

Section 75W Application for Modification of Project Approval (MP No. 10_0150) (MOD 2)

Extension of Shore School campus onto the Graythwaite Site (Stage 1)

Environmental Assessment Report

Submitted to NSW Department of Planning and
Infrastructure

Prepared on behalf of Sydney Church of England Grammar
School (Shore)

17 September 2013 | 0916

Contents

1.0 Introduction	1
2.0 The approval	2
3.0 Proposed modifications	3
3.1 Modifications to the approved plans	3
3.2 Modifications to the conditions of consent	3
4.0 Environmental assessment	6
4.1 Consistency with Concept Approval and Project Approval	6
4.2 Heritage	6
4.3 Tree removal	6
4.4 Vehicular link to Shore School	7
4.5 Impacts of construction/demolition	7
5.0 Conclusion	9

Appendices

- A Modified Architectural Plans, by TKD Architects
- B Modified Landscape Plan, by Taylor Brammer
- C Statement of Heritage Impact (**SOHI**), by TKD Architects (incorporating the Arboricultural Assessment Addendum, by Earthscape Horticultural Services)

1.0 Introduction

This Environmental Assessment Report (**EAR**) has been prepared by Robinson Urban Planning Pty Ltd on behalf of the Sydney Church of England Grammar School (**Shore**) (the land owner and proponent). It describes an application to modify pursuant to s. 75W of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (EPA Act)* the Stage 1 Project Approval for Application No. 10_150 approved on 9 November 2012 (the **Project Approval**).

The Project Approval relates to Stage 1 of the approved extension of Shore school onto the Graythwaite site located on Edward Street, Union Street, William Street and Hunter Crescent, North Sydney (the **site**). The Stage 1 Project Approval relates to use of the buildings and site as an educational establishment, conservation and refurbishment works to existing buildings and gardens and associated works.

The modification proposes the following minor changes the approved Stage 1 project:

1. Staging

Moving the following approved works from Stage 2 to Stage 1:

- Demolition of the Ward Building
- Construction of the driveway link between the Graythwaite and Shore Senior School sites

2. Landscaping and tree removal

- Landscaping of the former Ward Building footprint
- Removal of the following two trees located in the vicinity of the Ward Building
 - T60 a Small-leaf Fig (and replacement)
 - T51 a Washington Palm

3. Other minor modifications

- Removal of a non-original brick internal wall in the Stables Museum and minor servicing changes
- Modification of the approved timber paling fence along the north-west site boundary (near the headmaster's house) to a steel palisade fence.

The modifications are proposed to improve the setting of Graythwaite House, to better connect the Shore Senior School and Graythwaite sites at completion of Stage 1 and to facilitate soil remediation of the site around the Ward Building.

The following concurrent applications have been prepared:

- s. 75W application (MOD 2) to modify the Concept Approval for Graythwaite (MP No. 10_149) (the **Concept Approval**) to align the Concept and Project Approvals
- Development Application (**DA**) to North Sydney Council for associated driveway and landscaping works on the Shore Senior School site.

This report identifies the relevant aspects of the Project Approval and describes the proposed modifications. It is accompanied by the following plans and information:

- Appendix A** Modified Architectural Plans, by TKD Architects which cloud the proposed modifications (see Section 3.2)
- Appendix B** Modified Landscape Plan, by Taylor Brammer which cloud the proposed modifications (see Section 3.2)
- Appendix C** Statement of Heritage Impact (**SOHI**), by TKD Architects which incorporates an Arboricultural Assessment Addendum, by Earthscape Horticultural Services.

2.0 The approval

The approval is described below:

