



Heritage Council



of New South Wales

3 Marist Place
Parramatta NSW 2150

Locked Bag 5020
Parramatta NSW 2124
DX 8225 PARRAMATTA

Telephone: 61 2 9873 8500
Facsimile: 61 2 9873 8599

heritage@planning.nsw.gov.au
www.heritage.nsw.gov.au

Contact: Shikha Jhaldiyal
Phone: 02 9873 8545
Fax: 02 9873 8599
Email: shikha.jhaldiyal@planning.nsw.gov.au
File: 10/17547
Our Ref: B155866
Your Ref: NCA/3/2010

The General Manager
Parramatta City Council
PO Box 32
Parramatta NSW 2124

Attention: Jonathan Goodwill
Senior Development Assessment Officer

Dear Sir

RE: Development Consent No: NCA/3/2010, 89 George Street, Parramatta NSW 2150, Part 3A Project Application lodged with the Department of Planning for the construction of a commercial/retail development

Thank you for your letter dated 4 August 2010 received by the NSW Heritage Branch on 6 August 2010, referring the above Part 3A Project Application to the Heritage Branch for comments. It is understood that the assessment of the Project Application, received by the Department of Planning, has been delegated to the Parramatta City Council.

The information submitted with the application that has been advertised on the Department of Planning website, has been reviewed. It is noted that the Director General's requirements with relation to the heritage issues includes the provision of *a Heritage Impact Statement prepared by a qualified Heritage Consultant in accordance with the NSW Heritage Office publication 'Statements of Heritage Impact' and 'Draft Guidelines For Aboriginal Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment and Community Consultation 2005'*. In particular the Heritage Impact Statement should address the impact of the proposal upon the significance of the adjoining "Perth House and Stables" and whether the proposal complies with any relevant policies contained in the Conservation Management Plan.

The Heritage Branch acknowledges the documentation submitted including the Heritage Impact Statement dated 25 May 2010 prepared by NBRS+Partners, Arboricultural Impact Assessment Report undated prepared by Mark Hartley, and Shadow Diagrams, Photomontages and Drawings dated 20 August 2008 prepared by Woods Bagot.

It is noted that the subject property is not listed on the State Heritage Register. However, it is located adjacent to the State Heritage Listed item, 'Perth House and Stables', at 85 George Street, Parramatta. The Project Application involves the demolition of existing buildings and construction of a high rise commercial building comprising 12 levels of office floor space, ground level retail/restaurant space and 4 basement car parking levels.

With regards to archaeology, the Heritage Branch notes that the land is not identified within the Parramatta Historical Archaeological and Landscape Management Study (PHALMS) as having high or moderate archaeological potential.

It should be noted that as the development proposal has been submitted as a Part 3A application, a section 140 application is not required to be submitted to the Heritage Branch, as stated in the Statement of Heritage Impact.

The Heritage Branch was requested for the provision of details of key issues and assessment requirements for the subject Project Application in August 2009 by the Urban Assessments Unit, Department of Planning. The application was considered to have a major adverse impact on the setting and views of 'Perth House and Stables' and was presented to the Heritage Council's Approval Committee for comments. It should be noted that at its meeting on 9 September 2009, the Approval's Committee, as delegate of the Heritage Council of NSW, had reviewed the project and provided detailed recommendations and advice to the Department of Planning to assist in their assessment of the proposal (refer attached letter).

Although the proposed building has been designed to address some of the urban design issues associated with the adjacent historically significant section of George Street, these measures are not considered adequate enough to mitigate the impacts on the setting of Perth House and its views from along George Street. The Statement of Heritage Impact states that heritage issues raised during early consultation have been integrated and mitigated in the concept design. It is however noted that the final application in terms of the building design is similar to the previous one that was referred to the Heritage Branch in 2009, and the concerns raised by the Heritage Council remain unaddressed.

The Statement of Heritage Impact refers to the Conservation Management Plan (CMP) prepared by Conybeare Morrison Partners in 2004 and the CMP prepared by Howard Tanner and Associates in 1989. It is further noted that the application does not comply with the recommendations contained in the 2004 CMP with regards to maintaining the setting of Perth House.

The construction of the new building including the four storey basement will have an impact on the Olive tree located within the curtilage of Perth House that has been identified as a significant item in the 1989 CMP. The Arboricultural Impact Assessment Report prepared by Mark Hartley recommends that along with detailed work method for the works adjacent to the tree, consideration should be given to design alternatives that would minimise impact on the tree. Heritage Branch concurs with this recommendation.

