

## Lauren Rose

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 17 December 2019 10:22 PM  
**To:** Joanne Glass; Lauren Rose  
**Subject:** MP10-0069-Mod-6 . Amendment to Increase Number of Patrons @ WBCT Etc

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

The White Bay Cruise Terminal has a long history of noise complaints, non-compliance and no enforcement of legislative noise condition requirements.

Page 8 of the Approval's OEMP states the following objectives:

Identify all appropriate environmental safeguards & demonstrate how they will be implemented on site.

**Manage site activities effectively**

**Enable adverse impacts on the environment to be minimised**

**Meet all requirements of relevant legislation & assist with ensuring compliance of the Project Approval**

**Monitor & manage environmental & social impacts**

None of the above objectives have been fulfilled or carried out to date. Nearly 7 years later since the Terminal opened.

Reference is made to pages 15 /16 of the Approval's OEMP re Noise Monitoring for Functions.

Community Information

**D14. The Proponent shall notify surrounding residents, Council & the Police 14 days prior to functions that are likely to be audible & will involve outdoor activities between 6pm & 11.30pm. The notice shall include the following:**

**(a) Date & nature of the event**

**(b) The hours of operation for the event & expected numbers**

**(c) Proposed out door activities**

**(d) The name & contact number for an appropriate venue representative. The representative must be on site for the entire event.**

**Residents have received no notification re any type of events since Brendon Elliott ( Community Engagement Manager) left Ports in 2015.**

In a letter addressed to residents dated 19/12/14 residents were advised by the Community Engagement Manager "not to raise concerns by phone after hours as they cannot be addressed immediately". Four years later and complaints still still can't be addressed after hours.

Nothing in this regard has changed for the past almost 7 years. The music can't be stopped or turned off , the PA announcements can't be stopped or made internally and the ship's engine noise can't be turned down or off. Consequently there is no compliance or enforcement . Ever.

On NYE 2018 cruise ships berthed at WBCT did play loud music. Residents rang to complain. There was no one at Ports to take complaints. According to the phone message residents received when they attempted to complain "Ports staff were on leave from 25/12/18 to 7/1/19".

Lack of Notification.

There was little to no notification in regard to Ports previous request for feedback for exemptions to the NMS for NYE & Australia Day 2019. To the best of my knowledge 3 residents received emails. Ports received over 50 objections to this proposal . There would have been a lot more objections with proper notification.

The Public Exhibition for this latest amendment to the Approval was published in the IWC on 20/11/19. It was on the 2nd last page of the publication. You would really have to know what you were looking for in order to locate this Public Exhibition Notice.

Residents haven't received an IWC for nearly 6 months now so most of them wouldn't have seen the Public Exhibition for increased patronage etc. In fact most residents know nothing about the proposed amendments unless they are on Jamie Parkers email list.

When Ports held their public consultation meetings at Clontarf Cottage re the NMS there was no mention of the Approval's existing noise conditions being changed let alone raised by 14dB.

In fact residents categorically told Ports that mitigating cruise ship noise was Carnival & Ports problem/responsibility and ships should be mitigated at source. Residents also stated they " did not want to be sealed in their homes and wanted to be able to open doors & windows & not be sealed in" as proposed by the Attenuation Program. So much for community consultation and Ports Logo of "Working with Communities. "

It is no coincidence that the latest amendments to the Approval & NMS come after some residents have had their properties attenuated. The majority of properties that have been attenuated have never made a noise complaint to Ports for various reasons. Most not wanting to go to the trouble of making a complaint and not having it resolved or just not wanting to deal with Ports. Residents know there is never any resolution to noise complaints and they will just be fobbed off.

I object strongly to this application. It is bad enough trying to sleep with the noise from 2 huge cruise ships berthed 100 metres from my front door for 3 days & 2 nights. Residents are already suffering sleep deprivation from cruise ship noise. Increasing noise levels & patronage at the Terminal will result in further noise & deterioration to our environment.

The Terminal has always been non-compliant ( that's why the noise levels were raised). And the site has never been managed in accordance with the Approval conditions since it opened in April 2013.

There should be no need for increased patronage & raised noise levels at the Terminal All noise from the Terminal travels around the entire bay and impacts houses in Grafton St, Wallace,Donnelly,Jane,Fawcett,Vincent & Ewenton Streets and beyond.

The average noise level for this area without a cruise ship or function is approximately 40-42dB.

The noise level of the local area has now been approved & raised 20-30dB. by Ports & Planning.. Again without notification to residents.

Do you think that is in line with the Approval's OEMP objectives. I don't.

Why was there no notification to residents regarding raising the noise levels by way of the NMS from 56dB to 70dB. Every cruise ship that berths at WBCT prior to 7am is in breach of the NMS requirement of 55dB.

The Approval's noise levels were never enforced neither are the NMS noise breaches.. Yet cruise ships continue to berth at WB non-compliant before 7am. and after 10pm.

Residents remain constantly under siege from cruise ships and Ports. Constant noise and constant torment with amendment after amendment. It appears to residents that Ports are allowed to do whatever they want to appease Carnival .Residents can see on a daily basis that cruise ships have all the privileges & residents none.

It should be noted that many residents lived here long before the cruise ships came. People chose to live here then because it was quiet.

This is not an entertainment precinct nor a tourist destination. If Ports want to have functions and loud music from cruise ships they should do it at the OPT not 100 metres from family homes.

I note there are no cruise ships booked at the OPT for NYE & Australia Day.

If there is no notification re venues (and no notification on Ports website) how can residents complain when there are no contact details.

About a month ago a venue took place at the Terminal. With all my windows & doors closed in the house you could still hear the thump, thump of the bass coming from the Terminal. Patrons were still on site at 12.40am and later.

Not compliant now nor will it be if the amendments are approved. Ports reiterated to Residents Agency Group as well as in their initial applications that they were not going to change the noise levels. And they obviously intend to judging by the application they have now made.

I strongly oppose this application with all of it's amendments. Again it will never be complied with or monitored.

These amendments will create excessive amounts of noise that will unfairly impact the peace & amenity of local residents.

And once again Ports require submissions a week before Xmas. Also not a coincidence.

  
Balmain Resident