

25 November 2016

NSW Planning and Environment

SSD 16-7709 MPW STAGE 2 PROPOSAL

The Moorebank Heritage Group thanks the NSW Planning and Environment for the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned process.

Our particular interest is obviously with the Non-Indigenous Heritage, and this submission relates to only that part of the Proposal and supporting EIS.

In response, please find our comments tabled below.

We thank you in advance for your consideration of our concerns and recommendations.

Yours sincerely,

Phil Hurren Secretary

M: 0419 258 446

E: info@moorebankheritage.org.au

A: PO Box 6046 Hammondville NSW 2170

PART 1: GENERAL COMMENTS

1.1 Relationship with MPE

The MPW Stage 2 Proposal and EIS Study Area addresses the MPW Project in isolation to the MPE Project. The Proposal states:

'Despite its close proximity to the MPE Project ... the Proposal remains a viable standalone operation irrespective of the undertaking of surrounding development and, at this point of time, is unrelated to and independent of such other development.'

(Proposal Report: Section 4.3 Relationship to the Moorebank Precinct East (MPE) Project Arcadis 2016 p.32)

This may well be in regard to land ownership and financial and business agreements and the like it, however, does not sit with the development and implementation of a heritage interpretation strategy.

We are concerned that the heritage interpretation of the MPW site will potentially not be complete or inclusive, without the consideration of the area beyond its boundaries; being the broader Moorebank Cultural Landscape, in particular the phases of land use and occupation of the former Liverpool Field Training Area and the Moorebank Subdivisions.

These themes incorporate both the MPW and MPE sites that, individually and collectively, share a common and connected history.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1.1.1

That consideration is given to a broader heritage interpretation approach that looks at both sites, and addresses the significance, history and connections to the surrounding area and the overarching Moorebank Cultural Landscape.

1.1.2

That the interpretative content is balanced, and reflective of the earlier time periods as well as the more recent military history of the MPW and MPE Project sites.

Refer also to Part 2: Heritage Interpretation Strategy

1.2 HISTORICAL REPORTING

General Comments

Of note is the potential trap of heritage interpretation strategies being too reliant on previous studies and online listings. None of the heritage reports used as source documents appear to have included consultation with the local historical societies or the wider Army community. In doing so:

- The social significance to current and former military personnel and families has not been captured
- The gaps that currently appear in the historical recording of the MPW Project site may have been averted, and appropriately addressed earlier in the process
- That the recent discovery of the overarching Moorebank Cultural Landscape and its management would have been implemented in the early stages of the MIT project, that is several years ago

Strarch Hangar

The fact that a former officer of the Royal Australian Engineers (RAE) invented the design of the Strarch Hangar has not been mentioned in any of the heritage reports. Its inventor Capt Lewis Ronald (Lew) Harding served with the Corps during WWII and this association adds to the structure's significance to the RAE and the SME.

Brief Bio - Captain Lewis Ronald (Lew) Harding

After graduating from university in Western Australia with qualifications in engineering, Harding enlisted with the Civilian Military Force 13th Field Engineering Company in 1941 with the rank of Lieutenant. He was unable at that stage to join the AIF because a 'professional engineer' was deemed a reserve occupation. After basic training he changed from CMF to AIF, attending Officers' Training School at Steele Barracks (SME), which now forms part of the MPW.

He volunteered to join the newly formed Unexploded Bomb Disposal Unit. Subsequently, Harding was promoted to Captain and became Chief Instructor, Bomb Disposal School that trained officers and NCOs of both the Australian and US Army.

He was transferred to 52 Field Park Company in Darwin, and then as Captain to the newly formed 7th Mechanical Equipment Company at Darwin. Shortly after the Company was initiated it was shipped to Wewak, New Guinea where Harding served until hostilities ceased. Harding was acting Officer in Command responsible for the dissolution of the Company.

After the war he rejoined the Public Works Department Architectural Division (PWDAD) in Perth where he was designing all roof trusses using pipes in lieu of the pre-war angle irons. His later designs and inventions were developed from this principle, including RIGITRUSS (Rigid Truss Portal), STRACHES (Stress Erected Arches) from which the name Strarch is derived, STRUSSES (Stress Erected Trusses) used as horizontal silos for wheat storage, and HYPARS (Hyperbolic Paraboloids).

