

4 November 2020

John Doubleday
Department of Planning, Industry and Environment
Locked Bay 5022
Parramatta NSW 2124

ADDENDUM HERITAGE REPORT

1 ROSEMEAD ROAD, HORNSBY

1. Background

Heritage 21 has been engaged by Blue Gum Community School to provide ongoing advice to the design team around potential heritage constraints for the proposed development of the property situated at 1 Rosemead Road, Hornsby ('the site') regarding State Significant Development application number SSD-10444.

This letter has been produced to address a request for a response to submissions by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment issued on 17 July 2020. The submissions received included a letter issued by the Hornsby Shire Council on 9 July 2020 regarding the proposed development. Further modifications have been made to the proposal in response to the concerns raised in the submissions, and a supplementary assessment of heritage impact is included in Section 3.0 below.

The report and additional information below is based upon updated plans provided by Armada on 3 November 2020, dated 3 November 2020, developed in conjunction with Heritage 21.

2. Changes Made

The following changes were made to the proposal, to further minimise the impact upon the existing heritage item and setting:

- Installation of new roof shingles, to be detailed by a heritage architect;
- Introduction of a timber picket fence along the Rosemead Road and William Street boundaries, including the introduction of a pedestrian gate from William Street;
- Alterations to the design of the proposed fire egress door and associated fire stair;
- Detailing of the removal of the wall in School Room 4, to now include the retention of nibs and spandrels; and
- The installation of a glass safety balustrade along the internal timber stair on the first-floor landing.

Additional information has also been provided regarding:

- The use of decomposed granite with brick edging within the existing driveway and carpark surface;
- The proposed detailing of the front door;
- The proposed treatment of the window situated within the proposed administration/DDA WC space;
- The proposed treatment of the external first-floor balcony balustrade;
- The accessible path and ramp;
- The interpretation of the former outdoor tennis court; and
- The removal of additional soft landscaping.

3. Additional Information

New Roof

Based upon the existing condition of the roof and increasing issues with water leaks, it would be recommended that new roof shingles be installed. This would minimise future issues with water leaks. The proposed works should be guided by the detailing of a heritage architect and undertaken by a suitably qualified roof tiler with experience with heritage roofs. Heritage 21 would recommend the use of Canadian slate, which would maintain the presentation of the existing roof and form of the dwelling. It is imperative that the necessary works are undertaken to prevent further damage to the existing building, significant fabric and to ensure the continued use of the subject building.

New Permeable Carpark

Alterations to the proposed layout of the carpark have been made, in order to further minimise the visual impact within the site and to ensure that the carpark does not detract from the significance of the subject site. The proposed use of decomposed granite with brick edging would not, in Heritage 21's opinion, detract from the significance of the site, particularly as the detailing of the brick edging would be based upon the existing.

Tennis Court

Heritage 21 would encourage the interpretation of the former tennis court to be incorporated into an extensive interpretation strategy which conveys the history of the site with all users. This would likely include an interpretative walk along the pedestrian pathway that leads from the carpark to the new school entry and incorporates stories from Mt Errington's history and conveys its significance. The interpretation strategy would need to be provided by the appointed heritage consultant and would take into consideration the future users of the site, including the students, family and other community members.

Realignment of Existing Driveway Kerb

No further changes have been made to the proposed realignment of the existing driveway kerb. Although the proposed realignment would require the removal of the Cabbage Tree Palm (T111) and Giant White Bird of Paradise (T112), alternative options were explored, and this would generate the least detrimental impact upon the heritage significance of the subject site. Based upon an assessment undertaken by Earthscape Horticultural Services, it has been assessed that the removal of the palm and bird of paradise is necessary and there are no feasible options for the retention of the plantings. It is Heritage 21's assessment that the proposal includes the retention of substantial plantings and that the removal of these particular plants would not generate a detrimental impact upon the existing setting particularly as it would open up views to the primary façade of the building from the public domain.

Further, the proposed reinstating of brick edging along the driveway would respect the existing form and detailing of the driveway, with alterations to allow for the usability for the site and to accommodate the relevant accessibility requirements.

Proposed Fences & Gates

The retention of the original gates has not been deemed possible due to the existing condition of the fabric, including rotting timber and water damage. The proposal includes the installation of gates based upon the design, scale and form of the original gates. In Heritage 21's opinion this would respect the significance of the original gates and maintains the presentation to the public domain while also complying with relevant access controls.

The proposal also includes the installation of a timber picket fence along Rosemead Road and William Street which would improve the views to the site from within the public domain. The William Street boundary fence would also include a pedestrian gate which would improve the accessibility to the site.

The use of metal fences within the site would not, in Heritage 21's opinion, detract from the significance of the site and would facilitate the required uses of the site. The proposed metal fencing is clearly contemporary, would not require the removal of significant fabric and would not detract from views to the heritage item, nor the existing setting.

The changes to the proposal, including the use of timber picket fences to the public domain, would improve views to the site and would respect the significance of the original gates.

New Accessible Ramp & Path

The proposed detailing of the BCA compliant path and ramp would incorporate metal which would clearly articulate the contemporary nature of the addition, would not attempt to mimic the timber detailing of the existing item and would not detract from the significance of the

Addendum Heritage Report ▪ Mt Errington – 1 Rosemead Road, Hornsby

site nor setting. Based on Article 22.2 of the Burra Charter, it is important to clearly articulate the difference between the old and new with minimal impact upon the cultural significance of the place. In Heritage 21's opinion, the proposed metal handrail and associated structure is clearly contemporary but would not visually dominate the existing setting.

