

**Colin Phillips - Online Submission from David Stewart (object)**

---

**From:** David Stewart <davidstewart@optusnet.com.au>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 8:24 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from David Stewart (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

My submission is brief and is chiefly concerned with the Greenhouse Gas Emissions associated with the proposed extension of the mine. To compare the average annual emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> from the mine - 16.94 million tonnes - to the global atmospheric total of 3000 Giga tonnes is disingenuous. The CO<sub>2</sub> to be emitted may amount to "only" 0.012% of total atmospheric carbon dioxide but this is only 1 coal mine out of how many hundreds or thousands around the world. It amounts to death by a thousand cuts. Sure, just one coal mine's emissions will have no discernible effect but the cumulative effect of many such mines is substantial. A more realistic comparison is with the total CO<sub>2</sub> emissions of the state of NSW - about 170 million tons annually. This mine's emissions amount to 10% of this figure

Very recent research ("Paleoclimate Implications for Human-Made Climate Change" - James E. Hansen and Makiko Sato. NASA Goddard Institute for Space Studies and Columbia University Earth Institute, New York) concludes that, "Earth in the warmest interglacial periods was less than 1°C warmer than in the Holocene and that goals of limiting human-made warming to 2°C and CO<sub>2</sub> to 450 ppm are prescriptions for disaster. Polar warmth in prior interglacials and the Pliocene does not imply that a significant cushion remains between today's climate and dangerous warming, rather that Earth today is poised to experience strong amplifying polar feedbacks in response to moderate additional warming. Deglaciation, disintegration of ice sheets, is nonlinear, spurred by amplifying feedbacks. If warming reaches a level that forces deglaciation, the rate of sea level rise will depend on the doubling time for ice sheet mass loss. Gravity satellite data, although too brief to be conclusive, are consistent with a doubling time of 10 years or less, implying the possibility of multi-meter sea level rise this century. The emerging shift to accelerating ice sheet mass loss supports our conclusion that Earth's temperature has returned to at least the Holocene maximum. Rapid reduction of fossil fuel emissions is required for humanity to succeed in preserving a planet resembling the one on which civilization developed."

I am impressed by the proposals to offset the destruction of the critically endangered ecological communities (CEEC) at the mine site but that does not overcome the fact, for example, that 28% of the presently existing Whitebox-Narrow leafed Ironbark- White Cypress Pine grassy open forest extant in the Leard State Forest will be cleared. All up 623.6 ha of a total of 3214ha of CEEC in the Leard SF will be "disturbed" - 20% of the total of what is an irreplaceable forest ecosystem in a degraded landscape. The 1385 ha of critical habitat planned for clearance will not be adequately replaced by species-poor plantings.

I am also concerned about the endangered groundwater dependent ecosystems in the vicinity of the Boggabri Coal project that will be damaged by water chemistry alteration and permanent water table-reduction of up to one metre. Cumulative permanent reductions in the water table of up to 2 metres are anticipated to result from the Boggabri Coal and Maules Creek Coal projects. The operation of the mine will entail a very significant water deficit that will see valuable water rights, better used for the benefit of the environment or agriculture bought up - 400 megalitres of groundwater annually together with a proposed purchase of a licence to extract a further 400 megalitres annually of "deep hard rock aquifer water". By Year 5 the expected groundwater allocation is 1,114 megalitres. This is over half the storage capacity of Warragamba Dam - a huge amount of water.

Approval of the Boggabri mine will result in the imposition of large-scale mining. The proposed Maules Creek and Boggabri mines will produce up to 20 million tonnes of coal per year. This is larger than any existing Hunter Valley mine, and will induce significant social impacts.

