

Response to Submissions and Statement of Commitments

Chatswood Chase Shopping Centre Shopping Centre Expansion and Refurbishment

Submitted to
Willoughby City Council and Minister for Planning
On Behalf of Colonial First State Property Management

September 2007 ■ 07026

Reproduction of this document or any part thereof is not permitted without prior written permission of JBA Urban Planning Consultants Pty Ltd.

JBA Urban Planning Consultants Pty Ltd operates under a Quality Management System. This report has been prepared and reviewed in accordance with that system. If the report is not signed below, it is a preliminary draft.

This report has been prepared by: Andrew Guyton

Signature Date 10/09/07

This report has been reviewed by: Julie Bindon

Signature Date 10/09/07

Contents

1.0 Introduction	1
2.0 Response to Submissions	2
3.0 Design Amendments	4
3.1 Design Implications	9
4.0 Statement of Commitments	11
5.0 Conclusion	12

Tables

1 Details of Design Amendments	5
2 Revised proposed GFA and GLA	9
3 Existing and Proposed Car Park Provision	10

Attachments

A Copy of Submissions	
B Response to Submissions JBA Urban Planning Consultants	
C Statement of Commitments JBA Urban Planning Consultants	
D Assessment of Design Changes by Technical Consultants	

1.0 Introduction

The Environmental Assessment Report for a Project Application for the Chatswood Chase Shopping Centre Expansion and Refurbishment was exhibited for 31 days from 25 June to 25 July 2007. During that time submissions were received from a number of local residents and businesses. A copy of the summary of submissions made, from Willoughby City Council is provided at **Attachment A** to this report. The response to the issues raised in the submissions are located at **Attachment B**.

Under Section 23(1)(d) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979, the Director General agreed to delegate to Willoughby City Council (WCC) the application assessment functions conferred to him by Part 3A of the EP&A Act 1979, subject to a number of conditions.

As part of the assessment of the project application WCC raised a number of detailed matters regarding the project on a range of issues. The response to these issues is included in the response to submissions at **Attachment B**.

Colonial First State Property Management, as proponent has considered the submissions made and a number of design amendments have been made to the project as originally submitted to address a number of the matters raised.

2.0 Response to Submissions

The key issues, and Colonial First State Property Management's response to these issues, are set out below. Input into the response has been provided by the project's consultant team which has remained unchanged since the submission of the Project Application and Environmental Assessment Report in June 2007.

The issues raised as part of the submissions made can be summarised as follows:

- Design amendments, including;
 - architectural form;
 - relationship to neighbours;
 - landscape design; and
 - Havilah Street pedestrian access.
- BCA matters;
- Traffic management issues and car parking; and
- Hydraulic matters.

A table detailing the submissions made and a response to those submissions is included at **Appendix B** of this report. The table considers the issues as grouped above.

The key design amendments and a response to the hydraulic issues are detailed below. BCA matters and traffic management issues are considered as part of the table detailing the submissions included at **Appendix B**.

Key Design Amendments

On the basis of the submissions made by local residents and businesses and following discussions with WCC, a number of design amendments have been made to the project as exhibited.

The key design amendments which have occurred since the submission of the Environmental Assessment Report are set below and illustrated on the amended drawings. The design amendments relate to: architectural form, relationship to neighbours and landscape design and the Havilah Street pedestrian access.

Relationship with 1-3 and 5-7 Havilah Street Properties

- The revised proposal increases the setback from the adjoining properties.
- Setback increased to 4000mm, consistent with the current setback of the car park building for levels LG to Level 1, with a greater setback of 7,350mm for Levels 2 and Level 2A.
- The extensions to various levels in construction zones C and D (located immediately adjacent to 1-3 and 5-7 Havilah Street Properties) will not be constructed any closer to the adjoining properties than the present building line of Level G.

Havilah Street Pedestrian Entry

- Proposed roof over Havilah Street entry has been deleted.
- Tall landscaped screen replaced with 2500mm high hedge screen, with a wider planting bed on the southern side of the walkway adjacent to the boundary.

