

"Budgalong"
Spicers Creek
Via Wellington, NSW, 2820
1st August 2012

Attention: James Archdale
Major Projects Assessment,
Department of Planning & Infrastructure,
GPO Box 39,
SYDNEY, NSW, 2001.
Fax (02) 9228 6455

Dear Sir,

Re: **BODANGORA WIND FARM MP 10_0157**

I, Mary Sutherland, am aware of the proposal to construct up to 33 wind turbines in the Bodangora area, approximately 20 kilometres north-east of Wellington NSW.

I give permission for my personal details to be released to the proponent, the public or any other government department.

I wish to lodge my **objection** to this wind turbine proposal because of the following:

Health Impacts – There is mounting evidence appearing recently both in Australia and from around the world in regards to health concerns with wind turbines. Wind companies have been getting away with these concerns because they (Wind companies including Infigen) say it has not been scientifically proven. Just because it is not proven by science does not mean there are not real health issues associated with wind turbines. In VIC and SA residents are having to leave their homes due to health issues arising from wind turbines nearby. This fact alone demands the full attention of the authorities responsible for allowing the development of wind farms. There should be a full investigation into these problems as a person has a right to live in his own home especially if they were established there first. In my opinion wind companies have been negligent in this area not disclosing the health issues associated with wind turbines. A recent wind farm development called the Stony Gap Wind Farm in SA proposed by TRU Energy was refused approval by the Regional Council of Goyder Development Assessment Panel because of community health concerns. It is all too late once a development has gone up and you discover health concerns. Evidence is out there now so I believe the Bodangora Wind Farm development should be stopped until a thorough investigation is done into the location of wind turbines around closely established communities like the Bodangora Wind Farm development. The distance to a neighbouring residence should be moved out to a minimum of 10 km for human health concerns and at least 2 km from a neighbouring boundary in farm land areas due to the potential impacts on livestock health.

Noise pollution both audible and infrasound – It is this audible noise and infrasound that is causing the health concerns. The sound audits done by wind companies including this development in question have not included infrasound as part of the audit process. This alone is grounds for re- assessment of all wind farm developments.

Visual Pollution and increasing turbine size – The visual impact for our farm is going to destroy the beautiful peaceful natural landscape that we live in. The closest turbines to our farm boundary are less than 1 km where there are three proposed turbines to be located

(Turbines 17, 18 and 19). There are three more proposed turbines behind this which will also be visual from the majority of our farm (turbines 12, 13 and 16). These turbines are located very close to our most productive farm land for lambing ewes. We run a prime lamb operation and the key profit driver to our business is lambing percentage. I believe this wind farm development poses an unacceptable risk to our productive farming operation. Profit margins in farming today are too narrow should lambing percentages fall below the current levels we are achieving.

Lack of community consultation and transparency – This alone should be grounds to stop the development because this has been handled very poorly by the proponent, Infigen Energy. Very few people in the Wellington community know anything about this proposed development. Due to such poor community consultation the concerned residents that neighbour the Bodangora Wind farm development, known as the Bodangora Wind Farm Awareness Group organised a community meeting on the 22/7/12 for all the public to come to. All wind farm developers were invited. Infigen Energy was in attendance but their knowledge on the development was very poor. There were about 200 people in attendance which is a reflection of the concerns and lack of community knowledge of the proposal. Both sides of the debate were heard but the majority that attended I believe were not in favour of the Bodangora Wind Farm development.

Contractual secrecy containing gag clauses – A common clause in contracts for the hosts of wind farm developments is a gag clause which restricts hosts being able to discuss the development with their neighbour. This is a fact I could not inflict on my neighbours. These hosts that neighbour us have been neighbours for over 50 years and now that friendship will be divided.

Destruction of flora and fauna – When Infigen were questioned at the Wellington public meeting on the 22/7/12 regarding wind turbines and large birds it was stated by Mr Upsom (Infigen) that all large birds will be a casualty of the wind farm development but on the up side all birds that fly below 30 metres will thrive unhindered by the larger prey. The Bodangora area is home to the protected Wedgetail Eagle and for Infigen to make this comment is unacceptable.

