Gate 8, Allianz Stadium, 40-44 Driver Avenue Moore Park, NSW 2021

Your Reference Email 30<sup>th</sup> October 2024

Our Contact Daniel Fettell Daniel.fettell@mottmac.com 0433 326 543

Mott MacDonald 383 Kent Street Sydney NSW 2000 PO Box Q1678 QVB Sydney NSW 1230 Australia

T +61 (0)2 9098 6800 mottmac.com

#### Hunter Indoor Sports Centre – Technical Review

11<sup>th</sup> November 2024

Dear John and Deirdre,

The Hunter Indoor Sports Centre went on public exhibition on the 15<sup>th</sup> October 2024 as a State Significant Development (SSDA) as application number SSD-65595459.

This review examines the follow technical documents:

- Environmental Impact Statement HISC
- Appendix E Architectural Plans
- Appendix F Architectural Design Report
- Appendix L Civil Plans
- Appendix P Traffic Impact Assessment
- Appendix Q Green Travel Plan
- Appendix R Construction Traffic Management Plan
- Appendix S Traffic Event Management Plan
- Appendix CC Flood Risk Impact Assessment (1)
- Appendix OO Operation Management Plan
- Appendix RR SIDRA Intersection Modelling
- Appendix UU Flood Emergency Response Strategy.

The purpose of this document is to examine the exhibited reports against the comments raised exhibition and detail any potential remaining areas of concern.

This review has combined the review of the reports into two broad categories, focusing on impacts to existing and planned VenuesNSW operations.

- Traffic & Transport,
- Flooding & Stormwater Management.

The exhibited structure plan is shown overleaf in Figure 1.



# LEGEND



STAGE 1 WORKS

STAGE 2 WORKS



EXISTING TREE TO BE RETAINED

EXISTING TREE TO BE REMOVED

PROPOSED NEW TREES

Figure 1: Proposed Overall Site Plan

# 1. Traffic & Transport

There are a number of areas of key concern in regards to the Traffic & Transport approach to the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre that may impact on existing and planned operations.

#### Appendix P - Traffic Impact Assessment Items:

Item 1: The Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) Report Section 2.7 does not include reference to shuttle bus operation at the McDonald Jones Stadium (MJS) precinct.

During major events, bus operation occurs on Hunter Stadium game days, providing free shuttle bus services for 2 hours before kick-off and 30 minutes after full-time. The event shuttle buses use dedicated bus stops on Turton Rd. Timetables are published for each game, with lead-up services running on 15-to-20-minute headways on five shuttle bus lines serving major town centres, as follows:

- 1. Newcastle East via Newcastle CBD
- 2. Charlestown via Westfield Kotara
- 3. Glendale, via Cardiff Station
- 4. Wallsend Village
- 5. Mayfield via Waratah Station

**Recommendation:** We recommend that the shuttle bus operation be included in the TIA report including analysis of drop-off locations and analysis of any potential impacts to shuttle bus operations as a result of the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre.

**Item 2:** The proposed parking supply relies solely on overflow parking being available in the MJS precinct. This will not always be the case and the report also does not consider clashes of minor events at the MJS precinct.

<u>Recommendation</u>: Analysis of operation when overflow parking at MJS is not available and potential clashes during minor or major events at the MJS precinct.

**Item 3:** The TIA notes in section 2.2.2 that the broad area is part of the Broadmeadow Place Strategy, however no reference has been made to the released *Reimagining Broadmeadow: Package E – Transport* or the exhibited masterplan including future proposed changes to the Hunter Park Precinct.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the TIA include analysis on the *Reimagining Broadmeadow* project and associated land-use changes including consideration of the VISSIM microsimulation traffic model developed as a part of this process.

# Appendix S - Traffic Event Management Plan Items:

Item 1: The Traffic Event Management Plan states the following:

"As part of the project development, discussions were undertaken with representative from Venues NSW, who manage McDonald Jones Stadium. This was in response to recommendations by the City of Newcastle that opportunities to reduce on-site parking be investigated through the utilisation of the McDonald Jones Stadium carpark to cater for car parking demands, including fluctuations associated with peak events. It was confirmed that MJ Stadium has 25 dates annually associated with rugby league or football. These days are typically a Thursday evening, Friday evening, Saturday or Sunday. In addition, there are scheduled concerts and other events held throughout the year.

The scheduling of NBL1 dates and tournament dates shall therefore be planned to avoid these key commitments. This will reduce the cumulative impacts of the venues as well as enabling the HISC to make shared use of the parking in the precinct, including the 920 spaces associated with McDonald Jones Stadium for overflow parking."

It is noted that the discussions with VenuesNSW did not involve approval to utilise overflow parking in McDonald Jones Stadium and that the information around events was provisional in nature only. The Traffic Event Management Plan provides inadequate detail to effectively manage either a major event on their site or conflicting events within the precinct.

The assumptions that have made from referencing the MJS Major TMP matrix cannot be applied to the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre. The assessment undertaken in the MJS Major TMP matrix, considers only current conditions within the precinct, MJS operational management processes, volume of readily accessible parking, space available for managing pedestrian access and the through put rates of the turnstiles upon ingress and egress strategies to effectively remove guests from the MJS precinct.