He retired from his position of Chief Engineer Structures (PWDAD) and became a registered builder, designing and patenting the method of constructing large clear span roofs (STRARCHES), building three of the structures for Portland Cement, the Canine Association and the RAAF Museum at Bull Creek, Western Australia. He sold the patent to Strarch International, which constructed these structure types worldwide.

We are anticipating further information from the Harding family, especially dates of major events. In the interim, additional information on the career and inventions of Captain Lewis Ronald (Lew) Harding, is available at:

harding.net.au/index.php/book structure.

Of note ... the 13th Field Company is the longest existing unit in the Australian Army (that has not undergone a change in name or role).

Titalka Park

Titalka Park will be lost through the planned MPW site works. It history, as yet, appears to have not been fully researched or recorded.

As the story goes ... Capt Penny, a Gallipoli veteran, based at 2 Base Ordnance Depot, Moorebank in August 1949 won £6,000 in a lottery with a ticket named '*Titalka*'. Penny claimed '*Titalka*' was an Aboriginal word meaning *happiness*. It is said that Penny donated some of his winnings to assist with the establishment of Titalka Park although there appears to have been no official recognition made at the opening of the park in November 1949.

Moorebank Cultural Landscape (encompassing the former landholdings of Thomas Moore)

The Proposal EIS (p.33) assesses the significance level of the Moorebank Cultural Landscape as *Commonwealth and Local*.

We believe, however, that it is potentially of State significance as briefly its Non-Indigenous heritage includes:

- Evidence of the patterns of emigration, settlement, and peopling of the Australian continent.
- Agriculture and rural land uses, including orchards, poultry farms, vineyards, vegetable gardens (including Chinese gardeners), race horse breeding, and cattle.
- Associations to Thomas MOORE (1762-1846).
- Associations to Major Henry Colden ANTILL (1779-1852).
- Associations to the LONG family, William LONG (1797-1876) and William Alexander LONG (1839-1915).
- Association to convicts, in particular in the construction of Liverpool Weir, those assigned to Thomas Moore, and of his wife Rachael (nee Turner) who was herself a convict, and William Long.
- Chipping Norton Soldier Settlement Area.
- Colonial to pre 1912 military use / Easter Training Camps.
- Church of England / Church of England Property Section.
- Liverpool Field Training Area / Liverpool Manoeuvre Area
 Demonstrates the nature of the relationship between Australia and Britain at the turn of the 20th Century.

Liverpool was the first Commonwealth field training area in NSW, and second in Australia only to Enoggera in Brisbane, acquired by the Department of Defence. Enoggera was too small, and Liverpool remained the only suitable training area owned by Defence until well into the interwar years.

It is historically highly significant for its associations with the development of Australia's military forces prior to, and during, WW1 and with the military buildup in the early years of WW2, and the Korean and Vietnam Wars, and recent conflicts and peacekeeping deployments.

Social value and significance to the extensive community of Army

personnel, the Liverpool community, and the broader Australian community on account of the long-term Defence associations with the site. (During WW1 all new recruits were trained at Liverpool).

Its association with the Australian Women's Army Service during WWII including Signal Corps members who worked at the Signals Offices, Australian 12th Lines of Communications Signal Detachment, (Aust 12 LofC Sig Det), located opposite to Kitchener House, and female Sappers who served with the Royal Australian Engineers. (For a period the AWAs were quartered at Kitchener House).

Association with significant contemporary Australian Army soldiers and their families, and of their achievements in the Army, and for many, later in the private and public sectors.

• Kitchener House (Arpafeelie) c1895

Association to Field Marshal Horatio Herbert Kitchener, 1st Earl Kitchener KG, KP, GCB, OM, GCSI, GCMG, GCIE, PC, who used the residence for his exclusive use as divisional headquarters when reviewing the status of the Australian Army at the Liverpool training area, on 6 and 7 January 1910. (There is still some conjecture as to whether, or not, Kitchener actually quartered overnight). For Kitchener's visit, the bedroom allocated for his use and the dining room, were refurbished in oak by a 'well-known city [Sydney] furnishing firm'.