Devaluation of affected land and surrounding land – Devaluation of our farm being next door to the project is a huge concern to us. The question was raised at the public meeting on the 22/7/12 about property values and it was said that according to the Valuer General, property values were not affected. A property sale in the Bodangora village which neighbours the development has already fallen through (Bradley Rodgers) because the buyer became aware of the wind farm development. If properties don't sell because of the development then they don't affect the Valuer General's averages. If a private sale is made or the Proponent purchases the property in question then this does not affect Valuer General averages. If a property is harder to sell or sales fall through then that is the same effect as property devaluation which is unacceptable.

Safety issues relating to blade throw and fire dangers, and the inability to fight fires near turbines – The Bodangora Wind farm development is in a bushfire prone area and

building machines of this type in fire prone areas is an acceptable risk to human life and property. In regards to blade throw it is stated in section 15.2 of the EA that the chance of blade throw is 1:3000. This may sound rare odds but they are avoidable odds if there are no wind turbines. The development area includes part of the Spicers Creek Rural Fire Brigade. This brigade alone can have up to 5 fires during the summer caused by lightening strike either onto the ground, trees or power lines. As my husband is the RFS Captain for Spicers Creek I believe this development will stretch the already limited resources of the brigade and put volunteer brigade members at unnecessary risk having to enter host farms to fight fires whether they are wind turbine related or not.

Danger to low flying agricultural aircraft including restrictions to aerial fire support –

The Aerial Agricultural Association of Australia makes it quite clear in its policies that wind turbines and all associated structures are a direct threat to agricultural aircraft. This proposed wind farm is in the middle of a cropping and livestock area where aircraft are used for spraying and fertilizing. There are known turbulence issues out to 15 times the height of the barrier (AAAA Wind farm Policy) which pushes turbulence into neighbouring properties. The Bodangora Airport is used for passengers as well as aerial fertilizing and spraying. The wind farm is located in line to our farm and the preferred take off path to the north which will add ferrying time to aircraft. As mentioned earlier the region is a fire prone area and wind turbines will restrict the effective use of aerial support for fire fighting. This will be of particular concern when fire breaks (using retardant) need to be flown out by aircraft. Fire breaks are usually applied along ridge lines during a bushfire but with wind turbines situated on ridge lines this poses a direct threat to the successful use of air support.

Shadow Flicker – Our property is situated east of the proposed development so there will be shadow flicker issues over our most productive livestock country which may have issues with disturbing livestock.

Further damage to already dangerous country roads – Our roads in this area are some of the worst in NSW. I have done trips south to Melbourne and north to Brisbane and the roughest section of bitumen on the whole journey is between Wellington and Mudgee which will be used extensively during this development. Some of the loads to bring in wind turbine components weigh up to 160 tonnes. This will only add more pressure on our already fragile roads.

Destruction of historic, heritage and cultural areas – There are several historic sights within and surrounding the project area that I believe have not be considered adequately for protection for future generations. The Bodangora Village is just one good example. There is the Church and chimney stack and the Kaiser mine near by that would be susceptible to blasting and excessive traffic during construction.

Reduced agricultural productivity, in particular livestock production – This has already been covered above but I do have grave concerns for issues with our ewes lambing only one km away from turbines. An extract taken from an article written by Senator Dr Chris Back, Liberal Senator for Western Australia on 7th of July 2012 titled “Wind turbines: the untold story” explains some the Senators Backs findings.

“In animals the signs reported on farms in Australia are those of stress. Ewes and cows become very agitated and will leave their offspring in fits of panic if they are in the vicinity of operating turbines. These behaviours are demonstrated during lambing or calving respectively when the parturient animal is sufficiently disturbed to interrupt the birth process.