Havilah Street Elevation

- Within Construction Zone A (area located on the corner of Havilah Street and Malvern Avenue) Level 2A car park level has been deleted.

Malvern Avenue Elevation

- Extent of Basement Levels B1 and B2, adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue has been pulled back from the boundary by approximately 9000mm.
- Within Construction Zone A, on the western boundary of the site adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue (by the current Malvern Avenue car park and service land vehicle entry) setback increased to 2400mm.
- Within Construction Zone A (area located on the corner of Havilah Street and Malvern Avenue) Level 2A car park level has been deleted.
- Within Construction Zone A, on the western boundary of the site adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue (by the current Malvern Avenue car park and service land vehicle entry) louvre element, provided along part of the Malvern Avenue façade returns down west face of the building for approximately 6000mm.

Hydraulic matters

As part of the assessment of the proposed development, the assessment authority identified that the site lies within a major stormwater system, being part of the Scotts Creek system. Existing stormwater pipes associated with the Scotts Creek system traverse the site.

Recent studies have indicated there are likely to be issues of overland flow and the capacity of the stormwater system during a 1 in 100 year event.

To assess the extent of flooding in a stormwater event along Chatswood Chase's Victoria Avenue frontage, a flood study, referred to as the Chatswood Chase Flood Study has been commissioned by Colonial First State Property Management.

The methodology for the preparation of the flood study has been prepared by Arups and is included in **Appendix D**.

Should the outcome of the flood study require design amendments, these will be carried out to the satisfaction of Council.

3.0 Design Amendments

As part of design alterations following consideration of the submissions made, developing the design further and through appointing a builder to the project, a number of modifications to the design as submitted in the Environmental Assessment Report in June 2007 have been made.

A summary of all design amendments, the reason for the amendment and details of the benefits of the change are provided in **Table 1** below.

Table 1 – Details of Design Amendments

Key Design Change	Reason/Benefit	Drawing Number	Detailed Reference Table (Appendix B) Reference No.
Victoria Avenue Elevation			
Over the main pedestrian entry, environmental graphic element removed and blade elements reduced in height.	WCCs desire to marginally reduce extent of graphic panels. The size of the new blade element neatly frames the entry.	ATP500, ATP501, ATP603	2, 3
Projection of sweeping canopy reduced.	The canopy now complies with regulations providing a minimum clearance of 600mm to the Victoria Avenue kerb line.	ATP500, ATP501, ATP603	2, 3
Signage/panel element for major tenants signs extended to the splayed wall (located just west of the vehicle entry into the shopping centre, off Victoria Avenue). The face material of the panel element to be CFC in lieu of glass.	Extended at WCCs suggestion to provide visibility of the sign from south, along Neridah Street and east along Victoria Avenue. Glazing not required as the signs/logos will be face fixed to back panels, with panels to have paint or graphic as finish.	ATP400, ATP605, ATP606	4
Environmental graphic panel located over the vehicle entry off Victoria Avenue to be faced with CFC in lieu of glass.	The design of the graphic panel will be reviewed at a later stage as agreed by WCC. Environmental graphics will cover the entire panel. Access for maintenance /updating of graphics will be from the front. Glazing is therefore inappropriate as it would hinder the graphic from being altered. This modifications is not considered to have a detrimental effect on the overall design of Victoria Avenue frontage.	ATP604, ATP606	5
Relationship with 1-3 and 5-7 Havilah Street Properties			
The revised proposal increases the setback from the adjoining properties. Setback increased to 4000mm, consistent with the current setback of the car park. Existing tree screen located within the setback between the shopping centre and 1-3 and 5-7 Havilah Street will be retained.	Improve the amenity, outlook and natural light from the proposed development submitted as part of the EAR in June 2007.	ATP202, ATP203, ATP204, ATP206, ATP208, ATP501, ATP502	9, 10

