

Level 6, 10 Valentine Avenue | Telephone: 61 2 9873 8500 | Parramatta NSW 2150 | Facsimile: 61 2 9873 8599

Locked Bag 5020 Parramatta NSW 2124 DX 8225 PARRAMATTA Facsimile: 61 2 9873 8599
heritage@heritage.nsw.gov.au

www.heritage.nsw.gov.au

File No: SF17/31991 Ref No: DOC17/333190

Mr Mick Fallon Senior Planner Transport Assessments Department of Planning and Environment GPO Box 39 SYDNEY NSW 2001

By email: Mick Fallon [Mick.Fallon@planning.nsw.gov.au]

Dear Mr Fallon

RE: NOTICE OF EXHIBITION - SYDNEY METRO CITY AND SOUTHWEST (CHATSWOOD TO SYDENHAM) (SS1 7400 MOD 2)

Thank you for inviting the Heritage Council of NSW (Heritage Council) to comment on and provide recommended conditions of approval for Modification 2 to the Sydney Metro City and Southwest (Chatswood to Sydenham) project (SSI 7400), to include Central Walk. I am responding as Delegate of the Heritage Council.

On 9 January 2017, the project was approved by the Minister for Planning. The project involves construction and operation of an underground rail line between Chatswood and Sydenham which will form part of the Sydney Metro network. Modification 2 to the existing approval relates to changes within the construction area of Central Station. Central Station precinct is listed on the State Heritage Register (SHR) as *Sydney Terminal and Central Railway Stations Group* (SHR No. 01255) and is located in the vicinity of a number of other SHR items.

The approved works at Central Station associated with Sydney Metro include:

- New underground metro platforms and concourse below the existing suburban rail service platforms 12, 13, 14 and 15, and associated vertical transport (lifts and escalators)
- Reinstatement of platforms 12, 13 and 14 over the Metro cavern
- Adjustments to the North Concourse and associated shortening of platforms 9 to 14 at the northern end, and a corresponding lengthening at the southern end
- New canopies over the reinstated platforms 12 to 14 and between the Central Electric Building and the northern end of platforms 12 to 14
- A permanent access bridge for maintenance vehicles from Regent Street to Sydney Yard, located between the suburban and intercity rail lines (referred to as the Sydney Yard Access Bridge).

The proposed modification (Central Walk) involves the addition of the following works.

- Construction of an east concourse an accessible connection to the suburban and Metro platforms at a common floor level to cater for the growing demands at the station now and into the future. The east concourse would connect the existing T4 Eastern Suburbs Line concourse with the future Metro concourse as well as new escalators and a lift to each of the aboveground suburban platforms
- Construction of an eastern entry a new entry/exit to Central Station and the east concourse from Chalmers Street. This would provide a direct interchange with light rail services. The eastern entry would be located at the site of the Bounce Hostel.
- Works to the aboveground suburban platform works a general upgrade of lighting, signage and finishes, removal of platform clutter and platform raising/re-levelling to provide a consistent height and finish across these platforms.

- Potential for a future western entry through the extension of the proposed east concourse to the west of the Metro platforms.
- Demolition of local heritage item Former "Metro Goldwyn Mayer" including interior listed on the Sydney LEP 2012 (also known as the 'Former MGM Building' or 'Bounce Hostel').

A review of the documentation associated with the Central Walk Modification Report was undertaken in July 2017 and included the following chapters.

- Chapter 6: Modification description operation
- Chapter 7: Modification description construction
- Chapter 11: Noise and vibration
- Chapter 14: Non-Aboriginal heritage
- Chapter 16: Landscape character and visual amenity
- Chapter 20: Cumulative impacts
- Chapter 21: Consolidated revised environmental mitigation measures
- Appendices B, D, E, F & G

It is noted that Modification 2 involves an extensive scope of additional works which would result in direct impacts to Country and Interstate platforms, Subway Passage Systems, the Devonshire Street Tunnel, Suburban platforms, Eastern Suburbs railway platforms and concourse, and the Chalmers Street entrance and environs. The Heritage Council has assessed the heritage impacts of Modification 2 and the cumulative impacts of the Metro project at Central Station. Based upon this review and previous comments, the following recommended conditions of approval are made:

General comments

The design information and heritage impact assessment submitted as part of the Modification Report <u>does not provide sufficient details of the proposed works</u> to enable a proper understanding of the impacts of the proposal on the State significant fabric and heritage significance of the *Sydney Terminal and Central Railway Stations Group*.

Further detailed design is required for various components of the proposal. The Sydney Metro Design Review Panel (DRP), in accordance with Condition of Approval E100 of the approved project, should be involved in all major changes to the heritage core of Central Station. The following matters should specifically be taken into their consideration:

- Detailed design to ensure that the distinct layers of historic development at Central Station remain legible and to retain the individual character of Sydney Terminal, Central Electric, the Sydney Yards, the ESR, and the Devonshire Street Tunnel precinct elements. Upgrade works to Platforms 16-23 should respond to the unique character of Central Electric and should not automatically attempt to transform this visual character through an adherence to the bold new design intent of the Metro Project.
- The proposed removal of buildings and staircases on platforms 16-23, and of balustrades, metal folding screens and additional stairs on platforms 16-19 should be carefully designed based on the significance of the elements. Fabric, visual and character impacts should be minimised as much as possible.
- A new combined services gantry is proposed south of Platforms 4/5. The project description notes that the design of the gantry would follow the Metro Design Guidelines, and services would be encased to minimise visual impacts. In addition, the gantry should be sized, sited and painted to reduce visual impacts as much as possible.
- The Devonshire concourse would be modified for installation of a new services shaft, reconfigured gate line, demolition of a services rooms, and partial removal and reinstatement of brick boundary walls on Chalmers Street. The detailed design of these works should minimise impacts on significant fabric related to the ESR and minimise visual impacts of new work. Heritage experts should oversee the removal and reinstatement of portions of the Chalmers Street wall.