I have been presented with the autopsy results on 12 week old lambs with perforated ulcers of their stomachs and intestines. These are typical of lesions found at autopsy in zoological animals which were caught in the wild and confined in zoos. They are described as being stress-related. Cardiac pathology has been recorded in laboratory animals subjected experimentally to infrasound similar to that emitted by wind turbines. Blood biochemistry shows elevated cortisol levels seen in stress induced situations.”

If these findings are true then there needs to be more investigation into the impacts on livestock production before any wind farm development like the Bodangora Wind Farm, gets the go ahead in areas of livestock production. Livestock production is my life and we are very proud of the performance levels we are achieving. I believe the Bodangora Wind Farm will be a direct threat to our business.

Division of rural communities and alienation within families – What right does a wind farm company have to come into a community and cause a division between neighbours, families and friends that have been established for generations? That is exactly what has gone on here in our community around Wellington and the Bodangora area primarily due to the very poor community consultation process done by the proponent, Infigen Energy. If we had been consulted four years ago when Infigen were signing up hosts we would have been able to express our concerns to our neighbours. Regardless of the money involved with being a host to a wind farm I personally would never inflict these concerns on my neighbour. Perhaps if our neighbours were allowed to discuss this proposal with us four years ago we wouldn't be in the predicament we are in now.

Destruction of rural social infrastructure

Enforced tax payer subsidies to the wind turbine industry

Inefficient and intermittent electricity production

Inability to produce base load power

Inadequate or non-existent provision for decommissioning and removal of old turbines

It states in the EA that 'Budgalong' our property is an 'Involved Landowner' (12.2.2 table 17). When we asked Infigen about this they had no answer. We have never been contacted by Infigen about being an involved landowner in this project. They also only listed one of our three houses on the property in the EA. This is another one of the many failings in this EA

I therefore petition the Department of Planning & Infrastructure to disallow this proposal and look forward to your Department's favourable consideration of this submission.

Yours faithfully,

Mary Sutherland

.....

"Budgalong"
Spicers Creek
Via Wellington, NSW, 2820
1st August 2012

Attention: James Archdale
Major Projects Assessment,
Department of Planning & Infrastructure,
GPO Box 39,
SYDNEY, NSW, 2001.
Fax (02) 9228 6455

Dear Sir,

Re: **BODANGORA WIND FARM MP 10_0157**

I, Robert Sutherland, am aware of the proposal to construct up to 33 wind turbines in the Bodangora area, approximately 20 kilometres north-east of Wellington NSW.

I give permission for my personal details to be released to the proponent, the public or any other government department.

I wish to lodge my **objection** to this wind turbine proposal because of the following:

Health Impacts – There is mounting evidence appearing recently both in Australia and from around the world in regards to health concerns with wind turbines. Wind companies have been getting away with these concerns because they (Wind companies including Infigen) say it has not been scientifically proven. Just because it is not proven by science does not mean there are not real health issues associated with wind turbines. In VIC and SA residents are having to leave their homes due to health issues arising from wind turbines nearby. This fact alone demands the full attention of the authorities responsible for allowing the development of wind farms. There should be a full investigation into these problems as a person has a right to live in his own home especially if they were established there first. In my opinion wind companies have been negligent in this area not disclosing the health issues associated with wind turbines. A recent wind farm development called the Stony Gap Wind Farm in SA proposed by TRU Energy was refused approval by the Regional Council of Goyder Development Assessment Panel because of community health concerns. It is all too late once a development has gone up and you discover health concerns. Evidence is out there now so I believe the Bodangora Wind Farm development should be stopped until a thorough investigation is done into the location of wind turbines around closely established communities like the Bodangora Wind Farm development. The distance to a neighbouring residence should be moved out to a minimum of 10 km for human health concerns and at least 2 km from a neighbouring boundary in farm land areas due to the potential impacts on livestock health.

