

Objection Submission

SSD-98363228 — Montefiore Seniors Housing, St Ives

RE: SSD-98363228 – Montefiore Seniors Housing, St Ives

I am a neighbouring property owner and I object to this development application for the following reasons:

1. EXCESSIVE SCALE AND HEIGHT — INCONSISTENT WITH LOCAL CHARACTER

The proposed buildings of 5 to 8 storeys are grossly out of scale with the surrounding residential neighbourhood, which is predominantly characterised by single and two-storey detached dwellings. Even with the revised reduction from the original 9-storey proposal, 8 storeys remains completely inconsistent with the established suburban character of St Ives. Four large buildings on a site of less than 1.7 hectares represents an unacceptable level of overdevelopment. This proposal would set a dangerous precedent for high-density development across St Ives and the Ku-ring-gai LGA, and once established, this precedent cannot be undone.

2. TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND PEDESTRIAN SAFETY — CUMULATIVE IMPACT

College Crescent, Link Road, Yarrabung Road, and the Link Road/Stanley Street roundabout already experience significant congestion, particularly during Masada College school drop-off and pick-up times, with traffic regularly backing up along Stanley Street and surrounding roads. Critically, there are currently **two additional townhouse developments already under construction** in the immediate vicinity (Yarrabung Road area), which will independently add significant new vehicle movements to this same constrained road network. The Montefiore proposal — with approximately 260 basement parking spaces, plus hundreds of residents, staff, visitors, and service vehicles including ambulances — would compound this load on top of the already-approved developments that have not yet generated their full traffic impact.

The cumulative effect of these concurrent developments has not been adequately assessed. I request that an independent traffic impact assessment be conducted that accounts for **all approved and under-construction developments** in the catchment, not just existing baseline traffic, and that it specifically covers peak school periods and religious event times at the adjacent Chabad North Shore. The increased traffic poses serious safety risks to pedestrians, particularly school children attending Masada College.

3. OVERSHADOWING AND LOSS OF PRIVACY

Buildings of 5 to 8 storeys will cast significant shadows over neighbouring properties for substantial parts of the day, depriving residents of sunlight they currently enjoy. Additionally, occupied windows at these heights will directly overlook the private gardens, living areas, and outdoor spaces of homes on College Crescent, Stanley Street, Link Road, and Yarrabung Road. This represents an unacceptable and irreversible loss of residential amenity and privacy.

4. AMBULANCE AND EMERGENCY SERVICE NOISE

A facility with 48 aged care beds will generate frequent emergency vehicle activity. Ambulances using sirens on College Crescent and surrounding residential streets at all hours of the day and night will significantly impact the amenity of neighbouring residents and the adjacent school community. The Environmental Impact Statement has not adequately addressed this cumulative noise impact.

5. LOSS OF OPEN SPACE

The development site includes the former Masada College oval — a significant open green space in an established residential area. The loss of this open space diminishes the character and amenity of the neighbourhood. Furthermore, the access strategy relies on land within the Masada College campus, potentially reducing recreational and sporting facilities available to students.

6. NO DEMONSTRATED NEED AT THIS LOCATION

St Ives and surrounding suburbs are already well-served by aged care facilities including Bupa St Ives (98 residents), Estia Health St Ives (118 residents), St Ives House (124 high-care places), Uniting Kari Court, and St Ives Botanica Care Community. There is no demonstrated need for a facility of this scale and intensity at this sensitive location.

7. CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS

A \$294 million development of this scale will involve years of heavy construction activity, generating sustained noise, dust, vibration, and heavy vehicle movements on residential streets adjacent to a school. The impact on residents and students during the construction period will be severe.

WHAT I REQUEST:

I urge the Department to either refuse the application in its current form or require a fundamental redesign that:

- Reduces building heights to a maximum of 3 storeys, consistent with the existing residential character
- Significantly reduces the overall density and number of units

- Removes vehicular access from College Crescent
- Requires independent traffic assessment during peak periods that accounts for all concurrent developments in the area
- Protects remaining open space

This proposal, even in its revised form, remains grossly incompatible with the low-rise residential character of St Ives and will cause lasting, irreversible harm to the neighbourhood.