The Hunter Indoor Sports Centre also has not considered the potential of conflicting events that don't require traffic management.

**Recommendation:** We recommend that a full assessment of these conditions is undertaken to then provide a more effective TMP. The current MJS TMP matrix has taken extensive consultation meetings with the Newcastle traffic planning committee, multiple events where the plan has been implemented, reviewed, adjusted and reimplemented over approx. 18 - 20 months and it is not appropriate to apply this matrix to the Hunter Park Indoor Sports Centre operations.

Having further assessment only should the situation of conflicting events occur is considered ineffective and has a high risk of impacting operations of the MJS Precinct noting it is very unlikely that 920 overflow spaces will be available.

**Item 2:** The mitigation measures contained within Table 1.1 below would only be possible with overflow parking arrangements with McDonald Jones Stadium which are not in place and do not consider the full range of events at the precinct.

Event	Pax	Overflow Parking Required	Bus Parking 1-2	g Required >2	Mitigation Measures
Combined School Carnival	500	No	On site	Highly Unlikely	Parking spaces within the carpark can be secured with cones to allow for the layover of extra buses.
NBL1	1700	Yes	On site	No	Implement overflow parking arrangements with MJ Stadium.
Full House Event eg touring team or grand final	2500	Yes	On site	No	Implement overflow parking arrangements with MJ Stadium

Table 1-1 Key Events and Traffic Management Measures

Many events cannot be accommodated within a shared asset model and new events outside the regular season national sport would be prioritised over access for basketball stadium events. As an example, during a concert event whereby the MJS south car park becomes back of house storage area, it has the potential to be unavailable for up to 10 days.

**Recommendation:** The Traffic Event Management Plan be updated reflecting either no or much reduced reliance on McDonald Jones Stadium and an updated assessment of events within the TMP, including strategies to accommodate any events during this time or any event that conflicts with a major event at the stadium that will eliminate all on and off-street parking from the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre planning.

Item 3: Section 3.3 of the Traffic Event Management Plan states:

"Discussions have been undertaken between Newcastle Basketball Association, Basketball NSW and Venues NSW. The schedule for events at the HISC will be determined following review of the schedule for McDonald Jones Stadium to ensure they do not coincide with main events at McDonald Jones Stadium.

Should events at HISC be scheduled that do coincide with other minor activities in the precinct, where cumulative patronage across the precinct increases to the next level (5,000-15,000), a TMP providing for Low Impacts should be implemented. This level of activity shall not be generated solely by the subject site. Based on Figure 3-1 above, this would see the inclusion of Shuttle Bus Services to enhance public transport access to the precinct. Should this be required this would be the subject of a separate TMP taking into consideration the specific requirements of the events and the venues involved."

It is noted that there have been no detailed discussions around cumulative impacts for the precinct or for cumulative future impacts around the implementation of the Broadmeadow Place Strategy.

Recommendations: It is considered likely that there will be events at HISC that coincide with other events at the McDonald Jones Stadium, the surrounding precinct and the Hockey Centre.

It is recommended that the Traffic Event Management Plan consider these now and prepare appropriate mitigations based on planned events from the wider area ensuring they do not impact on currently planned activities.

Item 4: Section 4.6 Parking of the Traffic Event Management Plan states the below:

*"Further there is access to 900+ parking spaces in McDonald Jones Stadium which shall be available on NBA1 Events as discussed with Venues NSW."* 

As discussed in other items, any access to MJS parking is dependent on availability and cannot be consistently relied upon given the parking requirements of MJS. No access would be available to MJS during coinciding events and additionally if a new event was to be schedule this would be prioritised over external access and wouldn't allow for access for a coinciding event at the basketball stadium.

**Recommendation:** The Traffic Event Management Plan be updated reflecting either no or much reduced reliance on McDonald Jones Stadium and an updated assessment of events within the TMP.

Item 5: Section 4.7 of the Traffic Event Management Plan states the below:

"From the assessment undertaken for the precinct as part of the MJ Stadium TMPs the impact of an event with less than 5,000 attendees is considered Minor with no requirements for road closures nor traffic control."

It is noted that the MJS matrix and impact assessment was developed solely for the MJS precinct and cannot be directly applied to the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre. The MJS matrix and impact assessment rely on specific internal precinct parking solutions and intake area to manage the volume of people and traffic, including pedestrian flows which would be different from the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre.

**Recommendation:** A specific impact assessment and matrix of mitigation controls should be required based on the operational realities of the basketball stadiums site and which does not reply on the McDonald Jones Stadium parking.

Item 6: General Traffic Event Management Plan comments:

- There are no TGS diagrams indicating traffic or pedestrian management processes (e.g. where are the proposed VMS board locations? If there is another major event coinciding what are the variations in planning to ensure pedestrian access is managed appropriately?
- MJS events aren't the only coinciding events that need to be considered. Hockey has a significant major event schedule that heavily impacts the on-street parking within the area. Monash road during regular weekend match days is also heavily used, which will impact the proposed use.