One of the few, if not only, known physical reminders of Kitchener's visit to Australia. It is located at a place where he made detailed observations of the state of the country's armed forces upon which he based his recommendations. Thus through Kitchener, it has an indirect association with the establishment of the Australian Imperial Force.

Only known remaining relic associated with his inspection of the troops of New South Wales at the Liverpool training area.

The residence was used as the nurses' home for the Army nursing sisters working at the Military Isolation Camp, and later the Liverpool Army Field Hospital during WWI. The presence of nursing sisters at the Liverpool camp predates that of the erection of the hospital as a permanent structure.

Last remaining, intact element associated with the Defence presence at the Liverpool field training area immediately prior to, and during, the WW1 period. During WW1 all new recruits were trained at Liverpool.

Association with the Australian Army in its long use as an on-base married quarters, including its use as the residence of the Liverpool Area Commander, Commander 1st Australian Task Force, Commanding Officer 21 Supply Battalion and 2 Base Ordnance Depot (2BOD), and Chief Instructor School of Military Engineering.

For a period members of the AWAs from the Aust 12 LofC Sig Det were quartered at Kitchener House during WWII.

Association with the Vietnam War and national conscription. The

Army Special Investigation Services, whose duties included, in part, dealing with 'draft dodgers' and conscientious objectors, used the property as offices.

Association with William Alexander Smith JP FSS who as the landowner built the Kitchener House c1895 (then known as *Arpafeelie*). Smith held senior positions in the NSW and National Temperance movements, and was a pioneer of industrial insurance in Australia. He was also an alderman of the Municipal District of Liverpool 1902-1911 (Mayor 1903-1908), an Honorary NSW Magistrate c1892-1906, and a Justice of the Peace in both NSW and WA. Smith also held senior positions in numerous commerce, sporting, cultural and religious organisations.

Last surviving former rural house in this part of Moorebank from the Moorebank Estate development of the late 1880s period. The property is evidence of previous urban environments and enhances the sense of place and, as such demonstrates land tenure activities.

- The area is evidence of the State government's and private initiated exploratory drilling programs for coal reserves in the greater Sydney basin during the late 1880s to 1890s. Coal at the time was in much demand for shipping and rail transport, industry and domestic purposes.
- Liverpool Army Field Hospital
 The hospital is possibly the first purpose-built, permanent WW1
 Army field hospital in NSW and Australia c1915. It was the most substantial permanent building complex of the WWI Liverpool Army Camp.

Association with Australian-based Army field hospitals and Army nursing personal, (Army nursing sisters and Voluntary Aid Detachment (VAD) members during WWI. The presence of nursing sisters at the Liverpool camp predates that of the erection of the hospital as a permanent structure. There is evidence that during WWI some nursing sisters working at the hospital, (and possibly quartered at Kitchener House), subsequently enlisted in the Army and served overseas.

Association with the Australian Red Cross Society and its WWI home hospital committee activities. The Society in 1915 equipped the cottage for use by WWI Army nursing sisters at a cost of £225. The Society also built and equipped the Liverpool Army Field Hospital (17 wards, a recreation and convalescent room, and supplied numerous tents).

- Liverpool to Holsworthy Military Railway
 Branch lines and sidings of the former Liverpool to Holsworthy
 Military Railway built by the Commonwealth 1917-1918 using
 internees from the Holsworthy Interment Camp as labour.
- Moorebank Scramble Track
 Located on the former Army Motorcycle Training Area. In 1953 the

RAEME Army Motorcycle Club began using the facility, gaining permission to hold scramble race meetings (the forerunner of motocross). The track was officially licenced under the former NSW Speedway Act as Speedway No.7.

Many NSW State and National Championships were held there. The facility was very popular attracting 1,000s of spectators to events. It was the venue for Channels 9's first direct outside broadcast of an event.

It remained in operation until November 1970 when the Army closed it down.

- Location of former significant manufacturing entities including Cable Makers, Chiswell Furniture, and Standard Telephones and Cables (STC).
- The Chain of Ponds that stretched from the Georges River (from the former SME site) to Chipping Norton were a number of freshwater ponds that provided both Indigenous and European settlers with fresh water as the Georges River was tidal and the water quality brackish up until the Liverpool Weir was constructed in 1836.
- Liverpool Weir, (listed on the NSW State Heritage Register ID: 01804), was constructed by convicts in 1836 as the tidal limit of the Georges River. One of the first 'engineered' weirs built in the colony, it was designed by David Lennox, master mason, Superintendent of Bridges for the colony of NSW and Australia's first major bridge builder.
- Old Illawarra Road.
- Haigh and Son Wool Scour c1868.
- And more ...

