

Response to:
Upgrades to Carlingford West Public School and Cumberland High School (SSD- 43065987)

Statement of Objection:

This is an **OBJECTION** to the **Carlingford West Public School and Cumberland High School (SSD- 43065987)** proposal.

Reasons for Objection:

Inaccuracy of dot point 4: Safe and efficient access for school and local community as published in Key Social Impact Statement from Environmental Impact Statement Document, (GYDE, 30 Oct 2022, P12).

The reported accommodation and consideration of the Safety and Social Impact to local community has been highlighted numerous times in a multitude of forums as the planning of this project has evolved. There have been many resident submissions as well as local community concerns expressed in public forums and meetings with key stakeholders and the results of such interactions thus far have been inaccurate and ill-informed responses from the bureaucratic agencies involved.

Still to be accurately and appropriately addressed and responded to are the following safety aspects of the development including projected student numbers, traffic flow and well-being/quality of life impact to the local community. Each will be addressed in more detail below.

1) Projected student numbers

The latest forecast population growth rates from year 2022 to year 2041 for Carlingford (as per Parramatta Council official website details) is 17.8% !!! Why is there a need for such a massive Cumberland High overdevelopment to cater for nearly 300% increase in enrolments .

Cumberland High School and hence our area in Carlingford is bearing burden of extraordinary population forecast growth (186%) in Telopea due to the lack of high school infrastructure in the proposed Precinct Redevelopment.

The EIS for the Telopea development clearly indicated an increased high school children population in Telopea of approx 700. This would be an entire High School cohort with an average year group size of approximately 120 students. Why not build the school in the area of need. This would decrease environmental impact with less travel required and build local community links.

In relation to CWPS, the local state member for Parramatta (Geoff Lee) stated in June this year, that at least 50% of their enrolments were from outside the catchment area - so if only 50% of the current 1900 CWPS students are local then allowing for say 20% increase in local population a school to accommodate 1140 students is required not 1,610. This would result in a school with a considerably smaller environmental footprint and not so unsympathetic to the local residential architecture.

2) Traffic

Increased and actual volume of traffic

While it is evident that there has been consideration given to the eastern access of the school via Felton Road, there has been no adequate solution provided for the western access. In addition to the current issues of: student safety, resident access to their homes at pick up time and emergency vehicle access during pick up time; a staff car park is proposed to be accessed via Felton Road west further increasing the traffic on the existing residential road. With a prediction of 90 CWPS staff and 100% of them indicating that their current mode of transport is private car, that adds 90 additional cars making use of Felton Rd West entrance to park. Should the proposed car park not hold all 90 cars and the teachers park on the road, this will create further traffic congestion. The local area has only been determined to have the capacity to hold 303 car parking spaces (P22 of the Planning projects doc).

Predicted student numbers for CWPS (P10 planning projects doc on portal NSW) is 1610 students.

Based on number the of responses to the CWPS Travel Mode Survey which was determined to have a response rate that was a representative sample, the following information can be used to describe volume of traffic flow. 79.6% of students use private transport in the morning, 45.9% reported they are dropped at Felton Rd West gate. This is a kiss and drop that uses a public road to facilitate this process. The multiplication of these figures can be used to determine that 617 additional cars doing "school drop offs" use the residential streets at the west end of Felton road (this does not include the arrival and departure of the 90 staff cars). The parking assessment of surrounding streets at the West end of the school total 376 parking spaces (P22 of the planning project doc). Thus it is evident from these figures, which come directly from the reports, that even if parents did park and walk to collect their children from the school gate there is not adequate parking for half of the volume of "school drop offs" that this local residential road must accommodate.

In reality these parents do not park and walk, they double park illegally to wait for their child to emerge, blocking the road and creating a safety hazard for drivers and pedestrians.