In light of above, the Heritage Branch considers that the Project Application in its current form will have a detrimental impact on the setting of Perth House and its views from along George Street. The building design requires major amendments in line with the Heritage Council's advice to mitigate these impacts.

The Parramatta City Council is therefore advised that if the application is considered for approval, the following conditions be incorporated in the final determination:

1. The building design should be amended to take into consideration:
 - a) Additional setback to the new building so that the views to Perth House from George Street are not unduly impacted;
 - b) Reduction in the height of the new building at the George Street frontage where it is adjacent to Perth House and stepping the building height upwards towards the rear so as not to unduly impact on the setting of Perth House;
 - c) Increased transparency to the front portion of the building so that the Perth House can be viewed through the building; and

- d) Further setback to the building and its basement from Perth House so that adjacent trees are not unduly impacted.
2. Where archaeological relics are unexpectedly discovered during excavation, work must cease in the affected area and the Heritage Branch must be notified on writing in accordance with Section 146 of the Heritage Act, 1977.

It is hoped that this information is of some assistance. If you have any further enquiries regarding this matter, please contact Shikha Jhaldiyal at the Heritage Branch on (02) 9873 8545.

Yours sincerely

Handwritten signature of Vincent Sicari, dated 23/06/2010.

Vincent Sicari
Manager
Heritage Branch
Department of Planning



Contact: Shikha Jhaldiyal
Telephone: (02) 9873 8545
Shikha.jhaldiyal@planning.nsw.gov.au
File: S90/02563/44
Our Ref: HRL55490
Your Ref: MP 09_0128

Michael Woodland
Director, Urban Assessments
NSW Department of Planning
GPO Box 39
SYDNEY NSW 2001

Attention: Mark Brown

Dear Mr Woodland

RE: REQUEST FOR PROVISION OF DETAILS OF KEY ISSUES AND ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS - MAJOR PROJECT 09_0128 FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A COMMERCIAL/RETAIL DEVELOPMENT, 89 GEORGE STREET, PARRAMATTA

I refer to your letter dated 21 August 2009 (received by this Branch on the 25 August 2009), requesting information regarding the NSW Heritage Branch's requirements for the preparation of the above mentioned Key Issues and Assessment Requirements. The Heritage Branch notes that your letter was accompanied by a copy of the Draft Director General's Requirements for the above project and a copy of the submission by INGHAM Planning Pty Limited on behalf of the Applicant.

The Heritage Branch had assessed the above documents and sent a response letter to the NSW Department of Planning on 7 September 2009. The proposal was also presented to the Heritage Council's Approval Committee for comments.

At its meeting on 9 September 2009, the Approvals Committee, as delegate of the Heritage Council of NSW, reviewed the project, and resolved the following:

That the Heritage Council considers that the views and setting of Perth House should be given due consideration in the development of the design of 89 George Street Parramatta. The Heritage Council is concerned that the proposal as it currently stands has a detrimental impact on the heritage significance of Perth House.

Therefore the Heritage Council:

- 1. Recommends to the Department of Planning that the following additional Director Generals Requirements be provided to the applicant:**
 - a) The impact on the setting of Perth House as a result of the bulk and height of the new building, especially adjacent to Perth House and its courtyard should be appropriately assessed.**
 - b) The impact of the new building on the views to Perth House from along George Street should be appropriately assessed.**




Working with the community to know, value and care for our heritage

- c) The impact of the new building and its basement construction on the trees on the eastern side of Perth House should be appropriately assessed.
2. Provides the following advice to the Department of Planning to assist in their assessment of the proposal:
- a) Consideration should be given to providing an additional setback to the new building so that the views to Perth House from George Street are not unduly impacted.
 - b) Consideration should be given to significantly reducing the height of the new building at the George Street frontage where it is adjacent to Perth House and stepping the building height upwards towards the rear so as not to unduly impact on the setting of Perth House.
 - c) Consideration should be given to making the front portion of the new building as transparent as possible so that Perth House can be viewed through the building.
 - d) Consideration should be given to setting the new building and its basement back further from Perth House so that the adjacent trees are not unduly impacted.
3. Requests the Department of Planning to require the applicant to consult with the Heritage Council in developing the design of the proposed building.

The Heritage Branch would be happy to review any further documentation that may address any likely heritage impacts. If you have any further enquiries regarding this matter, please contact Shikha Jhaldiyal at the Heritage Branch on (02) 9873 8545.

Yours sincerely



11/09/09

Vincent Sicari
Manager
Conservation Team
Heritage Branch
Department of Planning