Name: David Stewart

Address:

381 Rouse Street,  
Tenterfield  
New South Wales  
2372

IP Address: pa114-73-152-124.pa.nsw.optusnet.com.au - 114.73.152.124

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval

[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine

[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

-----

**Colin Phillips**

Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483

F: 02 9228 6466

E: [Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au](mailto:Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au)

-----

---

Powered by Internetix Affinity

## Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Maryanne Watters (object)

---

**From:** Maryanne Watters <watters.maryanne@gmail.com>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 7:11 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Maryanne Watters (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

do not mine Kaputar National park because of sensitive nature of the natural environment

Name: Maryanne Watters

Address:  
50 collaroy road New Lambton

IP Address: - 210.56.254.90

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

---

### Colin Phillips

Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483  
F: 02 9228 6466  
E: [Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au](mailto:Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au)

---

Powered by Internetrix Affinity

**Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Ross Rapmund (object)**

---

**From:** Ross Rapmund <rossrapmund@yahoo.com.au>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 6:25 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Ross Rapmund (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

I am opposed to this development for the following reasons-

? Leard State Forest is an irreplaceable forest ecosystem in a degraded landscape AND IS PUBLIC LAND. The 1385 ha of critical habitat planned for clearance will not be adequately replaced by species-poor plantings which will not constitute the previous diversity present.

? Endangered Groundwater Dependant Ecosystems in the vicinity of the Boggabri Coal project will be damaged by water chemistry alteration and permanent water table-reduction of up to one metre. Cumulative permanent reductions in the water table of up to 2 metres are anticipated to result from the Boggabri Coal and Maules Creek Coal projects.

? Approval of the Boggabri mine will result in the imposition of large-scale mining. The proposed Maules Creek and Boggabri mines will produce up to 20 million tonnes of coal per year. This is larger than any existing Hunter Valley mine, and will induce significant social impacts.

? The Boggabri mine will destroy an existing carbon sink and produce 16.9 million tonnes of greenhouse gases each year. This is equivalent to 10% of all greenhouse gases emitted annually in NSW.

Name: Ross Rapmund

Address:  
25 Lockinvar Place Hornsby 2077

IP Address: cpe-144-136-116-254.hnub1.ken.bigpond.net.au - 144.136.116.254

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

-----  
**Colin Phillips**  
Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483  
F: 02 9228 6466  
E: Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au

---

Powered by Internetix Affinity

**Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Mary Katz (object)**

---

**From:** Mary Katz <dankatz83@hotmail.com>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 5:58 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Mary Katz (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

Please, let us begin to understand just how delicate the balance of nature is. Making money is fine; up to a point. There is no economy without an environment that supports life.

Leard State Forest is an irreplaceable forest ecosystem in a degraded landscape. The 1385 ha of critical habitat planned for clearance will not be adequately replaced by species-poor plantings.

? Endangered Groundwater Dependant Ecosystems in the vicinity of the Boggabri Coal project will be damaged by water chemistry alteration and permanent water table-reduction of up to one metre. Cumulative permanent reductions in the water table of up to 2 metres are anticipated to result from the Boggabri Coal and Maules Creek Coal projects.

? Approval of the Boggabri mine will result in the imposition of large-scale mining. The proposed Maules Creek and Boggabri mines will produce up to 20 million tonnes of coal per year. This is larger than any existing Hunter Valley mine, and will induce significant social impacts.

? The Boggabri mine will destroy an existing carbon sink and produce 16.9 million tonnes of greenhouse gases each year. This is equivalent to 10% of all greenhouse gases emitted annually in NSW.

Name: Mary Katz

Address:  
16 Edna Drive  
Tathra, NSW 2550

IP Address: cpe-121-214-236-186.lns6.fli.bigpond.net.au - 121.214.236.186

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

-----  
**Colin Phillips**  
Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483  
F: 02 9228 6466  
E: Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au  
-----

---

Powered by Internetix Affinity

## Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Jennifer Brown (object)

---

**From:** Jennifer Brown <madgebrown@ozemail.com.au>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 29/01/2011 2:19 AM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Jennifer Brown (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

Please consider the long term cost to our land and ecosystems it supports. Some actions have irreversible consequences. Don't allow short term human wealth to win over long term ecosystem health.