RECOMMENDATION 1.2.1

That the historic reporting is reviewed to reflect the above-mentioned details for the Strarch Hangar, Titalka Park and the Moorebank Cultural Landscape.

1.3 Photographic Archival Recording

We note that a requirement of the SEARs in Part 10(a)(iii) *Historic Heritage* is that:

'Mitigation measures should include ... photographic archival recording ... of buildings on the site.'

Our enquiry to the Department of Planning and Environment as to whether or not this requirement has been completed was met with the following response (NSWP&E Email dated 8 November 2016):

'The Department of Planning and Environment is yet to receive this report'.

This situation is of great concern to us as many of the heritage items

listed in Proposal Non-Indigenous HIA at Table 4: Items in ERM (2013) Heritage Impact Assessment for MUR Project, page 19, have already been either partially demolished or relocated.

RECOMMENDATIONS 1.3.1

That this SEARs requirement is followed up, in particular the photographic archival recording of the 20 items listed in Proposal Non-Indigenous HIA at Table 4: Items in ERM (2013) Heritage Impact Assessment for MUR Project, page 19 being:

- 1. Burma -Thai Cross
- 2. Headstone of Lt Hodgson
- 3. Bell and bell tower
- 4. Hanging plant containers, Chapel
- 5. Baptismal font, Chapel
- 6. Altar chairs, Chapel
- 7. Three badges on front of Chapel
- 8. Sandstone in the walls of the Chapel and plaques
- 9. Clive Steele Memorial Gates
- 10. The service dog cemetery
- 11. The Commanding Officers' Walk
- 12. Australian Panel Bridge
- 13. Bailey Bridge
- 14. Heavy Girder Bridge
- 15. Steele Bridge
- 16. The RAE Memorial and Fountain
- 17. The Vietnam Veterans' Memorial and associated plagues
- 18. RAE Corps Museum wall and collection
- 19. CUST Hut
- 20. Strarch Hangar

1.3.2

That Archival Photographic Recording is also undertaken of the former Steele Barracks main entry guardhouse, in particular the walls constructed of sandstone from the former Keighran's Mill c1855 that was located at Bow Bowing, and the guardhouse lining bricks recycled from the former Pump House, Woolwich Docks.

1.3.3

That once received a copy is deposited for safe keeping with the Australian Army Museum of Military Engineering at Holsworthy.

1.4 Ownership: Moorebank Avenue

It is our understanding the Liverpool City Council owns that part of Moorebank Avenue between Anzac Road and the M5, and not RMS as stated in the Proposal Non-Indigenous HIA, p.8.

PART 2: HERITAGE INTERPRETATION STRATEGY

2.1 Telling the Whole Story

"THE PROPOSAL EIS
IMPLIES THAT
DURING, AND
ONWARDS OF, WWII
THAT THE SCHOOL OF
MILITARY
ENGINEERING WAS
THE SOLE OCCUPANT
OF THE MPW PROJECT
SITE."

As mention in the Section 1: *Relationship with MPE* the planned heritage interpretation is scattered across the two project sites, fragmenting the storytelling. Other limitations to such strategies are:

- It is very generic in nature and not tied to overarching themes, stories, places, views or buildings
- That as a consequence, the themes, stories, and people associated with the MPW site appear to have not been explored sufficiently to develop meaningful strategies
- Onsite interpretation elements have limited access and exposure to the general public. It seems the main exposure is directed towards the employees and casual visitors to the MPW site
- No audience development has apparently been undertaken
- Proposed interpretation elements such as external hoardings / fencing / sound wall could be largely ineffectual as Moorebank Avenue has limited parking opportunities. It would be very difficult for passersby travelling in motor vehicles to absorb information. It also attracts limited pedestrian / cycle traffic
- The proposed web-based site apparently has no permanent host, a limited timeframe (2 years), and is not interactive
- The Australian Army Museum of Military Engineering based at Holsworthy, whilst it is an exceptional facility is it only a Corps museum, and therefore does not tell the whole story of the Liverpool Field Training Area or the overarching Moorebank Cultural Landscape.