Noise pollution both audible and infrasound – It is this audible noise and infrasound that is causing the health concerns. The sound audits done by wind companies including this development in question have not included infrasound as part of the audit process. This alone is grounds for re- assessment of all wind farm developments.

Visual Pollution and increasing turbine size – The visual impact for our farm is going to destroy the beautiful peaceful natural landscape that we live in. The closest turbines to our farm boundary are less than 1 km where there are three proposed turbines to be located

(Turbines 17, 18 and 19). There are three more proposed turbines behind this which will also be visual from the majority of our farm (turbines 12, 13 and 16). These turbines are located very close to our most productive farm land for lambing ewes. We run a prime lamb operation and the key profit driver to our business is lambing percentage. I believe this wind farm development poses an unacceptable risk to our productive farming operation. Profit margins in farming today are too narrow should lambing percentages fall below the current levels we are achieving.

Lack of community consultation and transparency – This alone should be grounds to stop the development because this has been handled very poorly by the proponent, Infigen Energy. Very few people in the Wellington community know anything about this proposed development. Due to such poor community consultation the concerned residents that neighbour the Bodangora Wind farm development, known as the Bodangora Wind Farm Awareness Group organised a community meeting on the 22/7/12 for all the public to come to. All wind farm developers were invited. Infigen Energy was in attendance but their knowledge on the development was very poor. There were about 200 people in attendance which is a reflection of the concerns and lack of community knowledge of the proposal. Both sides of the debate were heard but the majority that attended I believe were not in favour of the Bodangora Wind Farm development.

Contractual secrecy containing gag clauses – A common clause in contracts for the hosts of wind farm developments is a gag clause which restricts hosts being able to discuss the development with their neighbour. This is a fact I could not inflict on my neighbours. These hosts that neighbour us have been neighbours for over 50 years and now that friendship will be divided.

Destruction of flora and fauna – When Infigen were questioned at the Wellington public meeting on the 22/7/12 regarding wind turbines and large birds it was stated by Mr Upsom (Infigen) that all large birds will be a casualty of the wind farm development but on the up side all birds that fly below 30 metres will thrive unhindered by the larger prey. The Bodangora area is home to the protected Wedgetail Eagle and for Infigen to make this comment is unacceptable.

Devaluation of affected land and surrounding land – Devaluation of our farm being next door to the project is a huge concern to us. The question was raised at the public meeting on the 22/7/12 about property values and it was said that according to the Valuer General, property values were not affected. A property sale in the Bodangora village which neighbours the development has already fallen through (Bradley Rodgers) because the buyer became aware of the wind farm development. If properties don't sell because of the development then they don't affect the Valuer General's averages. If a private sale is made or the Proponent purchases the property in question then this does not affect Valuer General averages. If a property is harder to sell or sales fall through then that is the same effect as property devaluation which is unacceptable.

Safety issues relating to blade throw and fire dangers, and the inability to fight fires near turbines – The Bodangora Wind farm development is in a bushfire prone area and

building machines of this type in fire prone areas is an acceptable risk to human life and property. In regards to blade throw it is stated in section 15.2 of the EA that the chance of blade throw is 1:3000. This may sound rare odds but they are avoidable odds if there are no wind turbines. The development area includes part of the Spicers Creek Rural Fire Brigade. This brigade alone can have up to 5 fires during the summer caused by lightening strike either onto the ground, trees or power lines. As the RFS Brigade Captain for Spicers Creek I believe this development will stretch the already limited resources of the brigade and put volunteer brigade members at unnecessary risk having to enter host farms to fight fires whether they are wind turbine related or not.