Name: Jennifer Brown

Address:  
1a Glencarron Ave, Mosman, NSW

IP Address: 75-146-91-253-utah.hfc.comcastbusiness.net - 75.146.91.253

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

-----  
**Colin Phillips**  
Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483  
F: 02 9228 6466  
E: [Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au](mailto:Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au)

---

Powered by Internetrix Affinity

**Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Ivette Mendoza (object)**

---

**From:** Ivette Mendoza <yasiraosiris@hotmail.com>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 29/01/2011 12:19 AM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Ivette Mendoza (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

Leard State Forest is an irreplaceable forest ecosystem in a degraded landscape. The 1385 ha of critical habitat planned for clearance will not be adequately replaced by species-poor plantings.

? Endangered Groundwater Dependant Ecosystems in the vicinity of the Boggabri Coal project will be damaged by water chemistry alteration and permanent water table-reduction of up to one metre. Cumulative permanent reductions in the water table of up to 2 metres are anticipated to result from the Boggabri Coal and Maules Creek Coal projects.

? Approval of the Boggabri mine will result in the imposition of large-scale mining. The proposed Maules Creek and Boggabri mines will produce up to 20 million tonnes of coal per year. This is larger than any existing Hunter Valley mine, and will induce significant social impacts.

? The Boggabri mine will destroy an existing carbon sink and produce 16.9 million tonnes of greenhouse gases each year. This is equivalent to 10% of all greenhouse gases emitted annually in NSW.

Name: Ivette Mendoza

Address:

1/124 Bland Street ASHFIELD NSW 2131

IP Address: 122-148-68-53.static.dsl.dodo.com.au - 122.148.68.53

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval

[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view__job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine

[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view__site&id=2081)

-----  
**Colin Phillips**

Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483

F: 02 9228 6466

E: [Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au](mailto:Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au)

---

Powered by Internetrix Affinity

## Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Robert Dvorak of Envirotec Consulting Services Pty Ltd (object)

---

**From:** Robert Dvorak <rob.dvorak@gmail.com>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 11:51 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Robert Dvorak of Envirotec Consulting Services Pty Ltd (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

The Leard State Forest is an irreplaceable forest ecosystem in what is a degraded landscape in the surrounding areas. The 1385 ha of critical habitat planned for clearance will not be adequately replaced by species-poor plantings. Once you damage the natural state it will not come back and many endangered species will die. As the government represents the people it needs to ensure that there is a balanced approach and in particular that Australias natural heritage is not thrown away for a bit of coal and as always for a company to get rich whilst everyone else pays for this through the loss of wonderful forested landscape. Please do not further decimate this area and increase biodiversity loss. It is your responsibility to ensure that the environment is protected for all Australians. The loss of water due to the mining will affect the flora and fauna, this much is very clear.

There endangered groundwater dependant ecosystems in the vicinity of the Boggabri Coal project will be damaged by water chemistry alteration and permanent water table-reduction of up to one metre. Cumulative permanent reductions in the water table of up to 2 metres are anticipated to result from the Boggabri Coal and Maules Creek Coal projects.

Approval of the Boggabri mine will result in the imposition of large-scale mining. The proposed Maules Creek and Boggabri mines will produce up to 20 million tonnes of coal per year. This is larger than any existing Hunter Valley mine, and will induce significant social impacts.

The Boggabri mine will destroy an existing carbon sink and produce 16.9 million tonnes of greenhouse gases each year. This is equivalent to 10% of all greenhouse gases emitted annually in NSW.

Please show some leadership there are better and cleaner alternatives to coal.

Name: Robert Dvorak  
Organisation: Envirotec Consulting Services Pty Ltd

Address:  
207/72-76 High Street  
Pahran 3181, VIC

IP Address: 60-240-242-70.tpgi.com.au - 60.240.242.70

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

-----

**Colin Phillips**



## Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Kay Wilson (object)

---

**From:** Kay Wilson <kwils00000@hotmail.com>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 10:33 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Kay Wilson (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

I recently toured in the area of Mt Kaputar National Park, camped in the top campground and walked the trails. I am absolutely shocked beyond description at the thought that private coal mining interests may be given leases anywhere near this beautiful area.

