
BLUES POINT RESIDENT OBJECTION

NSW Government Sydney Metro

Project SSI 15_7400

Objection to Proposed Blues Point Reserve Temporary TBM Retrieval Point

As a local resident of Blues Point I hereby object to the use of Blues Point Reserve as a temporary Tunnel Boring Machine (TBM) retrieval location.

I have no political donations to disclose.

My objections are;

- To the fundamental case for the retrieval of TBM equipment
- To the inadequate consideration of alternative approaches to TBM retrieval
- To the EIS assessment of impact caused by this proposal as “regional”, not “national”
- To the inadequate consideration of barge removal of sandstone and spoils instead of tip trucks
- To the inadequate assessment and mitigation plans in the EIS caused by tip truck activity on Blues Point Road, specifically regarding:
 - o Impact to local businesses
 - o Structural impact to residences
 - o Resident health and safety
- To the inadequate mitigations of increased impact during the planned TBM retrieval events
- To the inadequate mitigation of impact on local parking by construction staff
- To the plan to rehabilitate from Q4 2020 through to Q1 2021 thereby impacting 2 years of NYE

Objections in Detail

Objection to the fundamental case for the retrieval of TBM equipment

The Chatswood to Sydenham EIS explains that tunnelling will occur in direction south-east from Chatswood and north-east from Sydenham. Due to the harbour crossing decision to tunnel through sediment under Sydney Harbour, alternative TBM equipment is required for the Blues Point to Barangaroo section of the tunnel. The tunnelling plan includes retrieval of TBM equipment from a temporary shaft at Blues Point Reserve. While the need for alternative TBM equipment is explained, the need to retrieve the TBM equipment is not.

Numerous tunnel boring projects worldwide have assessed the cost and impact of TBM retrieval as greater than simply burying the equipment after use.

Throughout all the documentation provided for the Sydney Metro project, no consideration appears to have been brought to the need for or the alternatives to TBM retrieval.

The Blues Point Reserve Temporary TBM Retrieval site is not a requirement for the Chatswood to Sydenham Sydney Metro, it is a proposed solution to a construction problem. In light of the cost and impact of this retrieval site, this approach has not been adequately researched for alternatives.

This objection is to the NSW Government's inadequate approach to considering alternatives and appeals to the ingenuity of the solution's Architects and Engineers to come up with a better solution. A potential solution could be to;

- Turn the south-east TBM equipment into a siding under Blues Point Reserve and seal with concrete
- Tunnel the north-east TBM equipment from Barangaroo through to a similar siding under Blues Point Reserve and seal with concrete
- Complete any finishing or gaps manually or with a different construction solution if necessary

From a planning and cost perspective I struggle to imagine how the value of 4 used TBMs could possibly exceed the cost, long term impact and risk to human life of constructing the Blues Point Reserve retrieval shaft.

Objection to the inadequate consideration of alternative approaches to TBM retrieval

If the fundamental case for TBM retrieval is upheld in response to my first objection, then further consideration must be made to alternative approaches which would negate the requirement for an additional TBM retrieval site at Blues Point Reserve. Alternatives could include;

- Dismantle the TBM equipment underground (from within the tunnel) and retrieve via the tunnel back to Victoria Cross and Barangaroo ie;
 - o Tunnel southeast to the vicinity of Blues Point Reserve and stop
 - o Excavate around the TBM equipment and dismantle it in place
 - o Retrieve the dismantled equipment back to Victoria Cross
 - o Tunnel north under the harbour from Barangaroo to the previously excavated dismantling point
 - o Dismantle and retrieve back to Barangaroo or
- Retrieve from Victoria Cross and Barangaroo only, ie;
 - o Tunnel southeast to Victoria Cross and retrieve TBM equipment there
 - o Tunnel northeast to Barangaroo and retrieve TBM equipment there
 - o Insert specialised TBM equipment at Barangaroo for the Harbour Crossing
 - o Tunnel to Victoria Cross and retrieve TBM equipment

Objection to the EIS assessment of impact caused by this proposal as “regional”, not “national”

The unique foreshore perspective of Sydney’s iconic Opera House framed by Sydney’s equally iconic Harbour Bridge is enjoyed by tens of thousands of international, national, regional and local visitors each year. The EIS rates the impact of view from the Opera House as of “national” importance, and only rates the view of the Opera House from Blues Point as “regional”. A vista as unique as the one from Blues Point Reserve should also rank as of “national” importance.

As a local resident and on behalf of the tens of thousands of visitors annually to Blues Point Reserve who have not been given the opportunity to object, I hereby object to the impact

assessment as only “regional” in scope as it significantly downplays the importance of disruption to this site.

Objection to the inadequate consideration of barge removal of sandstone and spoils instead of tip trucks

The EIS, Page 71, Table 3.2 : Spoil haulage options , states “ ... the establishment of barging facilities at this site is not considered to be a feasible solution. Barge transport of spoil may be feasible at this site subject to further investigations. “

The EIS, has investigated (and understated) the impact of Tip Trucks on Blues Point Road. My objection is to this ambiguous statement and incomplete assessment of spoil haulage by barge in light of the massive impact of Tip Trucks up and down a steep, narrow and highly used residential and commercial route over a period of 12 months to remove and a further 6 months to return/refill.