Balustrade

No further changes are proposed to the detailing of the proposed new balustrade to be installed within the first-floor balcony. Although alternative options have been explored, the proposed installation of a new timber balustrade, based on the detailing of the existing that achieves NCC compliance, has been deemed the most appropriate for the setting and respects the heritage significance of the subject building. The proposed balustrade would maintain the existing form and proportions of the existing, and would generate a minimal impact upon the views to the existing heritage item.

Alternative options included the introduction of a secondary balustrade. However, this would, in Heritage 21's opinion, generate a negative heritage impact upon views to the item and significantly curtail the useability of the space. The potential use of a glass screen would also impact upon views, as a reflective material and as glass is not synonymous with architecture and materials of the period. Due to the balustrade being situated within the primary elevation of the building and a key element within the primary views to the site, the introduction of glass would be seen as an intrusive element and would negatively impact upon the existing setting and views. Rather, the proposed balustrade would encapsulate the spirit of the original, but would be appropriately modified to ensure NCC compliance.

Landscaping

The proposed treatment of the soft landscaping is, in Heritage 21's opinion, sympathetic to the existing setting and the needs for the future use of the site. Although the proposed works would require the removal of plantings and trees within the site, different design options have been reviewed, as discussed above, and the current proposal would be the most appropriate treatment of the site. Notably, the proposal would maintain the existing garden setting which respects the significance of the subject site.

Fire Egress Stair

The proposed addition of the external stair, which would be constructed in steel, would assist with NCC compliance, and would in Heritage 21's opinion, be deemed a reversible measure. The proposed metal would serve as a clearly contemporary addition and would not, in Heritage 21's opinion, detract from the significance of the site nor the setting.

Fire Egress Door

The proposed change to the layout and form of the fire egress door would, in Heritage 21's opinion, be more appropriate than the previously proposed door which required the introduction of a new opening. Rather, the proposed fire door would include the extension of an existing opening, which would ensure that it would not require the introduction of an additional opening and would minimise the overall impact upon significant fabric.

Due to concerns regarding a loss of light for the conversion of the window to the fire egress door, Heritage 21 recommended the installation of a skytube which would maximise the light to the room without generating a detrimental impact upon significant fabric and the roof form.

New Entry/Reception Door

Heritage 21 would encourage that the proposed design of the timber entrance/reception door is based upon the design, style and form of the existing entrance door with lead light glazing and side lights. As a new addition, the timber door should incorporate elements of the original front door, without replicating the original, including the use of timber and glazing.

The proposed door would need to be detailed by the appointed heritage architect in order to minimise the visual impact and to ensure that it appropriately works within the setting.

Detailing of Window between Administration/DDA WC

The proposed treatment of the window between the administration office and the DDA WWC is based upon advice provided by Heritage 21 and would allow for the retention of the opening in situ. The glazing would be frosted on one side, with Fyrecheck to be installed within the WWC side, to ensure the installation of required services without penetrating or causing damage to significant fabric associated with the window. Heritage 21 would recommend that the appointed heritage architect be involved in confirming the detailing regarding the opening, to minimise the impact upon significant fabric.

Internal Balustrade

The proposal includes the introduction of an additional glass panel along the internal balustrade on the first-floor landing. This has been introduced as an additional safety measure and would not, in Heritage 21's opinion, generate a negative heritage impact particularly as it would allow for the retention of the existing balustrade and would not obstruct significant views within the building. The proposed glazing would only be installed to the first-floor landing, which further minimises the overall impact.

Addendum Heritage Report ▪ Mt Errington – 1 Rosemead Road, Hornsby

The proposed glazing would need to be detailed by the appointed heritage architect in order to minimise the visual impact and to ensure that it would not generate a detrimental impact upon significant fabric.

Removal of Internal Wall – School Room 4

The detailing regarding the demolition of internal wall of school room 4 now includes the retention of nibs and spandrels, in order to articulate the location of the original wall. The detailing would clearly articulate the difference between the old and new, and highlight the former layout of the building while allowing for the required access path and ensuring the continued use of the subject building.

4. Conclusion

As discussed above, Heritage 21 is of the view that the proposal would not engender a negative impact on the heritage significance of the subject site, the Mount Errington HCA and heritage items in the vicinity. The proposal ensures the continued use of the subject site, encourages public accessibility and Heritage 21 has been involved throughout the design process in order to minimise the impact of the changes on significant fabric.

We look forward to hearing from you.

Yours sincerely,



**Paul Rappoport – Heritage Architect
Director**

B. Arch., AIA, MURP, M. ICOMOS, IHBC
Registered Architect No. 5741 - NSW Architects Registration Board
Master of Urban & Regional Planning (Hons) - MURP
Member of Society of Architectural Historians - SAHANZ
Member of Australia ICOMOS – M. Australia ICOMOS
Member of The Institute of Historic Building & Conservation - IHBC
Member of International Planning History Society – IPHS
Member of The Twentieth Century Heritage Society of NSW Inc.



**Lauren Schutz
Heritage Consultant & Team Leader**

B.A. (Hon.) – Monash University
Master of Museum & Heritage Studies – The University of Sydney
Member of Australia ICOMOS
Member of DOCOMOMO Australia