Resident access to home during pick up and drop off time

As a result of this illegal practice local residents are forced change their travel plans between 8:45-9:30am (when 86.4% of the student population of CWPS are arriving by private transport P47) and 3:00-4:00pm (when 82.9% of the student population leave the school P47). We have two newly licensed teenage drivers in our family who have been forbidden to leave or return to our property during school "drop off" and "pick up" times because of the high probability of an accident. This probability is further increased due to double and illegal parking in narrow streets and on blind corners, forcing residents to drive on the wrong side of the road into oncoming traffic. The impact of the No Stopping signage that has been recently added has only moved the congestion further up our cul-de-sac and other narrow residential streets, with CWPS parents now parking across

corners of streets blocking traffic going both ways. Nothing will stop the stupidity and laziness of the parents who could not bother to legally park their car and walk to the school gate. The surrounding streets become a car park from 3:00pm in the afternoon with parents treating the public road as a personal turning circle. Cars are double parked waiting for their child to emerge from the school gate, as other children play Russian Roulette, dodging out between a parked car and the car doubled parked (usually a four-wheel drive with no visibility for unsuspecting drivers of a small child about to dash out) in order to cross the road.

To gain access to their homes, local residents are forced to drive on the wrong side of the road, around double-parked cars in clear breach of road rules and safety. The traffic situation has essentially created a "no-go" zone for local residents who must time their exit or entry to their homes to suit the complete disregard of the law by the parents at Carlingford West Public. Local residents should not be held prisoner to the laziness and complete lack of regard for the law by parents at CWPS. My family and neighbours have made countless calls to Castle Hill and Parramatta Police whom have re-directed us to the rangers to record our complaints. On days when traffic wardens are present, residents are able to access their homes in a safe and a legally compliant manner. This would logically lead to the assumption that daily attendance of rangers or road safety cameras need to be installed and fines need to be issued for offenders before there is a serious incident resulting in loss of life.

As can be seen from the number in the afore mentioned paragraph, any attempt to manage this volume of traffic even with a turning circle is going to be futile. The traffic infrastructure of "local residential streets" which are narrow and have cars parked on either side will never be able to accommodate the volume of cars/buses predicted.

Street Parking Availability and Reality

There are a number of errors pertaining to local parking availability on P22 of Cumberland Cluster Transport Accessibility Impact Assessment 28/10/22 section 2.4 regarding on-street parking as the number car park spaces (Figure 2.5) indicated in the image (Figure 2.4) provided are ill-conceived.

The narrow streets surrounding the school indicate in the image that a car could be parked on each side of the road. The streets are only three cars wide- two cars park allows one moving car to travel down the centre, hence creating traffic flow in only one direction. Many times I have had to reverse back out of a street to the nearest cross road to allow the car coming the other way through. This is further complicated if cars are following behind you and a multitude of cars may have to reverse . THIS IS A VERY GRAVE SAFETY HAZZARD FOR PEDESTRAINS AND PARENTS TRYING TO LOAD CHILDREN INTO THE CARS PARKED ON EITHER SIDE OF THE NARROW STREET.

See image below:



The following narrow streets create above scenario:

Adrian Court,
Edinburgh Ave,
Sandringham Dr,
Ferndale Ave,
Empire Circuit,
Constitution Circuit,
Barons Av,
Billyard Pl

Plans indicate that 376 parking spaces are available, in reality one side of each street should be NO PARKING to allow two-way traffic flow. This equates to 188 car park spaces in reality.

Emergency service access

Information provided by local emergency services estimates the access time for an ambulance, police or fire vehicle to local residents during school pickup or drop off time exceeds 54 minutes. A trip that would usually take 7 minutes (Daily Telegraph, 21 Sept 2022, Calls to solve Carlingford West Traffic Problem). Should a local resident require health or emergency care during pickup time the results could be fatal or that of complete devastation.

3) Health and Well-being issues for local residents:

The Visual Impact Statement of adjacent properties (on Adrian Court boundary) rates the impact as **HIGH** (P11, VIA document, View 3) for residences on that boundary with DOMINANT impact determined (P7 VIA document). All of the issues below have been previously submitted to various stakeholders and met with inappropriate or inaccurate responses.

As per the Parramatta Council Guidelines below, there are a number of concerns
(From Parramatta Development Control Plan Section 3.3.3 Visual and Acoustic Design
Principals Section)

P.1 Development should be located, orientated and designed to maximise visual and acoustic privacy between buildings.