Name: Kay Wilson

Address:  
30 Bay St, Patonga NSW 2256

IP Address: cpe-121-220-140-33.lns5.fli.bigpond.net.au - 121.220.140.33

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

---

### Colin Phillips

Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483  
F: 02 9228 6466  
E: [Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au](mailto:Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au)

---

Powered by Internetrix Affinity

**Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Ilona Renwick (object)**

---

**From:** Ilona Renwick <imrenwick@hotmail.com>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 28/01/2011 9:32 PM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Ilona Renwick (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

---

#### Protect Maules Creek Bushland from Mining

I wish to protest regarding the proposed extension of Boggabri Mine as an Open Cut mine for the next 21 years.

The horrible moonscape that Open Cut mining has produced in the Hunter Valley should not be permitted in the native forests and farmland as proposed.

The destructive march of the coal industry has now arrived at a new, unique and beautiful location. Maules Creek, in the foothills of the Mt Kaputar National Park, near Narrabri, is subject to four huge open-cut mine proposals. These mines threaten to destroy a remnant forest and surrounding farmland.

The heart of Maules Creek is Leard State Forest ? the largest single remnant of native vegetation left on the heavily-cleared Liverpool Plains. It is home to 22 threatened plant and animal species, including owls, bats and birds, and contains one of the largest remaining stands of the nationally endangered Grassy White Box ecosystem.

It is also home to a range of newly-discovered and unique freshwater invertebrates that depend on healthy groundwater.

Collectively, these mines will open-cut up to two-thirds of this invaluable forest, and replace it with coal mines and dubious ?offsets?. This public forest, with immeasurable benefits to the community, will be destroyed forever for private gain. The fascinating underground species that depend on healthy groundwater won't stand a chance.

Multi-national-owned Boggabri Coal is currently planning to open-cut 1400 ha of irreplaceable remnant forest - about 14,000 quarter-acre blocks.

Commonsense must prevail here. This is public land that must not be damaged for short term gain.

Name: Ilona Renwick

Address:  
25 Seacourt Ave,Dudley 2290

IP Address: cpe-60-229-177-194.ins10.ken.bigpond.net.au - 60.229.177.194

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

**Colin Phillips - Online Submission from Keren Parnell (object)**

---

**From:** Keren Parnell <keren79@bigpond.net.au>  
**To:** Colin Phillips <Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au>  
**Date:** 30/01/2011 3:20 AM  
**Subject:** Online Submission from Keren Parnell (object)  
**CC:** <assessments@planning.nsw.gov.au>

---

I am writing in opposition to the proposed open-cut mining in Leard State Forest. This forest is the largest single remnant of native forest on the already degraded and cleared Liverpool Plains. It is home to one of the largest remaining stands of the Grassy White Box, which is nationally endangered, and overall contains 22 threatened species of plant and animals. The plants themselves, if this project were to go ahead, would not be replaced. The other concern is the groundwater. Endangered ecosystems that are dependent on groundwater would be destroyed by this project, which would result in the water table being reduced by up to 2 metres. The last concern, and the most important, is about the almost 17 million tonnes of greenhouse gases that would be introduced into the atmosphere. This is equivalent to 10% of greenhouse gases emitted annually in NSW. At a time when Global Warming has reached crisis point (look at the Queensland floods and the bushfires in Victoria), this project is highly irresponsible. Coal mining is the largest single cause of Climate Change, and hence the largest single cause of plant, animal and human misery in this planets history. Please do not let this project go ahead. Heavy investment in renewable energies is what is desperately needed.

Name: Keren Parnell

Address:  
5 Naru Street  
Marks Point NSW

IP Address: cpe-121-217-210-47.inse3.clt.bigpond.net.au - 121.217.210.47

Submission for Job: #3562 Project Approval  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_job&id=3562](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_job&id=3562)

Site: #2081 Boggabri Mine  
[https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view\\_site&id=2081](https://majorprojects.onhiive.com/index.pl?action=view_site&id=2081)

---

**Colin Phillips**  
Environmental Planning Officer, MDA

P: 02 9228 6483  
F: 02 9228 6466  
E: [Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au](mailto:Colin.Phillips@planning.nsw.gov.au)

---

Powered by Internetrix Affinity