A future western entry and extension of the proposed eastern concourse to the west to provide access from Lee St/Railway Square would require further approval and should be referred to the Heritage Council for comments in relation to potential physical and visual impacts on *Sydney*

Terminal and Central Railway Stations Group and other SHR items located in the broader vicinity. Similarly, any future overdevelopment to the proposed east entry site would require further approval and should be referred to the Heritage Council for comments in relation to potential visual impacts on Central Station and other heritage items in the vicinity.

Archaeological matters are addressed in Appendix F of the project Modification Report which is a specialist 'Addendum Archaeological Research Design – Central Walk' that has assessed the likelihood of the project modification area to contain historical archaeological 'relics'. Archaeological resources previously considered for the project include remains related to the Devonshire Street Cemetery (Low potential, but if found of State significance), the First and Second Sydney Railway Stations, and Third Railway Station early phases (Moderate potential, local significance); and early services such as drainage etc. (Low potential, local significance). A new item assessed to be of local significance and with high potential to survive is the remains of former residences in Railway Place below the former MGM Building and Chalmers Street.

The existing archaeological mitigation measures identified for the approved project would continue to apply to the project as proposed to be modified. If the Addendum to the Historical Archaeological Assessment and Research Design is implemented, then the project's impacts on archaeology would remain substantially the same and no further conditions of approval would be needed to manage the affected archaeology.

Recommended mitigation measures

The existing Non-Aboriginal heritage, landscape character and visual amenity, and noise and vibration mitigation measures identified for the approved project would continue to apply to the modified project. It is noted that the approved mitigation measures have been modified to incorporate archival recording and reporting (NAH1) and salvage of heritage fabric (NAH5) for the locally-listed *Former MGM building* (or 'Bounce Hostel') proposed to be demolished in the vicinity of Central Station. However, no additional mitigation measures for Central Station have been proposed in Chapter 21 of the Modification Report. Considering the additional impacts of the modification at Central Station and the cumulative impacts of the overall project, the following recommendations are made on the proposed mitigation measures:

- NAH5 Pending detailed design of the works proposed to the suburban platforms 16-23, the ESR concourse and Devonshire Street tunnel, any significant fabric proposed to be impacted or removed such as iron work, wall tiles and period furniture, should be identified, salvaged and stored for re-use at Central Station or in an appropriate heritage context.
- NAH9 Heritage interpretation at Central Station should convey the evolution of the site and the cumulative impacts on the station as a result of the Metro project. The Plan should focus on areas where heritage has been most impacted, and consider the new Eastern and Metro concourses where customer traffic will be high. The Plan should consider existing interpretation and provide a holistic approach. Where existing interpretation media will be impacted, these impacts should be mitigated by the new Plan.
- NAH11 All significant elements of Central Station which will not be impacted by the project should be adequately protected during the construction phase to prevent unforeseen physical impacts. Appropriate management measures should be provided in a detailed Temporary Protecting Plan for Central Station and the Railway Institute Building (SHR No. 01257) located in the vicinity.

In regard to landscape amenity and visual character, the proposed mitigation measures do not respond to the impacts of the modification. Therefore, the following additional mitigation measures are recommended:

- the gantry to carry the modified combined services route to the south of the intercity platforms should be avoided or designed to minimise visual impacts as much as possible.
- City of Sydney Council should be consulted during detailed design stage and invited to comment where urban character and local heritage items would be affected by the modified project and the demolition of the Former MGM Building ('Bounce Hostel').

The mitigation measures provided in Chapter 21 of the Modification Report as well as the mitigation measures stated above must be taken into consideration as a minimum to minimise the project's impacts on non-Aboriginal heritage, landscape character and visual amenity.

However, it must be re-iterated that the cumulative impacts of the approved project and modifications will result in major physical and visual impacts on the iconic Sydney Terminal and Central Railway Stations Group. The works have the potential to impact the legibility of historic layers and affect the place's State significance values. It is therefore crucial that these impacts are minimised through ongoing consultation with the Design Review Panel and independent heritage experts throughout the detailed design stage. In addition, the detailed designs should be made available to the Heritage Council of NSW on a regular basis for comment.

If you have any questions regarding the above matter please contact Emmanuelle Fayolle, Heritage Assessment Officer at the Heritage Division, Office of Environment and Heritage, on 02 8837 6319 or at Emmanuelle.Fayolle@environment.nsw.gov.au.

I thank you for the opportunity to provide comments on this proposal.

Yours sincerely

Tim Smith OAM

Director, Heritage Operations

Heritage Division

As Delegate of the NSW Heritage Council

14 August 2017