

Planning and Assessment
Department of Planning, Industry and Environment
Locked Bag 5022
Parramatta NSW 2124

SUBMISSION

Name B Wannan

Address Lue Station, Lue NSW 2850

Applicant – Bowdens Silver Pty Limited - Application Number - SSD-5765

Application – Bowdens Silver Mine

I object to the BOWDENS SILVER MINE proposal, the TRANSMISSION LINE AMENDED REPORT, the SUBMISSION REPORT, the WATER SUPPLY AMENDMENT REPORT and the TRANSMISSION LINE SUBMISSION REPORT

I declare I have not made a reportable political donation in the previous 2 years.

I object to

- The construction of a lead mine-site 2 kms from a village with over 95 residences.
- The relocation of Bayswater to Mount Piper 500 kV transmission line
- The construction of a new Power Supply from Bylong Valley Way to Lue
- The construction of a Tailings Storage Facility near Lawsons Creek
- The upgrade and relocation and construction of Maloneys Road
- The closure of Maloneys Road through the mine-site
- The diversion of waterways and creeks
- The lack of proper rehabilitation of the mine-site and mine-pit and other components
- Unreliable water supply
- Lack of proper financial analysis of the mine closure due to lack of water or excessive pollution
- Lack of acceptable assessment or acknowledgement of Acid Mine Drainage
- Lack of acceptable assessment or acknowledgement of the Earthquake Hazard Zone
- Lack of and resistance to produce a Water Management Plan
- Disrespectful and incorrect and not corrected responses to submissions

I object to the proposal due to the significant impacts of noise, vibration, blasting, visibility, dust, lead poisoning, odour, excessive clearing of endangered woodland and animal habitat, drilling and mining into the water table, drilling and mining in a sensitive area, using excessive quantities of water, increased heavy vehicles, mining in an Earthquake Hazard Zone, volatility of silver price, lengthy EIS process, no offer of compensation, acid mine drainage and ground, water, air, visual, light and noise pollution.

The result of the impacts are loss of amenity, loss of village life, loss of views, loss of quiet countryside, bushland and homes, damage and contamination to water table, ground water and surface water, reduced ground and surface water, increased traffic in Lue village with trucks, additional contractors and employees travelling to their homes in Kandos and Rylstone and Sydney, increased traffic and wide loads on Lue Road, destruction to native flora and fauna, damage to historical and cultural artefacts and locations and the lack of genuine and effective consultation with all Aboriginal groups, damage to health and well-being and amenity, job losses and the lack of job opportunities for local young people, close proximity to Windamere Dam, location of the Tailings

Dam on a fault line, incompatibility with existing land use and businesses and homes, a legacy of polluted and damaged land and waterways and concerns that increased activity and the processing of mined materials may affect climate change.

The following table lists the benefits of the mine and some of the failures and outcomes. This is not a complete list.

I object to the proposal because there are no benefits to Lue or the environment.

	Benefit	Failure/outcome
Environment	No	Catastrophic Failure
Aboriginal Heritage	No	Catastrophic
Noise	No	Constant – 24/7
Koalas	No	Catastrophic Failure
Landcare	No	Catastrophic Failure
Visual	No	Failure Havilah to Monivae
Light	No	Failure
Jobs	At the expense of other industries	Failure in Lue as tourism, farming, retirees
Air Quality	No	Catastrophic Fatal
Water Quality	No	Catastrophic
Water Quantity	No	Catastrophic
Earthquake	No	Catastrophic
Flood	No	Catastrophic
Road users	No	Fatal
Health	No	Fatal
MWRC	\$3mil	Cost of Road destruction, water supply failure, corruption
NSW Govt	Doubtful royalties	Cost of Water, roads, environment
Feds	Tax losses	Cost to Environment, health
Community	Sponsorships in Mudgee	Failure in Lue
RFS	No	Failure
Tailings Dam	No	Catastrophic failure
Waste Rock Embankment	No	Failure significant
500Kv Transmission Line	No	Visual failure significant
Mudgee	Jobs	Travel on Lue road - fatal
Rylstone	Jobs	Travel on Lue road - fatal
Kandos	No jobs	Failure
Tourism		Failure
Shareholders		Failure
Operation		24/7 – failure
Total	Jobs, royalties, sponsorships = 5 wins	Everything else = 27 plus fails

Water Supply at Lue

Lue is an interesting place - water wise.

It is located

- at the very top of Lawsons Creek,
- it is located at the “confluence” of the Lachlan Fold Aquifer and the Sydney Basin Aquifer
- the aquifers and the groundwater are connected. It has been shown in reports but it is obvious as Lue’s rainfall alone could not sustain the flow in Lawsons Creek
- there are many springs in the hills to the north, south, west and east of Lue
- the hills to the north of Lue are in fact the Great Dividing Range
- in places the groundwater is very close to the surface
- when it rains new springs flow out of the ground in the hills and elsewhere (in fact part of our property is named the Springs)

All reports including Jacobs for Bowdens note that the water supply in and around Lue will be effected and depleted by the mine operation.