Key Design Change	Reason/Benefit	Drawing Number	Detailed Reference Table (Appendix B) Reference No.
The extensions to various levels in construction zones C and D (located immediately adjacent to 1-3 and 5-7 Havilah Street Properties) will not be constructed any closer to the adjoining properties than the present building line of Level G.	Reduced impact on neighbouring properties.	ATP202, ATP203, ATP204, ATP206, ATP208, ATP501, ATP502	9, 10
Havilah Street Pedestrian Entry			
Proposed roof over Havilah Street entry has been deleted. Tall landscaped screen replaced with 2500mm high hedge screen. Havilah Street Pedestrian Entry will be gated at Havilah Street outside of centre hours.	Improve the amenity, outlook and natural light from the proposed development submitted as part of the EAR in June 2007. New building structure now approximately 4500mm from the joint boundary.	ATP401, ATP502	20, 21
Acoustic screen to existing car park structure deleted.	Revised acoustic report*, prepared by Norman Disney & Young states that the acoustic screen is not required to mitigate against the impact of noise in this location. *The Revised acoustic report has been submitted under separate cover.	ATP607, ATP608, ATP609	10, 12, 20
Graphic elements to wall adjacent to the Havilah Street entry walkway have been added.	Add articulation and visual interest to the wall/walkway.	-	20
Havilah Street Elevation			
Extent of acoustic baffles to car park structures reduced.	Revised acoustic report allows for the reduction of the extent of acoustic baffles (provided under separate cover).	ATP607, ATP608, ATP609,	10, 12, 20
Height reduced by 3000mm as part of the deletion of car park level 2A.	As a result of improved efficiency in car parking layout on other levels and reduced retail floor area.	ATP209	9, 10,
Acoustic baffle to existing car park deleted and replaced with open mesh screen.	Revised acoustic report allows for the deletion of the acoustic baffle without a detrimental impact on the amenity of the area (provided under separate cover).	ATP401, ATP608, ATP609, ATP610, ATP801	10, 12, 20
Minor revisions to layout and extent of various materials.	As a result of ongoing design development and refinement.	ATP401, ATP801	-

Key Design Change	Reason/Benefit	Drawing Number	Detailed Reference Table (Appendix B) Reference No.
Havilah Street Elevation			
Within Construction Zone A (area located on the corner of Havilah Street and Malvern Avenue) Level 2A car park level has been deleted and height of building reduced by 3000mm.	As a result of improved efficiency in car parking layout on other levels and reduced retail floor area.	ATP209	9, 10
Malvern Avenue Elevation			
Within Construction Zone A, on the western boundary of the site adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue (by the current Malvern Avenue car park and service land vehicle entry) setback increased to 2400mm.	Improve the amenity, outlook and natural light on neighbouring properties.	ATP204, ATP205, ATP206, ATP207, ATP208	7, 10
Within Construction Zone A (area located on the corner of Havilah Street and Malvern Avenue) Level 2A car park level has been deleted. Height of building reduced by 3000mm.	Improve the amenity, outlook and natural light to adjoining Malvern Avenue property, and reduce visual impact.	ATP209	7
Within Construction Zone A, on the western boundary of the site adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue (by the current Malvern Avenue car park and service land vehicle entry) louvre element, provided along part of the Malvern Avenue façade returns down west face of the building for approximately 6000mm.	Improved visual aspect of the building from Archer Street approach down to Malvern Avenue. Addresses the corner of the proposed building in a better manner and articulates the corner of the western elevation.	ATP613	7
Minor revisions to layout and extent of various materials.	As a result of ongoing design development and refinement.	ATP402, ATP801	-
Provision of a cycle route through the vegetation island on Malvern Avenue.	Improvement to cycle access	Not illustrated on plans	-