**<u>Recommendation</u>**: Further assessment is required for coinciding events and how their events can be managed without reliable access to MJS parking. This information will be critical to the re-assessment of all MJS TMP's especially high impact events such as a mid-week concert that has the potential to conflict with day-to-day operations, carnivals or major events.

## Appendix Q - Green Travel Plan

**Item 1:** Section 2.4 of the Green Travel plan shows on-street parking in the vicinity of the subject site with Figure 2-2.



Figure 2-2 On-street parking in the vicinity of the subject site (approx. 300m) NB not adjusted for bus stops

It is noted that Young Road, Womboin Road and Monash Roads all feature heavily as off-street parking and MJS TMP bus and ride share management for events at the precinct.

**Recommendation:** The Green Travel Plan, figure 2-2 and the resulting analysis be updated to show available parking during coinciding events which is much reduced from the above.

**Item 2:** Section 2.4.2 of the Green Travel plan indicates that there is a large off-street parking area associated with the McDonald Jones Stadium on Turton Road opposite the subject site providing for overflow parking (920 spaces) during major events.

**<u>Recommendation</u>**: This parking cannot be relied on for consistent use and it is recommended that the Green Travel Plan is updated to account for this.

**Item 3:** The Green Travel Plan Section 2.5 does not include reference to shuttle bus operation at the McDonald Jones Stadium (MJS) precinct or discuss the potentially negative impacts coinciding events will have on current shuttle bus operations.

Additionally, the proposed on-site bus access and taxi, uber and car sharing services have the potential to impact on current MJS operations.

**<u>Recommendation</u>**: The Green Travel Plan to be updated to include shuttle bus operations and mitigations to prevent any impacts to existing operations. Additionally on-site bus access and taxi, uber and car sharing arrangements be assessed to ensure no impact to existing MJS operations.

## Appendix R - Construction Traffic Management Plan

**Item 1:** The Construction Traffic Management Plan Section 2.5 and 2.3.5 do not include reference to shuttle bus operation at the McDonald Jones Stadium (MJS) precinct.

**Recommendation:** Construction Traffic Management Plan be updated to include reference and mitigations to any potential impacts to current operations.

**Item 2:** As a part of the construction works, lane closures and temporary construction methods are likely which will impact current VenuesNSW operations.

**<u>Recommendation</u>**: The Construction Traffic Management Plan consider mitigations and scheduling to prevent impact to existing MJS operations and events.

## **Appendix L - Civil Plans**

Item 1: Driveways shown within the civil plans have the potential to impact existing MJS traffic operations and shuttle bus pick-up/drop-off.

<u>**Recommendation:**</u> Civil plans be assessed against current shuttle bus and MJS TMP operations to ensure no impact to existing operations.

#### **Appendix OO - Operation Management Plan**

Item 1: Section 2.7.1 of the Operation Management Plan states:

"Discussions have been held between McDonald Jones Stadium Venue and HISC Project Team. Venues NSW communicated that between 60 – 70 days a year the carpark will not be available for shared parking, due to planned concert and sporting events. Based on these discussions, Venues NSW is supportive of sharing the McDonald Jones Stadium carpark for use for overflow with HISC on days that do not coincide with planned events. BANL will develop its schedule of large events in conjunction with Venues NSW."

**Recommendation:** It is noted that while some overflow parking may be available for certain times of the year, this cannot be relied upon and operational requirements of MJS may require full use of the carparking areas with little notice. It is noted that any MJS or internal precinct uses would be prioritised over parking for the basketball stadium and it would be difficult to "lock-in" days or periods in advance for overflow parking.

## 2. Flooding and Water Cycle Management Review

## Appendix CC - Flood Risk Impact Assessment

**Item 1:** The Flood Risk Management report does not consider the outcomes of the Place Strategy or the exhibited *Housing the Hunter: a plan for renewal at Broadmeadow – Flooding and Water Cycle Management Report* which indicates flood mitigation areas at Kentish Oval and Arthur Edden Oval.

**Recommendation:** The report include reference to the Flooding & Water Cycle Management Report, any cumulative impacts from the development and any opportunities to assist in solving broader precinct wide issues via additional flood storage.

# 3. Conclusion

The Hunter Indoor Sports Centre has the potential to impact significantly on existing MJS operations.

Key issues can be summarised as:

- Reliance on MJS for overflow parking which cannot be guaranteed,
- Incorrectly uses the MJS TMP mitigations around required traffic control measures and impacts without consideration of site specific requirements for the Hunter Indoor Sports Centre,
- Does not include mitigations for potential impacts on existing MJS shuttle bus operations,
- Does not consider the future Broadmeadow Place Strategy and planned future developments or transport changes,
- Has the opportunity for additional flood storage to mitigation precinct wide flood issues.

Should you require any further information, please don't hesitate to contact us on the details below.

Yours faithfully,

Daniel Fettell Civil Practice Lead - Australia +61 433 326 543 daniel.fettell@mottmac.com