Jacobs states that the effects will not be significant. If in a scale of 1-10 significant is probably 10 or generously even 5, surely significant doesn’t mean less than that.... Then the effects on the ground and surface water at and around Lue will be slightly less than significant and definitely not insignificant.

It is, as one submitter stated, “beyond belief” that one operation could take water that is the lifeblood to others. This water they take cannot ever be returned to the system. Almost 2000 megalitres every year for 16.5 years is 33,000 megalitres as well as the water falling on the site and flowing into the pit forever. That’s a lot of water. That really is beyond belief. The greed of Bowdens and their cronies is beyond the comprehension of a reasonable person. And it is doubtful that existing NSW laws and regulations could regulate this kind of behavior. **It should not be left to the DPE – Water and the EPA to police these water users.**

In comparison to the predicted 33,000 megalitre water take by Bowdens the capacity of Windamere Dam is 368,120 megalitres. At Lue Bowdens propose to have one tenth of the capacity of Windamere Dam stored on a small no release mine site, refilling and evaporating contaminated water forever. Not for the life of the mine but forever.

The Water Sharing Plan and the DPE- Water are clear that every user has an equal right to water.

Not all water users are licensed, nor are they required to be.

- Those on the creek have riparian rights to stock and domestic water,
- those with very old bores are not legally required to register them,
- unlicensed farm dams and bores are permitted and
- where the water table is close to the surface users are able to grow crops making use of that water.

All these forms of water use are seen around Lue and in fact on the full length of Lawsons Creek along with some licensed irrigation.

Somewhere in this process the rights of those users and the environment have been disregarded.

The SEARs was issued with the expectation that one of the main components of this mine was an external water supply. It was obvious to landowners and others that this proposal would never be realised.

Bowdens have said for many years that they have enough water licenses to supply their mine site and keep the water within the small mine site area. Well... they have access to almost half the water in the state via the aquifers which lie under their site. These licenses were not secured prior to the EIS, as we were led to

believe, and are not confirmed as they are in a recent release by the department. As has been said before – there is no evidence that Bowdens hold these licenses or entitlements and they do not have any water approvals to pump this water.

There are now enough reports and evidence to support the conclusion that Bowdens will take water at the expense of other users. In fact they say themselves that other water users will be protected by the law. I presume that means they will happily pay the fines to the regulator when they pump more water than they should. Why should the regulator or the NSW Government be required to police these invaders? Bowdens might as well, like Putin, send the tanks in to destroy Lue. It will be the same end result.

- There has been no assessment of predicted effects to downstream users in both quantity and quality of water.
- There has been no assessment of the consequences of Tailings Dam failure to other users
- There has been no assessment of any water storage failures other than a simple no effect or it won't happen.
- There is no Water Management Plan
- There is no Earthquake Management Plan or assessment despite being located in an Earthquake Hazard Zone
- There is no assessment of the 66Kv powerline, the main Power Supply for the mine site
- There has been no assessment of Acid Mine Drainage to Lawsons Creek or the surrounding area
- No compensation capable to other water users
- Bowdens will have access to at least one third of the state's ground water via two of the largest aquifers in NSW and nothing to prevent them from taking that water

In addition to the major catastrophe of the removal of water from the unregulated Lawsons Creek valley Bowdens will pollute the creek and the groundwater not insignificantly.

Fortunately for the town of Mudgee, Lawsons Creek flows into the Cudgegong River below, and to the north west of Mudgee. But adjacent to the creek and downstream of Lue the Mudgee water supply can be found. One wonders which thoughtless and or corrupt councilors would jeopardise the Mudgee town water supply for a paltry \$3 million.

Lawsons Creek flows into the Cudgegong River. The Cudgegong River is a regulated river, it has regulated water uses, using water for irrigating Lucerne, Wine Grapes and other food crops. Some of the largest vineyards and orchards in the state can be found irrigating from the Cudgegong River. The DPE – Water and DPE – Environment must ensure that the AMD and other pollutants cannot enter this river system. The DPE – Water must also ensure that clean flows in Lawsons Creek are maintained.

Conclusion

A mine without a reliable external water source cannot be sustainable. While Bowdens will most likely take more than they are licensed to take from their groundwater and dewatering bore and pay the fine, this cannot knowingly be permitted. It is clear from all Surface and Groundwater reports that there will be a major effect on other water users and especially unregistered water users which make up a large proportion of water users in Lue and all surrounding areas and on Lawsons Creek. Bowdens have shown themselves to be dishonest, disrespectful, fraudulent and corrupt in their dealings with the Government, MWRC and the public and will go to any lengths to secure an approval for this Project. While their reckless behaviour is not grounds for an unfavourable assessment by the Department, the Department must conclude that Bowdens will bend the rules and the laws of NSW and the Commonwealth to their own end.

When the lack of water supply is taken in conjunction with the flood of unfavourable outcomes that will occur there is no other final outcome than Bowdens Silver Mine must be refused.