P.2 The internal layout of buildings is to be designed to minimise overlooking of living areas, private open spaces and adjoining school yards.

P.3 Building elements such as balconies and decks are to be designed to minimise overlooking of living areas, private open spaces and adjoining school yards.

P.4 The windows of dwellings are to be located so they do not provide direct and close views into the windows of other dwellings, particularly those of living areas.

P.5 The windows of dwellings are to be located and designed so as to reduce the transmission of noise. Figure 3.3.3.2 Vertical separation

P.6 Building design elements should be used to increase visual and acoustic privacy such as recessed balconies and/or vertical fins between adjacent balconies, oblique windows, fencing, vegetation and louvres and pergolas which limit overlooking of lower dwellings, private open space and adjoining school yards.

P.7 The internal layout of buildings is to be designed so as to reduce the effects of noise transmission. For example, dwellings with common party walls should locate noise generating rooms such as living rooms adjacent the noise generating rooms of other dwellings.

P.8 Appropriate building materials should be used to provide acoustic privacy.

P.9 Consideration is to be given to the relationship between residential and non-residential components of mixed use development with regard to noise attenuation and privacy.

P.10 The ground floor level (finished) of any building should not exceed 500mm.

Privacy

PRIVACY - Our personal privacy will be majorly impacted. We originally had a view of the single-story hall (built recently). This building had with no windows which faced our house with the exception of a window in the canteen store room. Some level of privacy was provided by sporadic mature trees between our home and the hall. This situation was acceptable as there are not hundreds of students peering through classroom windows into our backyard nor the bedrooms located at the back of our home. The proposed level of exposure of our backyard will mean that our back bedrooms would be in direct line-of-sight of classrooms as well as the spa, which was purchased for medical and therapeutic purposes. Under the new building proposal our spa will not be able to be used during hours of school operation, as sitting in swimming attire in full view of students is a breach of my family's privacy.

Windows

Initial communication indicated that the building would be situated so that no windows would be directly faced into properties on the western boundary of the school. However, subsequent plans released depicted this to be altered. Clarification of this was confirmed by Elizabeth Henningham (Community Engagement Manager School Infrastructure) as shown below in a reply on to an email of concern on 21st September 2022

Hi Tracey and David,

Following up on my email below, I have heard back from the architects on whether there will be windows on the western sides of proposed buildings Z and Y, and to confirm what is meant by a north south orientation. They have confirmed that joinery walls containing AV units and whiteboards are placed on the northern and southern walls of each general learning spaces. The design intent is that these walls will be used by teachers for demonstrations and learning activities and therefore be the prominent orientation for students. Windows are located on the western façade. This is a requirement to ensure natural daylight levels are achieved and so that the space can be naturally ventilated.

Best wishes,
Liz

Elizabeth Henningham (she/her)
Community Engagement Manager

Landscaping proposal

The proposal of trees to mitigate the viewing of bedrooms and private living space as per the VIA report P81, will still allow for high exposure of our property to view from the proposed building (see images below). To be noted: original plans for the development had buildings located towards the centre of the school (this being a much more acceptable solution) in subsequent versions buildings have now been pushed to the outer boundaries, resulting in maximum impact on local community residents.

View 3 - 7 Adrian Ct/ site western boundary



Figure 37: View 3 - 7 Adrian Ct/ site western boundary (Source: Woods Bagot)

As can be seen from the images the current foliage from the existing mature trees will require additional landscaping on our property by the planting of hedges to provide adequate screening and privacy of our living, bedroom and recreation area. Screening landscaping will not provide immediate coverage and time will be required from them to reach maturity to provide adequate privacy. In the mean-time leaving our privacy severely compromised and at our personal monetary expense. The planting of screening plants not only incurs initial purchase cost but will require ongoing maintenance. Residents should be reimbursed for any cost incurred to improve their privacy.

Classroom orientation

Response from the Community Engagement Officer (shown above) indicates white boards and AV equipment will be located on the northern and southern walls. For resident privacy these would be much better placed on the eastern wall which would result in students backs facing neighbouring residences. **Windows should have fixed louvers (From Parramatta Development Control Plan Section 3.3.3 Visual and Acoustic Design Principals Section) installed to allow light into classrooms but block views from inside the classroom into adjacent properties alternatively, high horizontal windows above**

student eye level have been used in other buildings to allow light to enter rooms while still maintaining the privacy of surrounding residents. The walls of these buildings should be living green walls to minimise visual impact of hard surfaces for residents and improve energy efficiency.