Application No.	MP10_0150										
Land	<p>Sydney Church of England Grammar School Campus and Graythwaite site, Edward Street, Union Street, William Street and Hunter Crescent, North Sydney (Lot 2 in DP539853 and Part of Lot 1 in DP 120268). The proposal also includes related development on the following lots:</p> <table> <tr> <td>Lot 1 in DP 539853</td> <td>Lot 1 in DP 57339</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Lot D in DP 975970</td> <td>Lot C in DP 975970</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Lot 3 in DP 75717</td> <td>Lot 3 in DP 570829</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Lot 1 in DP 570826</td> <td>Lot 2 in DP 18725</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Lot 1 in DP 60719</td> <td>Lot 3 in DP 18725</td> </tr> </table>	Lot 1 in DP 539853	Lot 1 in DP 57339	Lot D in DP 975970	Lot C in DP 975970	Lot 3 in DP 75717	Lot 3 in DP 570829	Lot 1 in DP 570826	Lot 2 in DP 18725	Lot 1 in DP 60719	Lot 3 in DP 18725
Lot 1 in DP 539853	Lot 1 in DP 57339										
Lot D in DP 975970	Lot C in DP 975970										
Lot 3 in DP 75717	Lot 3 in DP 570829										
Lot 1 in DP 570826	Lot 2 in DP 18725										
Lot 1 in DP 60719	Lot 3 in DP 18725										
LGA	North Sydney Council										
Project	<p>Stage 1 of the extension of Shore school campus onto the Graythwaite site, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of the Graythwaite site and buildings as an educational establishment, being an extension to the adjoining Shore school campus • Conservation and refurbishment of Graythwaite House, the Coach House, Tom O'Neill Centre and associated garden area; and • Transport, traffic, parking, access, drainage, stormwater, fencing, lighting and landscaping works. 										
Date Approval (by Planning Assessment Commission (PAC))	9 November 2012										
Section 75W Modifications	<p>MOD 1 approved 13 June 2012 which comprised:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alteration to refurbishment works • Revised landscaping and tree removal • Revised car parking arrangements • Revised fence and gate • Revised requirements regarding light reflectivity from building materials. 										

3.0 Proposed modifications

3.1 Modifications to the approved plans

The proposed modifications to the Project Approval comprise the following, as shown clouded on the Modified Architectural Plans by TKD Architects and the Modified Landscape Plans by Taylor Brammer (listed later at Section 3.2.2):

1. Staging

Moving the following approved works from Stage 2 to Stage 1:

- Demolition of the Ward Building
- Construction of the driveway link between the Graythwaite and Shore Senior School sites

2. Landscaping and tree removal

- Landscaping of the former Ward Building footprint
- Removal of the following two trees located in the vicinity of the Ward Building
 - T60 a Small-leaf Fig (and replacement)
 - T51 a Washington Palm

3. Other minor modifications

- Removal of a non-original brick internal wall in the Stables Museum and relocation of a mechanical services vent
- Modification of the approved timber paling fence along the north-west site boundary (near the headmaster's house) to a steel palisade fence.

3.2 Modifications to the conditions of consent

Application is made to modify Condition A1, A2 and A9 in the Project Approval as set out below (new words are shown in red and deleted words in ~~strikethrough~~):

3.2.1 Condition A1

Development Description

A1. *The development as described in the EA includes:*

- *use of the Graythwaite site and buildings as an educational establishment, being an extension to the adjoining Shore school campus;*
- *conservation and refurbishment of Graythwaite House, the Coach House, Tom O'Neill Centre and associated garden area;*
- *demolition of the Ward Building and other minor demolition works;*
- *drainage and stormwater improvements, site levelling and landscaping (particularly on the middle and lower terraces) including tree retention, removal and transplantation;*
- *use of the Graythwaite middle and lower terraces as a play and educational space;*
- *transport, traffic, parking and access improvements to the Graythwaite site and existing Shore school campus;*
- *miscellaneous works including site fencing and lighting (to Graythwaite House and the driveway);*
- *landscape works along the western side boundary adjoining properties that have an interface with the West Building (west building part of stage 3);*
- *no increase in student or staff population.*

Approval is granted to carry out the development as described in the EA subject to the modifications detailed in this Schedule. Development must be carried out consistently with the conditions in Schedule 2 and the Statement of Commitments in Schedule 3.

3.2.2 Condition A2

Development in Accordance with Plans and Documentation

A2. The development shall be generally in accordance with the following plans and documentation:

- (a) Environmental Assessment titled Revised Environmental Assessment Report (Volumes 1A, 1B, 2 and 3) Concept Plan (MP10_0149) & Project Application (MP10_0150), Extension of Shore School onto the Graythwaite site at 20 Edward Street, North Sydney, and Appendices prepared by Robinson Urban Planning Pty Ltd, dated 28 October 2011
- (b) Preferred Project Report titled Preferred Project Report and Statement of Commitments, Extension of Shore School onto the Graythwaite site at 20 Edward Street, North Sydney, and Appendices prepared by Robinson Urban Planning Pty Ltd, dated March 2012
- (c) Amended by Section 75W Modification prepared by Robinson Urban Planning dated 7 March 2013.

~~(d) The following plans:~~

(d) Amended by Section 75W Modification prepared by Robinson Urban Planning dated 17 September 2013.