Danger to low flying agricultural aircraft including restrictions to aerial fire support –

The Aerial Agricultural Association of Australia makes it quite clear in its policies that wind turbines and all associated structures are a direct threat to agricultural aircraft. This proposed wind farm is in the middle of a cropping and livestock area where aircraft are used for spraying and fertilizing. There are known turbulence issues out to 15 times the height of the barrier (AAAA Wind farm Policy) which pushes turbulence into neighbouring properties. The Bodangora Airport is used for passengers as well as aerial fertilizing and spraying. The wind farm is located in line to our farm and the preferred take off path to the north which will add ferrying time to aircraft. As mentioned earlier the region is a fire prone area and wind turbines will restrict the effective use of aerial support for fire fighting. This will be of particular concern when fire breaks (using retardant) need to be flown out by aircraft. Fire breaks are usually applied along ridge lines during a bushfire but with wind turbines situated on ridge lines this poses a direct threat to the successful use of air support.

Shadow Flicker – Our property is situated east of the proposed development so there will be shadow flicker issues over our most productive livestock country which may have issues with disturbing livestock.

Further damage to already dangerous country roads – Our roads in this area are some of the worst in NSW. I have done trips south to Melbourne and north to Brisbane and the roughest section of bitumen on the whole journey is between Wellington and Mudgee which will be used extensively during this development. Some of the loads to bring in wind turbine components weigh up to 160 tonnes. This will only add more pressure on our already fragile roads.

Destruction of historic, heritage and cultural areas – There are several historic sights within and surrounding the project area that I believe have not be considered adequately for protection for future generations. The Bodangora Village is just one good example. There is the Church and chimney stack and the Kaiser mine near by that would be susceptible to blasting and excessive traffic during construction.

Reduced agricultural productivity, in particular livestock production – This has already been covered above but I do have grave concerns for issues with our ewes lambing only one km away from turbines. An extract taken from an article written by Senator Dr Chris Back, Liberal Senator for Western Australia on 7th of July 2012 titled “Wind turbines: the untold story” explains some the Senators Backs findings.

“In animals the signs reported on farms in Australia are those of stress. Ewes and cows become very agitated and will leave their offspring in fits of panic if they are in the vicinity of operating turbines. These behaviours are demonstrated during lambing or calving respectively when the parturient animal is sufficiently disturbed to interrupt the birth process.

I have been presented with the autopsy results on 12 week old lambs with perforated ulcers of their stomachs and intestines. These are typical of lesions found at autopsy in zoological animals which were caught in the wild and confined in zoos. They are described as being stress-related. Cardiac pathology has been recorded in laboratory animals subjected experimentally to infrasound similar to that emitted by wind turbines. Blood biochemistry shows elevated cortisol levels seen in stress induced situations.”

If these findings are true then there needs to be more investigation into the impacts on livestock production before any wind farm development like the Bodangora Wind Farm, gets the go ahead in areas of livestock production. Livestock production is my life and we are very proud of the performance levels we are achieving. I believe the Bodangora Wind Farm will be a direct threat to our business.

Division of rural communities and alienation within families – What right does a wind farm company have to come into a community and cause a division between neighbours, families and friends that have been established for generations? That is exactly what has gone on here in our community around Wellington and the Bodangora area primarily due to the very poor community consultation process done by the proponent, Infigen Energy. If we had been consulted four years ago when Infigen were signing up hosts we would have been able to express our concerns to our neighbours. Regardless of the money involved with being a host to a wind farm I personally would never inflict these concerns on my neighbour. Perhaps if our neighbours were allowed to discuss this proposal with us four years ago we wouldn't be in the predicament we are in now.

Destruction of rural social infrastructure

Enforced tax payer subsidies to the wind turbine industry

Inefficient and intermittent electricity production

Inability to produce base load power

Inadequate or non-existent provision for decommissioning and removal of old turbines

It states in the EA that 'Budgalong' our property is an 'Involved Landowner' (12.2.2 table 17). When we asked Infigen about this they had no answer. We have never been contacted by Infigen about being an involved landowner in this project. They also only listed one of our three houses on the property in the EA. This is another one of the many failings in this EA

I therefore petition the Department of Planning & Infrastructure to disallow this proposal and look forward to your Department's favourable consideration of this submission.

Yours faithfully,

Robert Sutherland

.....