Key Design Change	Reason/Benefit	Drawing Number	Detailed Reference Table (Appendix B) Reference No.
Changes to car park layouts			
Extent of Basement Levels B1 and B2, adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue has been pulled back from the boundary by approximately 9000mm	Less construction work impact immediately adjacent to 12-14 Malvern Avenue. Car park amendments are generally as a result of design refinement, more efficient layout and requirement for reduced car parking numbers.	ATP200, ATP201	24, 25, 26, 27
Modifications to the car park ramp system from Level G – Level 2.	Increased efficiency in car park layout. Vehicle ramps have been moved inboard from the edge of the building. Reduces the acoustic impact external to the site.	ATP202, ATP204, ATP205, ATP206, ATP207, ATP208	24, 25, 26, 27
Car park Level 2A extension towards Malvern Avenue has been deleted.	Design amendment made in response to the reduced level of car parking. The extent of building bulk also reduce, for less visual impact.	ATP209	24, 25, 26, 27
Minor layout amendments.	Undertaken in response to comments made by WCC as part of the assessment of the Traffic and Transport Assessment.	ATP 200, ATP201, ATP204, ATP205, ATP206, ATP207, ATP208, ATP209, ATP210	24, 25, 26, 27

3.1 Design Implications

As a result of the alterations to the design of the proposed development (particularly the increased setbacks to the adjoining Havilah Street Setback), the Gross Floor Area, Gross Lettable Area and the number of car park spaces has been reduced.

Proposed GFA and GLA

As a result of the proposed alterations, the following have decreased:

- Gross Floor Area has decreased by 600m².
- Gross Lettable Area by 600m².

Table 2 identifies the revised proposed GFA and GLA.

Table 2 - Revised proposed GFA and GLA

Level	Existing GFA	Now Proposed GFA	Existing GLA		Now Proposed GLA	
			Supermkt/ Dept store	General retail	Supermkt/ Dept store	General retail
Lower Ground	15,605	23,330	10,634	2,363	11,560	7,691
Lower Ground A	367	532	-	-	-	371
Ground	16,429	18,407	6,807	5,753	6,807	7,095
Level 1	16,215	20,052	6,868	4,879	6,868	7,996
Level 2	15,512	15,555	7,235	4,691	7,235	4,691
Misc ¹	-	-	-	2,086	-	2,086
Subtotal	-	-	31,544	19,772	32,470	29,930
Total	64,128	77,876	51,316		62,400	

As part of considering the economic impact of the proposed development, Urbis JHD have considered the amended scheme and have concluded that the impacts assessed as part of the EAR remain valid (Refer to **Appendix D**).

The number of jobs generated by the proposed works has been revised in light of the revised floor area. The project, as detailed in this report will generate the following:

- Estimated 440 ongoing net additional jobs within Chatswood Chase, once allowances are made for some transfer of employment between business.
- Around 460 job years are expected from the construction phase.
- A total of 900 jobs can therefore be directly attributed to the expansion of Chatswood Chase Shopping Centre.
- In considering the multiplier effects are expected to generate around 760 jobs, in addition to around 1,190 extra job years as a result of the construction phase.

¹ Retail storage, ATMs and Centre Managers office

Car Parking

The number of car parking spaces on each of the 9 car parking levels has been amended. The amended car parking is a result of:

- alterations to setbacks;
- revised internal circulation;
- reduced requirement for car parking spaces based on the number of car parking spaces per gross lettable area; and
- minor layout amendments.

Table 3 identifies the revised car parking provision by level.

Table 3 – Existing and Proposed Car Park Provision

Level	Car Park Spaces		Difference between Existing and Now Proposed
	Existing	Now Proposed	
Basement 2	419	494	+ 75
Basement 1	499	603	+ 104
Lower Ground	111	0	-111
Lower Ground A	147	0	-147
Ground	160	157	-3
Ground A	152	152	0
Level 1	155	219	+ 64
Level 1A	162	219	+ 57
Level 2	144	226	+ 82
Level 2A	70	94	+ 24
Level 3 (Roof)	290	292	+ 2
Total	2309	2,456	+ 147

As part of considering the traffic and transport impact of the proposed development, Masson Wilson Twiney have considered the amended scheme and have concluded that the impacts assessed as part of the EAR remain valid (Refer to **Appendix D**).