The Museum also does at times encounters access and security issues, and prospective visitors from the general public can not simply 'drop in' without prior arrangements being in place

- It is School of Military Engineering-centric. During WWII the Royal Australian Engineer Corps occupied the site, later establishing the School of Military Engineering. Whilst this is a significant event, it is only one thread of the layered history of the MPW Project site in respect to the wider Moorebank Cultural Landscape, in particular the former Liverpool Field Training Area and the Moorebank Subdivisions
- Archival recording of the area north of the former School of Military Engineering, (and within the MPW Project site) is very limited. This is very evident from the historical background summary for the Proposal site (EIS: Table 17-3, pps 472-473 Arcadis 2016) that only mentions 'Engineers at Moorebank' occupying the MPW Project site from WWII and onwards.

In doing so, the EIS has overlooked such land uses and military occupants as:

- The Liverpool Army Field Hospital constructed in November 1915 (and possibly the first purpose-built home hospital commissioned for the WWI efforts)
- The Army Motorcycle Training Area used for the training of

Despatch Riders and Military Police during WWII. This track was later licenced in 1953 under the former Speedway Act. It was the venue for Club, State and National Championships and the first Channel 9 outdoor TV broadcast

- The occupation of the Old Hospital Block by the Darwin Mobile Force (1938-39) prior to mobilisation, and the School of Artillery during WWII.
- Titalka Park
- Other Army Units and Departments, and their <u>forerunners</u>), associated to the MPW Project site, for example occupied the MPW Project site at some time, used services on the site (like the Area Officers' and Sergeants' Messes), were quartered on-site in Officers' and other ranks accommodation, or provided services:

Royal Australian Infantry Corps (Colonial to present)
Royal Australian Armoured Corps (WWII Training Facilities)
Royal Australian Regiment of Artillery (from Colonial times,
WWII Training Facilities)

Royal Australian Signal Corps (WWII Training Facilities) Royal Australian Corps of Transport

Royal Australian Army Service Corps - Supply and Logistics (disbanded)

Royal Australian Intelligence Corps (Provided trainers to SME etc)

Royal Australian Survey Corps (Raised from the Corps of RAE, disbanded then reverted back to RAE)

Royal Australian Army Chaplains Department (Provided ministering for all units, RAE Chapel)

Royal Australian Army Medical Corps (Provided medical services at the various Regimental Aid Posts (RAPs) and hospitals)

Royal Australian Army Nursing Corps (Provided staff to the hospitals and RAPs)

Royal Australian Army Dental Corps (Provided dental services at the various RAPs and hospitals)

Royal Australian Army Ordnance Corps (2 BOD (forerunner of DNSDC))

Royal Australian Army Education Corps (Provided trainers to the various schools)

Royal Australian Army Pay Corps (Raised from the Corps of RAE)

Royal Australian Electrical and Mechanical Engineers Australian Army Catering Corps (Provided catering staff to all the messes and field training operations)

Army Instructional Corps (Disbanded)

Royal Australian Corps of Military Police

Women's Royal Australian Army Corps (previously known as the Australian Women's Army Service - provided staff for all non-combat roles from 1939 to 1985

RECOMMENDATION 2.1.1

The scale and scope of the interpretation strategies needs to address and reflect the tangible and intangible values of the MPW and MPE sites in the broader context of the Moorebank Cultural Landscape, in particular the former Liverpool Field Training Area and the Moorebank Subdivisions.

2.2 Assigning Appropriate and Sufficient Significance

The high level of historical and social significance of the MPW and MPE Project sites, and their shared and connected history to the former Liverpool Field Training Area and the overarching Moorebank Cultural Landscape demands more recognition than through the *commemorative* naming of a handful of streets, buildings and rail bridge, and the incorporation of some components of the heritage structures into interpretative media as recommended as Mitigation Measures in the Proposal EIS. Examples of these strategies are:

'Continued commemoration of significant events and individuals ... through the naming of buildings, streets, and the rail bridge proposed for construction as part of the Project.'