(e) The following plans:

Architectural (or Design) Drawings prepared by Tanner Architects			
Drawing No.	Revision	Name of Plan	Date
AR.DA.0001	∅ E	Cover & Location Plan	17/04/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.0002	∅ E	Site Plan	17/04/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.0003	€ D	Graythwaite House – Demolition Basement and Ground Floors	1/03/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.1001	€ D	Graythwaite House Basement and Ground Floor Plans	1/03/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.1002	€ D	Graythwaite House First and Attic Floor Plans	1/03/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.1003	C	Graythwaite House Sections	1/03/2013
AR.DA.2001	€ D	Graythwaite House Elevations	1/03/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.2002	€ D	Graythwaite House Sections	1/03/2013 11/09/3013
AR.DA.2003	C	Graythwaite House Elevation	1/03/2013
AR.DA.3001	C	Coach House – Proposed Plans, Sections and Elevations	1/03/2013
AR.DA.4001	C	Tom O’Neill Centre – Proposed Plans and Elevations	1/03/2013
AR.DA.S75W.14	P1	Union Street Fence and Gate Details	Via letter

Architectural (or Design) Drawings prepared by Tanner Architects			
Drawing No.	Revision	Name of Plan	Date
			<i>dated</i> 20/10/2013
AR.DA.6001	A	Edward Street Gate – Stone Wall	02/04/2013
Landscape (or Design) Drawings prepared by Taylor Brammer			
Drawing No.	Revision	Name of Plan	Date
LT.003	H I	Tree Removal and Retention Plan	22/04/2013 11/09/2013
LT.004	D E	Existing Tree Schedule – Heritage Significance & Action	21/02/2013 11/09/2013
LT.005	D E	Landscape Hardworks	21/02/2013 11/09/2013
LT.006	D E	Landscape Softworks	21/02/2013 11/09/2013
LT.007	D E	Landscape Tree Plan	21/02/2013 11/09/2013
LT.008	D E	Landscape Lighting Plan	21/02/2013 11/09/2013
LT.009	A	Landscape Details	24/11/2010
LT.010	B	Early Works Planting	17/10/2011
LT.011	B	Early Works Landscape Details	17/10/2011

~~(d)~~(f) Any modifications which are 'Exempt and Complying Development' as identified in State Environmental Planning Policy (Exempt and Complying Development Codes) 2008 or as may be necessary for the purpose of compliance with the BCA and any Australian Standards incorporated in the BCA.

~~(e)~~(g) Otherwise provided by the conditions of this approval.

3.2.3 Condition A9

Boundary fence

A9. This approval includes the provision of a new **steel palisade** ~~timber paling~~ fence along the northern boundary of the site (near the headmaster's house) and **a new timber paling fence** around the substation in the south of the Graythwaite site.

4.0 Environmental assessment

4.1 Consistency with Concept Approval and Project Approval

The proposed modifications to the Project Approval do not alter the form or content of the approved Concept Plan works. Notably, demolition of the Ward Building and construction of a driveway link to the Shore Senior School site have already been approved. The modification merely brings these works forward to Stage 1.

A separate s. 75W application has been submitted to modify the Concept Approval to align the Concept and Stage 1 Project Approvals.

4.2 Heritage

TKD Architects has prepared a SOHI (**Appendix C**) that assesses the heritage impact of the proposed modifications (the SoHI also considers the concurrent s. 75W relating to the Concept Approval). In relation to both s. 75W applications, the SOHI concludes as follows:

The minor modifications to the approved Part 3A Stage 1 Works for Graythwaite are proposed for the enhancement of the site and landscape and better functioning and presentation of the Stables Building.

In the case of the removal and replacement of the Port Jackson Fig tree (tree T60), its removal is proposed to address its unstable condition and to allow for the safe decontamination of the surrounding ground. The historic nature of the tree's location and species will be interpreted in a replacement tree of the same species in the location. The proposed removal of the Washington Palm tree (tree T51) is not considered to have a negative heritage impact; instead its removal will aid in the understanding of the historic cultural landscape of the Graythwaite site.

Demolition of the Ward Building during the present Stage 1 works, approved as part of the Stage 2 works, will provide an enhanced setting for Graythwaite within its immediate environs.

Proposed works to the Stables Building are proposed to improve its external appearance - through the relocation of a mechanical services vent - and improve its internal functioning - through the removal of the non-original internal wall. The proposed removal of the dividing wall will provide a substantial advantage, creating a clear open space, a positive outcome for the continued functioning of the building.

There are no negative heritage impacts arising from the proposed change to the northern boundary fence to a steel palisade fence.