4.0 Statement of Commitments

Section 8.0 of the EAR prepared by JBA Urban Planning Consultants dated June 2007 included Draft Statement of Commitments.

Since the exhibition of the Draft Statement of Commitments, a number of alterations to the Statement of Commitments have been made. These alterations can be summarised as follows:

- Updated architectural drawings reflecting design amendments detailed in Section 3.0 of this report.
- Clarification that the 4 Green Star pilot rating tool for Shopping Centres, as prepared by the Green Building Council of Australia will be applied to the refurbished and new aspects of the proposed development.
- Commitment that, should the outcomes of the flood study require design amendments, that these design amendments will be done to the satisfaction of council.
- Public art will be provided to the property in a location, design and capital cost to be agreed with Willoughby City Council.
- Should the acoustic detailed analysis prove that acoustic treatment is required to the covered loading dock than appropriate resiliently faced, acoustically absorbent material will be provided.
- Commitment to undertake a dilapidation report for properties immediately adjoining areas of proposed construction works.

A complete copy of the Statement of Commitments is provided at **Appendix C** to this report.

5.0 Conclusion

The revised plans and revised Statement of Commitments in this report, together with the comprehensive Environmental Assessment Report which accompanied the Major Project Application represents the Preferred Project for expansion and refurbishment of Chatswood Chase Shopping Centre.

The proposed expansion and refurbishment of Chatswood Chase has environmental planning merit in the following respects:

- the site is suitable for the proposed development;
- the scale, height and setback of the building envelope extension is reasonable as it is generally consistent with that of the existing shopping centre development and will have no significant adverse impacts;
- the building form and amenity of the extended shopping centre will be an improvement to the existing open multi-storey car park frontages;
- the building façade design is highly modulated and articulated consistent with buildings in surrounding streets, and will significantly improve the visual interest, aesthetics, amenity and legibility of the building and streetscape;
- new landscaping will maintain and improve the amenity of the streetscape;
- pedestrian access is improved and the access requirements of people with disabilities are met in accordance with the intent of relevant standards;
- wind conditions in surrounding streets meets relevant comfort criteria;
- traffic generation can be accommodated on the local road network with no change to the intersection service levels, car park access and circulation arrangements are improved, numbers of vehicle parking spaces are now increased (from 1 space per 24.6m² per lettable floor space in exhibited proposal to 1 space per 25.4m²). In comparison with Willoughby City Council's DCP requirement of (1 space per 25m² of lettable floor space), and more than the existing rate on site of 1 space per 22.2m². The layout of car parking and loading dock access meets relevant Australian Standards;
- potential patronage and viability of public transport is increased;
- the ESD performance of Chatswood Chase will improve by achieving 4 Green Stars under the Pilot Rating Tool for Shopping Centres recently released by the Green Building Council of Australia for the refurbished and new parts of the Shopping Centre;
- stormwater management measures will improve the quality of water discharge from the extended shopping centre. The level of discharge off site will decrease as 50% of stormwater will be retained through rainwater harvesting;
- provision is made for public services, infrastructure and utilities;
- it has positive social impacts in providing more opportunities for shopping choice, better access, improved public realm, community focus and enhanced amenity;
- it has positive economic impacts for the Chatswood town centre, and the impacts on other shopping centres is within the realm of a normal competitive environment;
- it includes a construction staging strategy and a construction management strategy to manage the impacts associated with demolition, excavation and construction activities;
- it will comply with the Building Code of Australia deemed to comply provisions, and in some instances through performance based measures;

- it will comply with relevant environmental noise and vibration criteria/ standards; and
- the project includes a Statement of Commitments.

Given the planning merits above, the proposed development is justified and warrants the endorsement by Willoughby City Council and the approval of the Minister for Planning.