(Proposal Report: REMM 13B page 172 Arcadis 2016)

'Interpretative commemoration utilising materials/elements from the building [Strarch Hangar and CUT Hut] ...

(Proposal Report: REMM 13M page 175 Arcadis 2016)

'... consideration of commemorative signage within the MPW site.' (Proposal EIS: Section 17.1.4 p.469 Arcadis 2016)

RECOMMENDATION 2.2.1

The scale and scope of the interpretation strategies needs to appropriately reflect the significance of the MPW and MPE Project sites in the context of the Liverpool Field Training Area and overarching Moorebank Cultural Landscape.

2.3 DEDICATED OUTDOOR INTERPRETATION CENTRE

The swell of interest created by the centenary of WWI, in particular in family history has brought the Liverpool Field Training Area into prominence, as it was the largest training facility in Australia with tens of thousands of servicemen passing through its gates on their way to serve overseas.

Similarly, thousands of Sappers have worked, trained and quartered at Steele Barracks.

"THERE IS THE
NECESSITY FOR A
SPECIAL PLACE WHERE
THE PUBLIC CAN
COMMEMORATE THE
PEOPLE, EVENTS AND
PLACES ASSOCIATED
WITH THE FORMER
LIVERPOOL FIELD
TRAINING AREA"

Advice we have been given is that there is no site available on the MPW Project site for a dedicated space for a small, centralised interpretative centre. It was indicated that smaller interpretative installations are to be 'scattered' throughout the MPW site.

We understand the same HIS process will be undertaken for the MPE site next year. We, therefore, wonder if any consideration has been given to a combined HIS as previous indicated as the original land acquired by the Commonwealth for the Liverpool Field Training Area in 1913 encompassed both sites. They have remained in Defence ownership for over 100 years before being transferred to facilitate the Moorebank Intermodal Terminal Project, and as mentioned previously they

essentially share a common and connected history.

The MPW and the MPE sites are two of the last remaining opportunities for the full story of the former Liverpool Field Training Area to be interpreted and articulated.

Its high level of significance demands that the interpretation approach:

- Captures all the tangible and non tangible values
- · Creates a sense of history and place
- Is a physical destination, a place for gatherings, with public access and toilet facilities, and parking
- Provides a place for contemplation and reflection
- Allows for further installation of memorials and interpretative signage
- Is a lasting legacy ... something that SIMTA and its partners, our former and current service personnel, and the wider community can be proud

Of note ... The Moorebank Heritage Group has compiled a list of approximately 45 enlisted men and Army staff who died in the Liverpool Field Training Area during WWI.

We would like to initiate a memorial to these men (some of whom never received a War Graves Commission headstone).

There is a similar memorial erected in recognition of the servicemen who died at the Ingleburn Camp during WWII, located at the Ingleburn Military Heritage Precinct.

RECOMMENDATIONS

2.3.1

That consideration is given to a single centralised interpretative centre located within the boundaries of the former Liverpool Field Training Area

2.3.2

That consultation is undertaken with the Liverpool City Council to investigate the possibility of a centralised outdoor interpretation centre being incorporated in the Georges River Master Planning process, (and including the possibility of Helles Park)

2.3.3

That if Recommendation 2.3.2 can not be achieved, that consideration is given to a combined interpretative strategy that includes both the MPW and MPE Project sites, located within either of these sites, and that incorporates relocation of part of the Strarch Hangar or CUST Hut if no other feasible option has been found for these structures

234

That as an alternative option the feasibility of Kitchener House as being an interpretative centre is investigated. (The property has been vacant for some time. Its condition is steadily deteriorating through the lack of basic maintenance and conservation works)

PART 3: KITCHENER HOUSE (ARPAFEELIE)	
3.1 Moorebank Avenue and Anzac Road Intersection Upgrade	RECOMMENDATION 3.1.1 That the existing eastern road alignment of Moorebank Avenue is maintained and that no impact is made to the lot size, curtilage and setting of Kitchener House.
3.2 Noise and Vibration Assessment	We note that at Appendix N Noise and Vibration Impacts of the Proposal EIS, that no specific construction and operational noise and vibration impacts were considered or assessed for Kitchener House. RECOMMENDATION 3.2.1 That the noise and vibration impacts associated with construction and operational activities are specifically assessed for Kitchener House.