

Our Reference : F2006/00713
9 July 2018

Ms Joanna Bakapanos
Team Leader – Industry Assessment
Department of Planning and Environment
GPO Box 39
SYDNEY NSW 2001

Attention : Ms Olivia Hirst

Dear Ms Bakapanos,

Re : Notification of Modification Request Orora Paper Mill, Matraville (MP05_0120 (Mod 8))

I refer to your letter dated requesting Council's comments on the abovementioned development for the Orora Paper Mill, Matraville. I note that the proposal involves the following:

- Section 4.55 (1A) modification to provide for staged demolition of the existing B7 Reel Store building and extension of the existing noise barrier along the north-eastern boundary of the site.

Council raises the following key issues that must be addressed prior to any final determination of the subject Modification Application:

Noise Barrier

Council notes that a previous Modification Application (Modification 2) was approved in 2010 for, among other things, construction of a 5m high permanent noise barrier along the northern side boundary and a 7m high noise barrier around the waste paper storage yard to attenuate noise impacts from the paper mill operation (Condition No. 10A). Subsequently, Modification Application (Modification 5) for the demolition of former mill Building B7 was approved in September 2015 which included relevant conditions of consent (10B and 10C) requiring a noise barrier to be constructed to mitigate operational noise to sensitive receivers within 9 months of demolition being completed. This was required as operational noise was effectively buffered by the B7 building. With the demolition of Building B7, Orora submitted temporary Noise Barrier Plan comprising a 146.4 metre-long, 12m high container noise barrier. This was approved by DPE in November 2015. This temporary noise barrier was meant to be a temporary barrier to offset the loss of the noise screening afforded by Building B7. The current Modification Application seeks to extend this temporary noise wall structure to meet its noise limit criteria post demolition of the B7 Reel Store building.

Council notes the proponent's argument that the justification for extending the noise wall following demolition of the B7 Reel Store building, and not before, is due to "space constraints". Council contends that this justification is questionable as the permanent noise wall approved under Modification 2 has a smaller footprint comprising a hebel structure with a width thickness of 150mm compared with the container barrier thickness of 2400mm.

Council asserts that the smaller nature of the permanent hebel noise barrier wall would allow it to be installed adjacent to the B7 Reel Store prior to its demolition so that it would be in place during and after the demolition of the B7 Reel Store building. This would also minimise any noise, dust or vibration impacts on neighbouring residential properties. This option is seen as preferable to the current proposal which would permit two thirds of the B7 reel storage building to be demolished before even the first half of the temporary noise barrier could be installed which Council understands would leave Orora in breach of their noise licensing requirements.

The installation of a permanent noise wall by Orora would also demonstrate to adjacent residents Orora's commitment to proactively addressing noise from their operations. Accordingly, Council would reaffirm its advice given on 16 April 2018 and detailed in Section 3.2 and Table 3 of the Statement of Environmental Effects for the current Modification Application (see page 16 under the Response/Actions Taken column of Table 3) which reads *"Imperative that the noise barrier be constructed upon as early as possible to minimise timeframe of temporary impact"*. Council maintains that constructing the permanent noise acoustic wall to a completed state should be acted upon to ensure that any noise impacts arising from the current proposal to demolish the B7 Reel building are minimised to the local residents. Furthermore, it is Council's position that the permanent noise barrier should be in place prior to demolition to assist with impacts arising from the demolition process and to avoid the lag time and gap of constructing the acoustic barrier afterwards. Constructing the permanent noise barrier first would also remove potential additional Impacts down the track once the decision to replace the proposed temporary noise wall is commenced.

Council notes the proponent's advice that the temporary shipping container acoustic barrier is intended to be in place until there is clarity about the future redevelopment of an adjacent block of land called the Hanger Block that is part of the overall Orora development site. The proponent contended that additional noise modelling relating to the Hanger Block would be required to further inform the technical requirements of any permanent noise wall. However, the Hanger Block has since been sold by Orora and is no longer in Orora's ownership. Additionally, the Hanger Block is approved for industrial use and currently under assessment for subdivision into lots. Council is concerned that the continuous development of Orora and the proposed development of the Hanger Block for industrial purposes (which will be closer to the residential premises) will cumulatively increase the noise in the area and potentially impact the nearest affected residents. Whilst Orora have specific noise criteria to comply with within their Environment Protection Licence (EPL), any development approval of the Hanger Block lots for industrial purposes may increase the noise impacts to nearby residents. If the DPE have not already considered noise impacts for the original subdivision of the Hanger Block from the Orora site, it is recommended that the DPE consider the cumulative noise impacts of both the Orora and Hanger Block sites as part of any further development applications or subdivision certificate applications for the land so as to address noise creep and possibly include an overall noise project criteria for the Hanger Block site. Council would emphasise the importance of obtaining this noise assessment for both the Orora site and the Hangar Block site prior to any sub-division approval for the Hangar Block site as the Hanger Block site is covered by the Port SEPP, that is, any future development post-subdivision is likely to be done under the Port SEPP CDC or exempt development whereby no opportunity for applying development conditions requiring noise assessments will be possible.

In summary, while Council supports the need to extend the existing temporary noise barrier to mitigate the noise impacts of the B7 Reel Store demolition, Council maintains that a permanent noise wall should first be installed in the location of the previously demolished Building B7 as per condition 10A approved in 2010 as part of modification 2 to the consent.

Acoustic reports, modelling and attenuation measures

Given the complexity of the site, proximity to residential receivers and detailed acoustic modelling coupled with predicted acoustic outcomes it is recommended the acoustic reports and relevant data be peer reviewed by a AAA acoustic consultant to ensure the modelling and predicted acoustic outcomes are validated prior to commencement. It is considered that a desktop peer review would suffice to ensure proposed acoustic measures for attenuation are satisfactory and to provide surety for all stakeholders including, but not limited to, the proponent.

Sleep Disturbance

The current operation on the site has approval for 24 hour operation. Historically, as seen with the operation of the overall Port industrial area, noise disturbances during the evening/night time become a major source of cumulative noise disturbance. It is considered that sleep disturbance criteria be validated to ensure compliance with relevant standards. In this regards, the operational procedure for Orora over the 24 hour period should be signed off by a suitably qualified acoustic consultant and the operations validated acoustically on completion during the required acoustic validation completion stage.

Council looks forward to the above-mentioned issues being addressed prior to any determination of the subject Modification application (MP05_0120 (Mod 8)). Should you have any queries, please contact David Ongkili, Council's Co-ordinator Strategic Planning, on email, david.ongkili@randwick.nsw.gov.au or by phone on 9093 6793.

Yours faithfully



Alan Bright
Manager - Strategic Planning