Objection to the inadequate assessment and mitigation plans in the EIS caused by tip truck activity on Blues Point Road, specifically regarding:

o Impact to local businesses

The proposed route, along Blues Point Road, north from Blues Point Hotel to Lavender Road is predominantly lined with restaurants with street dining and parallel to curb parking only. These businesses will be impacted by the frequent movement of large trucks. The wide trucks on a narrow road will make it difficult and dangerous for patrons to park as well as significantly spoiling the ambience. For 12 months, a constant stream of empty trucks will go down the road and return up the steep gradient fully loaded. The noise from a fully loaded truck on a steep gradient in close proximity to street dining will cause significant degradation of enjoyment and will ultimately reduce business revenues. During the rehabilitation of the site, trucks will be travelling fully loaded, downhill, also in close proximity to parallel parked cars. Not only is a downhill fully loaded truck extremely noisy, it is also extremely difficult to stop. The cumulative risk profile of high frequency heavy haulage, close proximity and volume of pedestrians including slow moving elderly and fast

moving unrestrained children creates a critical risk situation which will exist for an unacceptable duration. The probability of injury, accident and fatality is surely too great to allow this to proceed.

- o Structural impact to residences

The gradient from Henry Lawson Avenue up Blues Point Road is significant, especially for a fully loaded truck. The vibrations from the thousands of truck movements up and down this street will impact the comfort of residents and because of the relatively close proximity of mostly older brick and concrete constructed properties, there is a high probability of structural damage. Any damage claims by property owners caused by truck movements from the site, for years after the construction will incur a cost to process, assess and repair. This objection is to the absence of a full cost analysis to the alternative of a much lower impact option to use a barge to remove spoils from the construction site.

- o Resident and visitor health and safety

You only need to look at Google Street View to see the danger to pedestrians travelling south on the eastern side of Blues Point Road to Henry Lawson Avenue.



As the clip from Google Street view above shows, this area is already dangerous! The cumulative risk of high volume heavy haulage trucks in the area, errant pedestrians, disrupted access and the ensuing confusion creates another critical risk of injury, accident and fatality.

Not considered by the EIS, the movement of earth, sandstone and various site spoils will undoubtedly cause an increase in loose sand on the road surface. Combined with the inclined road surface on this corner, this again creates a cumulative risk through increased difficulty for heavy moving vehicles to stop in time to avoid collisions.

Objection to the inadequate mitigations of increased impact during the planned TBM retrieval events

The increased noise, reduced resident and visitor parking and extended hours of operation during the planned TBM retrieval events are unacceptable. For 4 periods of 4 weeks, many residents will be forced to travel further to find parking and for the 4 nights of anticipated overnight activity, will suffer significant disruption to sleep. Mitigation plans must be

enhanced to include temporary alternative accommodation for the periods of increased impact. The temporary accommodation provided to all residents in the area must be in close proximity, should be a minimum 4 star quality hotel and include parking.

Objection to the inadequate mitigation of impact on local parking by construction workers

Many resident properties in the proximity of Blues Point Reserve do not include off-street parking. North Sydney Council know this and have a long running parking permit scheme to manage local parking. The removal of 4 parking places for the full 2 years of impact to this site, combined with regular attendance by up to 60 workers for 12 months will cause an unreasonable degradation in the availability of parking places for residents and visitors to the area. Throughout the week and especially on weekends, disgruntled visitors who can't find a parking spot to enjoy the view regularly rev-up and speed out of the area and back up Blues Point Road. The reduction of parking spaces will significantly degrade the experience for many visitors as well as increasing congestion and reducing safety as drivers compete for fewer spaces.

Use of parking by construction workers must be limited to the on-site parking included within the construction site. Other workers must either be required to use Public Transport (bus or ferry) or a shuttle bus arrangement from an alternate makeshift parking area should be considered.

Objection to the plan to rehabilitate from Q4 2020 through to Q1 2021 thereby impacting 2 years of NYE

Every New Years Eve, thousands of visitors flock to Blues Point Reserve to watch the fireworks. The reserve is one of the best places in Sydney to watch the iconic event. .

Table 7-11 Blues Point temporary site indicative construction program

Construction activity	Indicative construction timeframe																											
	16.724 pt				2018				2019				2020				2021				2022				2023			
	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
Enabling works and site establishment									•																			
Shaft excavation									•	—	•																	
TBM retrieval (Barangaroo drive 1)											•																	
TBM Retrieval (northern drives)												•	•															
TBM retrieval (Barangaroo drive 2)														•														
Rehabilitation																•	•											

As the snip from Page 220 of the EIS shows, Blues Point Reserve will be mostly unusable for NYE celebrations on NYE2020 and NYE2021. If the park is to be used for this project, greater efforts need to be made in the planning to bring forward proposed rehabilitation and limit the impact to NYE to just NYE2020.