of interpretative hoardings during construction' and that other conditions such as E21 (b) (iv) refer to interpretation through 'station and precinct design'. These Conditions are considered sufficient to guide good outcomes for the project provided that they are implemented by the Proponent and monitored by the Department of Planning and Environment through existing mechanisms such as the Design Review Panel (established under CoA E100), consultation with the Heritage Working Group and with the Heritage Council of NSW.

While artist's impressions of the new concourse were provided, the Heritage Council Approvals Committee also requested that any future presentations from Sydney Metro include before and after images to better communicate the design, including images showing the elements of heritage significance would be valuable in future communications.

In reviewing the Modification documents it is noted that additional local heritage items associated with Sydenham Railway Station are the Sydenham (Illawarra Line) Underbridge (RailCorp s170 Heritage and Conservation Register - 4805746) and Brick Retaining Walls around the station on Railway Parade and Marrickville Road (Marrickville LEP - I287). There would be impacts to the bridge through strengthening of the piers and the removal of the existing brick wall would occur along with the station building on platform 1 of Sydenham Station.

There are no listed archaeological sites within or adjacent to the project area, which has nil to low archaeological potential and / or significance due to high levels of previous ground disturbance especially within the historic rail corridor. It is, therefore, considered that there would be no need for any new mitigation measures to manage archaeological issues for the proposed modification, as existing measures such as CEMPs and relevant sub-plans and documents would continue to apply to the project.

## Sydenham Drainage Pit and Pumping Station (SHR 1644)

Chapter 14 - Non Aboriginal Heritage of the Main Report is considered to have inconsistently assessed the impact of the proposed works on the Sydenham Drainage Pit. This section of the report describes the proposed aqueduct over the pit as a 'moderate' impact but also then describes the visual impacts on Sydenham Pit and Drainage Pumping Station 1 as a 'major' indirect impact.

The Sydenham Drainage Pit and Pumping Station are situated very close to the proposed new train stabling facility. There is an interface with the works on the east and south sides of the pit. The Pumping Station is currently connected to two drainage channels/culverts, one open and one closed. To facilitate the Sydney Metro Sydenham Stabling Facilities, realignment and enclosing of existing drainage channels associated with the drainage pit is required.

The preferred option described in the Modification Report would be to install an aqueduct and viaduct over the flood storage area (open pond/pit) and to construct a new pumping station building and access road/ramp. The new pumping station building has been reduced in bulk by retaining the existing pumping station, however, an adaptive re-use for the pumping station is not yet determined. The Drainage Pit and Pumping Stations would remain a Sydney Water Asset after the completion of the Sydney Metro Project.

At the meeting on 5 July 2017 the Approvals Committee provided the following comment:

 The replication of the form of the old pumping station in the structure of new pumping station is positive.

It is also noted that the Heritage Working Group (established by DPE) has been advised that more recent design modifications have moved the new pumping station out of the actual Pit into a 'cut and cover' mound on the western side, however, the reports exhibited with the Modification application do not show this option.

It is considered that for the proposed works to be acceptable, the degree of direct impacts both physical and visual to these items should be mitigated as much as possible, and it is desirable that all design solutions be further considered that would minimise the impact on significant fabric, setting and views within the current SHR curtilage for the Sydenham Drainage Pit.

## General

The Modification Documents have identified that some of the existing mitigation measures identified in the prior EIS would need to be modified to include the items now affected by the proposed modification. Consolidated revised environmental mitigation measures are provided in Chapter 21 of the Main Report in the Table for Non-Aboriginal Heritage (pp.263). Updated measures are:

- NAH1 Archival Recording would now be required for Sydenham Pit and Drainage Pumping Station 1 and for Sydenham Railway Station Group: Platform 6 building and Platform 1 Parcels Office.
- NAH7 –Sympathetic Design (both items)
- NAH11 Avoid further direct impacts (other than for those elements directly affected by the project). This would be required for the existing Sydenham Station and the Brick retaining walls near Sydenham Station.

The above changes are supported, however, it is considered that mitigation measure NAH4 - Method for the demolition of existing buildings to be developed to minimise direct and indirect impacts to adjacent and / or adjoining heritage items, should now also be modified to include the Sydenham Station Buildings.

If you have any questions arising from this letter, please contact Dr Siobhan Lavelle OAM, Senior Team Leader, Archaeological Heritage at the Heritage Division, Office of Environment and Heritage on telephone (02) 9873 8546 or by e-mail: siobhan.lavelle@environment.nsw.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

Rajeev Maini

Manager, Conservation Heritage Division

Office of Environment & Heritage

As Delegate of the Heritage Council of NSW

9 August 2017