Considered overall, the proposed minor additional and modified works, including the proposed earlier demolition of the Ward Building in Stage 1, will not result in any additional adverse impacts on the heritage significance of the Graythwaite site and buildings, and would result in only negligible or minimal impacts on the contribution of the items to the overall significance of the site, while delivering benefits to the sites future and continued use.

4.3 Tree removal

4.3.1 *Ficus obliqua* (Small-leaf Fig) (T60)

A Small leaf fig tree (T60) at the upper section of the driveway is proposed to be removed and replaced with a tree of the same species. As detailed in the attached Arboricultural Assessment Addendum (appended to the SoHI at **Appendix C**), Earthscape Horticultural Services notes that T60:

- Displays multiple defects, rendering the tree potentially hazardous

- Has a Safe Useful Life Expectancy (SULE) of less than 5 years
- Has a Low Retention Value.

Removal of the tree is also necessary to enable remediation of this part of the site (which involves the removal of between 250mm and 500mm depth of soil within a large portion of the Tree Protection Zone to remove soil contaminants).

Earthscope Horticultural Services conclude that:

This tree is one of a number of Figs of various species planted throughout Graythwaite c.1875 and is considered to be of high Heritage Significance due to its association with the early development of Graythwaite. However, this value is substantially diminished due to the structural integrity and SULE of the tree. Given its current health and condition and the required remediation works, the removal of the tree is considered warranted subject to appropriate replacement planting with a similar species, sympathetic with the heritage values of the site and era of the original landscape.

Given the above, removal and replacement of T60 is reasonable.

4.3.2 *Washingtonia robusta* (Washington Palm) (T51)

A Washington Palm (T51) is located just south of the Ward Building. The Arboricultural Assessment Addendum (appended to the SoHI at **Appendix C**) notes that the tree:

- Exhibits good health and condition with a SULE of more than 40 years
- Has a moderate Retention Value
- Has no special ecological or heritage significance
- Is probably self sown c1970 (from the four other Washington Palms on the southern side of Graythwaite) and as such does not appear to have any heritage significance (supported by the 2011 Conservation Management Plan as detailed in the SoHI (**Appendix C**))
- Given the size of the tree at present, any loss of amenity resulting from the removal of the tree to accommodate the proposed works could be replaced in the short term (next five to ten years) with new tree planting.

Given the above, removal of T51 is reasonable.

4.4 Vehicular link to Shore School

The Concept Approval already includes a driveway link between the Graythwaite and Shore Senior School sites (identified on A.006 by Mayoh Architects as a MANAGED VEHICLE ACCESS OVER SHARED PEDESTRIAN AREAS).

This s.75W (and the companion s.75W to modify the Concept Approval) brings construction of the driveway forward to Stage 1 to improve connectivity between the sites. The detailed design of the driveway will ensure that it provides for connection to:

- The approved main Graythwaite site driveway from Union Street
- The approved East Building basement (Stage 2 of the Graythwaite Project)
- Future/proposed driveway works on the adjoining Shore Senior School site (a separate DA will be lodged to North Sydney Council for associated driveway and landscaping works on the Shore site).

4.5 Impacts of construction/demolition

Demolition of the Ward Building as part of the Stage 1 works should not generate any adverse amenity impacts for residents nearby dwellings the following reasons:

- The Ward Building is located at the eastern end of the Graythwaite site, near the site's boundary with Shore School and well away from the dwelling houses in Bank Street, Edward Street and Union Street
- Demolition will be carried out in accordance with the Construction Management Plan, by WSP (EAR dated October 2011, Appendix N)
- Demolition works will comply with the detailed conditions of consent set out in the Project Approval, Part D – During Construction
- Demolition of the Ward Building is likely to take approximately two to three weeks.

5.0 Conclusion

This s. 75W application to modify the Stage 1 Project Approval for the Graythwaite site proposes a number of minor changes that respond to design development issues and user needs. In particular, demolition of the Ward Building and construction of the driveway link to Shore school at Stage 1 of the project will improve the setting of Graythwaite House and connectivity between the Graythwaite and Shore Senior School sites.

As modified, the project is substantially the same as the Concept and Project Approvals and has comparable environmental impacts. The s. 75W application therefore has planning merit and is worthy of consent.

Appendix A

Modified Architectural Plans, by TKD Architects

Appendix B

Modified Landscape Plan, by Taylor Brammer

Appendix C

Statement of Heritage Impact (**SOHI**), by TKD Architects (incorporating the Arboricultural Assessment Addendum, by Earthscape Horticultural Services)