Light on neighbouring properties

Residential building restriction heights of 9 metres have been ignored, with the most recent plans indicating building heights on our back-fence are 13+ metres. These building heights proposed cast considerable shadows onto neighbouring properties as provided in the VIA report during winter, limit the sunlight into neighbouring back yards which will have a significant impact on vegetation growth.

Publicity releases indicate that the school site will be utilised outside of school hours by the public. The impact of this will extend the privacy impact for adjacent residents potentially to evenings. This will mean our outdoor recreation area (ie spa and BBQ area) bedrooms and living areas will be exposed and visible to members of the public using the school facility. This also carries with it an increased security threat.

Extended hours of use will also necessitated lighting from the buildings (Building Y) at night will directly impact our the living space area and the local nocturnal wildlife. This will also require safety lighting in the car park that directly adjoins our property.

Vehicle pollution and noise

Vehicle pollution, noise and lighting from the car park that will directly adjoin our property is also a major concern for the health of the adults and children of our household as well as the possums which are active in the trees that the school is proposing will provide all of the screening. I once again direct you to the images above, from your own report that clearly evidence a HIGH impact (as stated in your report) on the visual quality from our property. There has clearly been minimal consideration given to measures that could be put in place to maintain the current quality of life for the neighbours of the school. Additional measures need to be considered for this proposal to be deemed acceptable.

Property value

Should be above listed visual impact conditions not be adequately addressed, the adjacent well-being of the adjacent residents is in serious danger as there is a clear devaluing of our properties due to the imposing nature of the buildings which will deter any prospective buyers who value privacy. Our properties will not recover from this impingement on privacy. Advice from a local real-estate agent has estimated the devaluation of properties on the boundaries of the school at between \$150,000-\$200,000.

In closing the residents whose properties are adjacent to the school have existed in harmony with the school community for many decades. Many of the residents have had children who attend or have attended the school. The school and its executive have in the

past been respectful and considerate and together with the local community have maintained a positive relationship. Local residents are regularly called upon by the school during non-term time to watch over the school and contact police should issues arise to ensure the protection of school property. We have personally enacted this on a number of occasions when there was evidence of suspicious activity within the school grounds. Residents purchased properties adjacent to a school of reasonable size for the local residential streets, the school had a considered visual impact and harmony with the local environment; this is now being replaced with no consideration of size or visual impact. Hence it is a huge disappointment that this project has paid such little respect to the local community, as they have voiced their fair and reasonable concerns about safety and well-being for both the local residents and the students of CWPS.

Alternative solutions via satellite schools at campuses with declining numbers have been put forward as futuristic school models by local community members, but it would appear the Schools NSW are not interested in shifting schools models towards the future. They would much rather continue to operate under an outdated single school campus model that is decades old. Did Schools NSW learn nothing from the CoVid experience? Where is the adaptability and resilience and creation of forward thinking future global citizens?- they are definitely non-existent in School NSW planning offices that is certain. Perhaps a visit the Schools Victoria or South Australia may open your eyes and mind to satellite schools campus model.

Experience with this project has seen the local community treated with complete disregard as they are forced to compromise their quality of life, safety and the value of their property for increased student numbers many of whom are “out-of-area”. As voiced at one of our local resident meetings “local residents maintain the right to vote for local government again in 2023”. This result of this election will not bode well for the current government who have green lighted a development which has changed significantly from its first inception and has been undertaken with a complete lack of regard for the LOCAL VOTING COMMUNITY.

Declaration of reportable political donations made in the last two years:

As per the guidelines provided at <https://www.planning.nsw.gov.au/Assess-and-Regulate/Development-Assessment/Planning-Approval-Pathways/Donations-and-Gift-Disclosure>

I have not made any political donations or gifts ever.

Statement indicating your acknowledgement of department disclaimer and declaration

I acknowledge the departmental