

7 October 2016

The Minister
NSW Department of Planning & Environment
GPO Box 39
SYDNEY NSW 2001

Attention: Mr Robert Byrne, Planner

Dear Sir,

**RE: FORMER SCOTTISH HOSPITAL, 2 COOPER STREET PADDINGTON NSW 2021 (MP10_0016)
POTENTIAL HERITAGE ISSUES: SECTION 75W APPLICATION**

We write on behalf of the Owner, Presbyterian Aged Care, in support of heritage aspects of the proposed Section 75W application to MP10_0016, as shown in the following drawings prepared by Conybeare Morrison International Pty Ltd:

- Drawing No. 2006067-DA431 (Revision B): Heritage Building-Level 5, dated 07/10/2016
- Drawing No. 2006067-DA432 (Revision B): Heritage Building-Level 6, dated 07/10/2016
- Drawing No. 2006067-DA436 (Revision B): North-South Elevations, dated 07/10/2016
- Drawing No. 2006067-DA437 (Revision B): Sections, dated 07/10/2016
- Drawing No. 2006067-DA438 (Revision B): Sections, dated 07/10/2016

We set out our comments in relation to heritage issues for your consideration.

1.0 Heritage Significance

The former Scottish Hospital is identified as a heritage item on Schedule 5 attached to the *Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014* and is protected under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*. Fabric comprising the building was assessed in the Conservation Management Plan prepared for the Scottish Hospital by NBR+ Partners (now NBRArchitecture), 10 November 2010.

2.0 Proposed Works

The potential heritage impacts of the proposed works are summarised below:

PROPOSED CHANGE	HERITAGE IMPACT
<p>Level 6 and Level 5 Relocate Lift 9 to internal location as shown (Drawing Nos. 2006067-DA431 and DA432).</p>	<p>Acceptable heritage impact: relocation of Lift 9 is required to enable additional underpinning at basement level.</p> <p>The relocation of Lift 9 to an internal space as shown would result in the retention of an external window and it would be relocated to a space identified in the CMP as being 'intrusive' and would not affect significant heritage fabric. The space was constructed as an operating theatre, and subsequently altered in the 1990s to provide a corridor leading to the former north east wing (now demolished). The lift overrun would not be visible at roof level.</p>
<p>Level 6 Delete proposed new windows NW13/G, NW 15/G and NW 18/G from south elevation.</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: reduces adverse impacts on heritage fabric.</p>

<p>Level 6 Delete window W 16/G from south elevation.</p>	<p>Adverse heritage impact-removal of significant original fabric.</p>
<p>Level 6 Delete proposed new window NW25/G from north elevation.</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: reduces adverse impacts on heritage fabric.</p>
<p>Level 6 Retain W19/G as a window: do not adapt as new entrance.</p>	<p>Positive heritage impact. This action retains original fabric and the established fenestration pattern of the Cooper Street elevation.</p>
<p>Level 6 Relocate stud wall forming west wall of space GH5-6 (Bed 3)</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: does not affect significant heritage fabric.</p>
<p>Level 6 Delete stud wall forming west wall of space GH5-5 (Bed 2)</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: does not affect heritage fabric.</p>
<p>Level 6 Retain masonry wall forming west wall of GH5-1 (Entry)</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: involves the retention of original fabric.</p>
<p>Level 6 Adapt proposed north stud wall of space GH5-3 to create accessible lift lobby.</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: does not affect heritage fabric.</p>
<p>Level 6 Increase the size of opening in west masonry wall forming the west wall of space GH5-3</p>	<p>Acceptable heritage impact provided nibs are retained and a section of masonry above the opening. Details of new reveals and architraves are to match existing joinery details confirmed on site by heritage specialist on site.</p>
<p>Level 6 Construct new shower room Space GH5-4 with stud walls; construct new riser servicing levels 5 and 6.</p>	<p>Acceptable heritage impact: other locations within the apartment were considered and rejected as they required introduction of additional service lines. The location shown would enable services to spaces GH5-1 and GH5-13 to be adapted to serve space GH5-4.</p>
<p>Level 6 Adapt proposed study (space GH5-3)</p>	<p>The new space would be formed by stud walls and would not involve further removal of heritage fabric. A new ceiling would be installed to improve the proportions of the space.</p>
<p>Level 5 Delete window W11/LG from east wall of space LGHC-6 at engineer's request.</p>	<p>Acceptable heritage impact: the window would be infilled with masonry set back from the face of the internal and external walls to interpret the original location of the window.</p>
<p>Level 5 Delete proposed new windows NW29/LG and NW30/LG from south wall of space LGH3-6.</p>	<p>Negligible heritage impact: reduces adverse impacts on heritage fabric.</p>
<p>Level 5 Delete windows W31/LG and W32/LG from south wall of space LGH2-12 as requested by engineer to maintain structural integrity of original building.</p>	<p>Acceptable heritage impact: the window would be infilled with masonry set back from the face of the internal and external walls to interpret the original location of the window.</p>

Level 5 Delete windows NW33/LG, NW34/LG and NW35/LG from south wall of LGH2-13.	Negligible heritage impact: reduces adverse impacts on heritage fabric.
Level 5 Delete ramp located to the north of space LGH2-4.	Negligible heritage impact: does not affect heritage fabric.
Level 5 Delete proposed new window NW14/LG to north wall of LGH2-5 on engineers' advice to maintain structural integrity of existing walls.	Negligible heritage impact: reduces adverse impacts on heritage fabric.
Level 5 Relocation of electrical meters.	Acceptable heritage impact: would not be visible on the exterior of the building; located in area designated as 'intrusive'.
Level 5 Relocation of garbage room to outside.	Negligible heritage impact: would be situated below Cooper Street level and would not adversely impact on views to the former Scottish Hospital.
Level 5 Construct new shower room (Space LGH2-11) with stud walls; construct new riser servicing levels 5 and 6.	Acceptable heritage impact: other locations within the apartment were considered and rejected as they required introduction of additional service lines. The location shown would enable services to space LGH2-10 to be adapted to serve space LGH2-11.

3.0 Assessment of Potential Heritage Impacts

In our opinion the proposed modifications are acceptable in heritage terms, subject to resolution of details, for the following reasons:

- The works are generally consistent with the policies and recommendations of the Conservation Management Plan prepared by NBRSArchitecture, in particular Policy 3.2 that states '*...adaptation of internal spaces is an acceptable form of action to ensure the conservation of the whole place*'.
- The relocation of Lift 9 would have a positive heritage impact on the Cooper Street elevation. Window: the window intended for adaptation as an entrance to Lift 9 would be retained in situ, without further modification.
- The infill of existing windows is required by the consulting engineers to maintain the structural stability of the heritage building. Masonry infill panels would be set back from the face of adjacent walls to enable the interpretation of the original fenestration pattern.
- The deletion of proposed windows would have a positive heritage impact as it would involve the retention of significant masonry walls comprising the former Scottish Hospital building

Do not hesitate to contact me on ph. 02 9922 2344, or pam.jeffery@nbrsarchitecture.com, should you require further information in relation to this matter.

Yours faithfully,
NBRSARCHITECTURE.



PAMELA JEFFERY
Senior Heritage Consultant

cc. Ms Kristina Stoffers, Design Manager, Construction + Development, Brookfields Multiplex.